Repairs and Restorations as Evidence for the International Manuscript Trade

Dagmar A. Riedel (Columbia University)

Berlin, 30 June 2022

This presentation is © and licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/legalcode

For a description of the terms of use, see the Creative Commons Deed https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
MSS in Arabic script available as digital surrogate

Dioscorides Pedanius of Anazarbus (d. ca. 90 CE), De materia medica
• Marsili Dioscorides = MS arab. colophon dated 27 Dhū’l-Hijja 642 / 26 May 1245, no place
Italy, Bologna, Biblioteca Universitaria, ms. 2954, https://amshistorica.unibo.it/1672
Images and contents are licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
• Osler Dioscorides = MS arab. colophon dated 27 Dhū’l-Ḥijja 642 / 26 May 1245, no place ("al-Madrasa al-Nizāmiyya")
The photos are © to the Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford
Images and contents are licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/
• Warner Dioscorides = MS arab. mid-Ramaḍān 475 / early February 1083, Samarqand (Uzbekistan)
The Netherlands, Leiden, Library of the University, Or. 289, http://hdl.handle.net/1887.1/item:1578266
Use of this resource is governed by the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons CC BY License
• Qajar Dioscorides copy = MS arab., colophon dated 1307 / began 28 August 1889, no place (Qajar Iran: Tehran or Mashhad?)
UUID: 012d7130-c96b-0135-ff03-33dcbd5be574
Public domain under the laws of the United States

Ismā’il Jurjānī (d. 531 / began 29 September 1136), Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī = MS pers. no date, no place
USA, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Library, LJS 189, https://openn.library.upenn.edu/Data/0001/html/ljs189.html
Images and contents are free of known copyright restrictions and in the public domain: http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/mark/1.0/

Ibn Abī Zayd al-Qayrawānī (fl. 10th century CE), al-Risāla = MS aljamiado, no date (1590s because of watermark), no place (northern Spain, southern France)
USA, New York City, Columbia University, RBML MS Or. 551, https://openn.library.upenn.edu/Data/0032/html/ms_or_515.html
Images and contents are free of known copyright restrictions and in the public domain: http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/mark/1.0/

[ anthology of philosophical sayings ] = MS arab., no date (late 13th century? with additions from 1899) no place (Baghdad?).
Images and contents are © to The Aga Khan Museum and licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.5 Canada https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/2.5/ca/
Firdawsī (d. between 1019 and 1025 CE?), Shāhnāma = MS pers. no date (between 1420–1440?), no place (Timurid)
For copyright and license details, see previous slide.

Zakariyyāʾ Qazwīnī (d. 682 / begun 1 April 1283), ‘Ajāʾīb al-makhluqāt = MS arab. no date (between 11414–1435?), no place (Shiraz?)
USA, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Acc. No. 34.109, https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/449012
Public domain under the laws of the United States.

Kitāb al-diryāq = MS arab. dated 594 / began 13 November 1197, no place (Baghdad?)
France, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS arab. 2964, https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b110018885
Public domain under the laws of France.

Archives

The Venetian Bailate, ca. 1660.
From: E. Natalie Rothman, The Dragoman Renaissance, Cornell University Press, 2021, figure 1.1
Available at Rothman’s Dragoman Renaissance Research Platform:
http://dragomans.digital.utsc.utoronto.ca/islandora/object/dragomans%3ATableofFigures

MSS in Arabic script not available as digital surrogate

[ medical miscellany ] = MS arab. no date (12th century CE?), no place
Photos by D.A. Riedel, June 2022, used with permission.

[ mathnavi about the rose and the nightingale ] = MS pers. dated 860/began 11 December 1456, Edirne (Ottoman empire)
Photos by D.A. Riedel, June 2022, used with permission.

Anwārī (fl. 12th century), [ divan ] = MS pers. dated 709 / began 11 June 1309, no place (Ilkhanid?)
Turkey, Istanbul, Suleymaniye Library, MS pers. Fatih MS 3784
from: Gülru Necipoğlu, et al. (eds.), Treasures of Knowledge, Brill, 2019, vol. 1, p. 214 figure 14
Fair use.
Themes of Day 1

• buying texts v “hunting manuscripts”

• manuscript book v printed book: cf. the accepted bibliographic practice in Middle Eastern studies reference works such GAL, GAS, Storey etc.

• Türkenbeute: according to the legal framework of warfare in early modern Europe besieged cities that refuse to surrender forfeit all rights to life and property if the besieging army is successful

• Western v Oriental manuscripts: not every collector acquires books and orders their possessions on the basis of their script

• cultural heritage & cultural appropriation: cf. ethical ownership
Reasons for buying books in whatever format (handwritten, printed, digital)

- written resources for learning, teaching, and research, e.g., colleges, universities, divinity schools
- encyclopedic surveys of human civilization in memory institutions, e.g., museums and public libraries

  “I come from a modern country, where we have everything that money can buy; <...> if there were such a thing as a ghost in Europe, we’d have it at home in a very short time in one of our public museums” – Oscar Wilde, “The Canterville Ghost” (1887)

- religious observance
- leisure reading
- bibliophilia
- conspicuous consumption

  “your real collector values a thing for its rarity. I don’t suppose the buyers of Americana sit up reading them all night” – Edith Wharton, The House of Mirth (1905)

- travel memorabilia
MANUSCRIPT HUNTING

By Ernest Cushing Richardson,
Librarian of Princeton University

MANUSCRIPT hunting is a variety of book-hunting, but it stands to the hunting of printed books much as chamois hunting does to squirrel hunting, for, while printed books may sometimes be scarce and elusive, manuscripts are always so. Many copies of rare printed books are unique from condition, size, binding, association or, as in the case of many incunabula, some slight variation of text, but all copies of all manuscripts are unique as to text and nearly all as to handwriting and vellum.

Looked on as a sport manuscript hunting is thus prince among book sports. But, while it is indeed a sport, it is more than a sport; it is on the one hand a useful art to be compared with fur hunting or hunting for food, and on the other hand it bears the same relation to science that the hunting for rare orchids or rare birds and beasts does to natural science.

From: Bibliographical Society of America, Proceedings and Papers, 3 (1908), p. 14
Heuristic challenge: appreciating “old” books is an acquired taste

From: Evelyn Waugh, *Brideshead Revisited* (1945), book 2, chapter 8

Context: since Lord Marchmain has a cashflow problem, Marchmain House in London is sold and will be demolished in order to build a modern apartment block.

“Would you like to paint this house?” he asked suddenly. “A picture of the front, another of the back on the park, another of the staircase, another of the big drawing-room? Four small oils; that is what my father wants done for a record, to keep at Brideshead. I don’t know any painters. Julia said you specialized in architecture.”

“Yes,” I said. “I should like to very much.”

“You know it’s being pulled down? My father’s selling it. They are going to put up a block of flats here. They’re keeping the name—we can’t stop them apparently.”

“What a very sad thing.”

“Well, I’m sorry of course. But you think it good architecturally?”

“One of the most beautiful houses I know.”

“Can’t see it. I’ve always thought it rather ugly. Perhaps your pictures will make me see it differently.”

reproduction of cards, probably written by Ida A. Pratt before 1936
Ibn Abī Zayd al-Qayrawānī (fl. 10th century), *al-Risāla* = one of two known Spanish translations written in Arabic script (*Aljamiado*)

Columbia, RBML MS Or. 551
no place (1590s based on watermark)
no date (northern Spain, southern France)
Working hypothesis

In the seventh century CE the formation of Muslim-ruled societies is accompanied by the emergence of a diverse commercial book trade. International commerce in Muslim-ruled societies has always included the selling of books in Arabic script to foreigners. In other words, foreigners constitute a distinct group of customers in a diverse market that comprised a wide range of books.
Participants in the book trade

Makers of the commodity
• Informal books: self-made for personal, private consumption
• Formal books: made for the commercial book trade or to order for patrons

Dealers
• Primary market: personal union between maker and seller
• Secondary market: dealer is intermediary between maker and buyer

Advisors

Private and institutional buyers
Complicating the story
Step 1: What is a book?

commercial commodity

v

cultural heritage
“heritage is not only a hegemonic idiom articulating hegemonic and counterhegemonic projects, but also an idiom of hegemony, framing conflicts in terms that, by concealing their connection with broader issues of political economy are advantageous to dominant groups”

“cultural heritage, like art, is produced and legitimized as a separate sphere of knowledge, value and circulation standing in opposition to the market, exchange value, and the sphere of commodity circulation”

“paradoxically, the economic content and dynamics of heritage are premised upon objectification, the abstraction of the heritage object from its relationships, including economic ones”

The Smithsonian’s Planned Return of the Benin Bronzes Comes After Years of Relationship Building

The ground-breaking move heralds a new path for interactions between African and Western institutions
Complicating the story
Step 2: Creating value

provenance
v
association copy
Selling art is a business and requires marketing:
- “association copies” that highlight provenance
- good value, that is, artefacts are available at “accessible price points”
Details usually omitted from published cataloguing records:

- name of dealers
- modes of acquisition
- acquisition costs
- repairs before and after acquisition
Two repaired manuscripts
Dioscorides (1st cent. CE), De materia medica, in 5 books = Arabic version, but the translator is not named in colophons; title page & introduction are missing fols. 140b–141a = author portrait: Dioscorides flanked by Luqmān and Galen

MS arab. Bologna, Biblioteca Universitaria, ms. 2954

no place (Ayyubid Mesopotamia suggested by A. Contadini) final colophon dated 27 Dhū’ Ḥijja 642 / 26 May 1245 paper; cropped, h = 33 cm; later added binding

Ismāʿīl Jurjānī (d. 1136), Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī = the most comprehensive Persian summary of Galenic medicine fols. 214b–215a = student-master scene on fol. 214b

MS pers. Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Library, LJS 189

no place (Western Asia, Central Asia?) final colophon undated (catalog suggests approx. 1300–1399 CE) paper; remargined, h = 40 cm; later added binding
Maqalat Diosquridis al-hakim (De Mafalda)

Description

Bologna, Biblioteca Universitaria, Ms. 2954 ff. III, 1-274, III'; 236 x 223 mm

Place of origin of the manuscript: Baghdad

Notes: The manuscript is achaepalous of two folios and incomplete inside, the original number of folios was 303; many illustrations of plants and animals in color; at f. 141 illustration with three persons: Dioscorides, Aristotle and Luqman; additions and annotations at the margins by a later hand.

Bibliography:
G. S. Assemani, Index librorum Bibliothecae marsilinae [...] Codices Arabici, pp. 51-52, n. 4 (Bologna, Biblioteca universitaria, Ms. 2951);
V. Rosen, Remarques sur les manuscrits orientaux de la Collection Marsigli à Bologne. IV. Liste des manuscrits arabes (Roma 1884), pp. 255-256;
Luigi Marsili, 1658–1730

• second son of an established patrician family in Bologna
• internationally recognized natural scientist (e.g., appointed fellow of the Royal Society in London) and officer in the Habsburg army
• 1679–1680 = spent about a year as guest of the Venetian ambassador in Constantinople -> learns Ottoman Turkish and acquires MSS (purchase?)
• 1680 = joins the Habsburg army, participates in the Habsburg defense against the second Ottoman siege of Vienna (1683)
• 1683–1684 = wounded in battle, taken prisoner by the Ottoman army, sold into slavery, and ransomed after about nine months
• rejoined the Habsburg army, and participates in the Habsburg sieges of Buda (1686) and Belgrade (1688) -> acquires MSS after the Ottomans surrender these cities
• 1703 = dishonorable discharge from the Habsburg army after the Habsburg defeat in Breisach during the Wars of the Spanish Succession
• 1712 = donates his scholarly collections to the city of Bologna
Giovanni Battista Ballarino, (household of the Venetian permanent representative to the Porte)
ca. 1660

St. Petersburg, Hermitage State Museum, Vase 1782, fol. 48a
Hagop Kevorkian, 1872–1962

• a wealthy Armenian family from Aksaray, in Central Anatolia who are Ottoman subjects
• archaeologist, collector and dealer
• Hagop Kevorkian has eight brothers and sisters, and the family maintains their own art trading network which connects New York, London, and Paris with Beirut, Alexandria, Cairo, Luxor, Tehran, Mumbai, and Beijing
• September 1896 pogroms against Armenians in Galata = Kevorkian enters into an agreement with Calouste Gulbenkian (1869–1955) to import works of art into Great Britain; this partnership is terminated in 1898
• ca. 1903, 1904 = Kevorkian begins with excavations in Iran: Sultanabad & Rayy
• 1906 = Kevorkian has already opened a shop in London
• 1920s = Kevorkian sets up a shop in New York City
• 1963–1964 / 1342 Sh. = after his death, the Hagop Kevorkian Fund, a non-for-profit charity registered in NYS, exports the Jurjānī MS from Iran
• 1977 = Sotheby fails to sell the Jurjānī MS at auction
• 1981 = Sotheby’s sells the Jurjānī MS at auction
Provenance

- Ownership stamp dated 1186? (1772-1773 CE) with inscription in ink (f. 1r); Persian customs stamp dated 1342 (f. 1r, 352v).

- Formerly owned by the Hagop Kevorkian Fund; offered for sale at auction at Sotheby's (London) in a sale of property of the Hagop Kevorkian Fund, 2 May 1977, lot 163, unsold.

- Sold at auction at Sotheby’s with other Hagop Kevorkian Fund materials, 27 April 1981, lot 108.


- Formerly owned by John D. Stanitz (Cleveland, Ohio), Ms. 20.

- Acquired by Lawrence J. Schoenberg with other Stanitz manuscripts, September 1997.

- Deposit by Lawrence J. Schoenberg and Barbara Brizdle, 2011.

- Gift of Barbara Brizdle Schoenberg, 2016.
damaged and incomplete presentation copies of popular medical textbooks

**Dioscorides, De materia medica**
MS arab.
Bologna, Biblioteca Universitaria, ms. 2954

- thrice catalogued *in Bologna since 1712*
- presented as textual fragment of an illustrated Arabic *De materia medica* version
- extensive traces of wear and tear that are not evaluated in the accessible cataloguing records
- title pages with details about patron and workshop are lost
- acephalous
- the lacuna before the beginning of *maqāla* 3 is marked
- **no scholarly “critical edition” as reference point**
- bound out of order
- traditionally, an illustrated text
- figurative painting in the middle of the codex: author portrait

**Ismā‘īl Jurjānī, Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī**
MS pers.
Philadelphia, Univ. Pennsylvania Library, LJS 189

- since *its export from Iran in the early 1960s*, catalogued by auction houses and book dealers
- presented as a complete copy of a Persian textbook of Galenic medicine
- extensive repairs summarily covered by the catalogers
- title pages with details about patron and workshop are lost
- leaves with the text’s beginning are later replacements
- there are attempts to hide and distract from lacunae (e.g., not every *guftār* has preserved its table of contents)
- **no scholarly “critical edition” as reference point**
- few traces of illuminated headpieces
- no other MSS of *Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī* with figurative paintings are recorded
- painting in the middle of the codex: a student-master conversation
What is missing from these damaged presentation copies:
Illuminated pages with information about
workshop,
patron, and
contents (title and author)
dedication

Suleymaniye, Fatih MS 3784 fols. 1b-2a

MS pers.
1309 CE
headpiece

Bod. Ouseley Add. 176 fols.13a-12b

MS pers
1420-1440 CE
Visual topoi
master student scenes

AKM 283
fol. 26a

MS arab.
no date (late 13th century?), with additions from 1899

BNF ms arabe 2964
bound out of order

MS arab.
1198
Marsili Dioscorides
= belongs to the diverse scholarly collections donated by Luigi Marsili (1658–1730) to his home town Bologna in 1712

the textual lacuna (that is, the missing end of *maqāla 2*) is clearly marked by the interleaved empty leaf
Schoenberg *Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī*
= the Hagob Kevorkian Trust exported this codex from Iran in 1942 Sh. / 1963–1964 in order to sell it at auction in the UK or USA
Lawrence J. Schoenberg (1932–2014) acquired this MS pers. for his collection of scientific manuscripts in 1997
Schoenberg and his wife Barbara Brizdle Schoenberg donated the MSS collection to Penn Libraries in 2011

the uniform remargining of both old and new leaves distracts from the obvious differences between old and new papers
Osler Dioscorides:
Purchased by William Osler (1849–1919) from Qajar owners in Shiraz in 1912, sale was arranged by the British consul J.H. Bill