

Running Head: EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE
PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL
DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Exploring Emerging Perceptions of Contemplative Pedagogy Among Faculty Participating in a
Professional Development Program

By

Kenneth A. Hirschmann

Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Master of Education in Adult Learning and Leadership
at Teachers College of Columbia University

Professor Victoria Marsick

April 2019

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Abstract

This study seeks to explore the emerging perceptions of Contemplative Pedagogy of a small number of faculty that have engaged in a workshop on the subject. Through surveys and an interview, the story of the development of their practice unfolds in order to glimpse at the reflective practices that drive their professional and personal development, and their ability to reconceive their understanding of and approach to teaching. By incorporating contemplative methods into a professional reflective practice, faculty might gain the experience and comfort with the techniques to begin applying them to their professional practice.

Keywords: contemplative pedagogy, faculty, learner centered, reflective practice

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG
FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	2
Table of Contents.....	3
Introduction.....	4
Literature Review.....	5
Effects of Mindfulness on Student Learning	6
Personal and Professional Practice of Educators	7
Faculty Development and Approaches to Teaching	8
Conclusion	9
Problem and Purpose Statement	10
Research Questions.....	10
Theoretical Framework.....	11
Methodology.....	14
Researcher Bias.....	15
Sampling	15
Data Collection Methods	16
Validity and Reliability.....	16
Data Analysis	17
Profiles	18
Michelle	18
Carol.....	20
Aaron.....	22
Lynn	25
David.....	26
Hannah	28
Dina.....	29
Discussion.....	32
Perceptions of Contemplative Pedagogy	32
Contemplative Pedagogy and Reflective Practice	34
Future Research	35
References.....	36
Appendix A.....	40
Appendix B.....	41
Appendix C.....	42

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Introduction

For centuries, humans have used contemplative practices to still the mind, connect to the present moment, and induce a sense of calm (Zajonc, 2016; Barbezat & Bush, 2013). Practices such as meditation and contemplative writing have been used for deep introspection and reflection by spiritual practitioners. In recent decades, research has shown that these practices, collectively known as mindfulness or contemplative practices, have measurable effects on attention, information processing, stress relief, and compassion (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Schwind et al, 2016; Shapiro, Brown & Astin, 2008; Sherretz, 2011), which can be beneficial in an educational environment. Such methods, as mindfulness and meditation, have been shown to positively impact student learning across disciplines (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Schwind et al, 2016; Sherretz, 2011). Though empirical studies in this area are relatively scant, they are supplemented by a wealth of anecdotal evidence (Bach & Alexander, 2015; Barbezat & Bush, 2013; Hart, 2004; Morgan, 2012).

Despite their potential, contemplative pedagogical methods have yet to be widely adopted in higher education (Schwind et al., 2016). One possibility for why this is true is that educators need to have the proper training and personal practice in order to effectively support students in a deeply emotional process that can be both powerful and dangerous, depending on the nature of the self-exploration and the support provided (Barbezat & Bush, 2013; Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013, Miller & Nozawa, 2015; Sherretz, 2011). Faculty development programs, which have been shown to be effective in shifting educator's conceptions and approaches to teaching toward student-centered pedagogical modalities, may play a role in helping educators to integrate contemplative methods in their teaching (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008; Light, Calkins, Luna &

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Drane, 2009). A major factor in the shift of conceptions of teaching is reflection, which has long been held as a vital practice for professionals, in particular for educators (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008). Therefore, reflection should play a central role in professional development programs that aim to help faculty adopt contemplative pedagogical practices in their teaching. Still, there is much to learn in regard to how faculty perceive the role of contemplative practice in student learning, as well as in developing their own reflective practice.

Literature Review

The use of mindfulness and contemplative practices in education has been well studied anecdotally, though there is still a definite need for more empirical studies (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Schwind et al, 2016; Sherretz, 2011). Schwind et al. (2016) define mindfulness at its core as an awareness of the present moment that helps to foster a sense of inner peace. This definition is widely shared across the literature (Barbezat & Bush, 2013; Hart, 2004; Zajonc, 2016). The authors note that though mindfulness has roots in Eastern spirituality, the western use of the term can be traced back to Jon Kabat-Zinn, who developed Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction toward the end of the last century (Schwind et al., 2016). Separating mindfulness practice from its spiritual origins can be fruitful in an educational environment (Haynes, Irvine & Bridges), though Foreman (2012) warns that this can leave teachers without the skills required to help students safely express their religious and spiritual beliefs. Foreman characterizes mindfulness as a capacity for awareness, allowing the conscious to fully experience each moment. When utilized as a contemplative pedagogy, this sense of awareness opens up students to their own thought processes, helps them to integrate new perspectives, and regard their experiences with a non-judgmental and centered orientation

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

(Foreman, 2012). Esborjn-Hargens, Reams and Gunnlaugson describe this kind of pedagogy as integrative education, which “comprises exploring multiple perspectives: first, second and third person methodologies of teaching and learning; combining critical thinking with experiential feeling and; exploring non-rational aspects of self” (as cited in Foreman, 2012). Surprisingly, despite the potential of contemplative pedagogical practices, Schwind et al. (2016) observe that “mindfulness practices have yet to be fully integrated within the undergraduate and graduate curricula at most higher education institutions.”

Effects of Mindfulness on Student Learning

Studies have shown that mindfulness practices in the classroom can have beneficial effects on student learning (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Miller & Nozawa, 2002; Schwind et al., 2016; Shapiro, Brown & Astin, 2008; Sherretz, 2011). Deborah Haynes has used a wide variety of mindfulness practices in her classes, with many students reporting profound and long-lasting impacts that included reductions in stress, overcoming fear and anxiety, and the development of an atmosphere of respect that “effectively brought the class together as a whole,” despite inconclusive results on a number of related inventories (Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013). In another study, students reported reduced anxiety and stress, a sense of relaxation and well-being, and an increased capacity to focus, though this was largely self-reported and there was a very small sample size (Schwind et al., 2016). Still, the authors noted that these outcomes are consistent with the literature that also includes additional effects such as reflexivity, compassion, and enhanced cognitive processing (Schwind et al., 2016). Sherretz (2011) noted that a key element is in emphasizing the process over the outcome. Sherretz noted that this opens them up to new possibilities and perspectives and increases their engagement, which combined with self-inquiry can help students “gain deeper insight into [themselves] and

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

the nature of experience” (Miller & Nozawa, 2002). More broadly, students report that mindfulness practices in the classroom lead to a more respectful class climate and the development of a close community (Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Sherretz, 2011). Though much has been studied about the positive effects of mindfulness and meditation, very little has been studied in regard to the role of faculty members in facilitating this process in the classroom.

Personal and Professional Practice of Educators

Many researchers agree that personal practice is a key need for educators who seek to integrate contemplative practices into their classrooms (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Miller & Nozawa, 2015; Schwind et al., 2016; Sherretz, 2011). Foreman (2012) points to Donald Schön’s concept of a “reflective practitioner,” and specifically the use of “reflection-in-action” as a practice of present-moment awareness of the tacit knowledge that guides and informs one’s teaching practice, connecting the “inner and outer life of the teacher.” Sherretz (2011) found that teachers who scored high on a mindfulness inventory were able to develop deep relationships with students that promoted a positive classroom environment and providing students with more choices opening them up to new perspectives. Sherretz attributes these qualities to the mindfulness practices of her study participants, though her study only included three participants, all of whom were elementary school teachers in the same school. Haynes, Irvine & Bridges (2013) noted a theme in their findings that a professor’s experience with contemplative practice or lack thereof was of critical importance, warning that trying to learn as you go “reflects a naïve understanding of both the power and dangers of engaging students with this kind of inner work.” As Haynes, Irvine & Bridges point out, contemplative practice can be both powerful and dangerous due to the complex emotions involved, and educators need to be able to meet the needs of students who engage in this process while also

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

overcoming some of the resistance students may present. Educators need to be trained to support these needs, however, there are no empirical studies looking at this in the literature.

Faculty Development and Approaches to Teaching

As a whole, contemplative methods are underused in higher education, but there is evidence that professional development programs can help faculty change their teaching conceptions, or philosophical orientation, and approaches, which are the actual pedagogical methods employed (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008; Light, Calkins, Luna & Drane, 2009). Generally speaking, these studies looked for evidence of a student-centered orientation, that is regarding the role of the teacher as “facilitating students’ personal construction of knowledge and conceptual change,” as opposed to simply the transmitting of knowledge from teacher to student (Light & Calkins, 2008). In a grounded theory approach, Gunersel & Etienne (2014) interviewed 12 faculty after participating in 5-6 weeks of professional development training with over 36 hours of contact time. Gunersel & Etienne described the shift in teaching conception that took place characterized by a movement toward student-centered conceptions of teaching, along with a concomitant movement away from teacher-centered orientation, deeper self-awareness and self-reflection as an educator, an openness to adopting new teaching methods, and an increase in energy and confidence as teachers. Though the sample size of this study was small, and there was no long-term follow-up, these results mirrored those of the phenomenological study carried out by Light & Calkins (2008). In that study, faculty participated in a program over the academic year that consisted of several workshops, dinner meetings, project groups and a 2-day intensive retreat. Light & Calkins found only positive changes in teaching conception that moved from teacher-centric orientations to increasingly student-centered conceptions. In another grounded theory study by

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Dee & Daly (2009), faculty from seven institutions participated in faculty-led seminars, a process of collaborative inquiry, and events at the participating institutions over the course of a semester. Through interviews with the participants, Dee & Daly found evidence of “pedagogical reflexivity,” which is similar to the idea of “reflection-in-action” that Foreman (2012) denoted as a central quality in the contemplative teacher. Dee & Daly (2009) noted that this reflexive mindset led several participants to adopt more student-centered approaches, and that through self-reflection in the form of autobiographies tracing their professionally-shaping experiences helped them to relate better to their students’ experiences. Similar results were found in the studies focused on teaching approaches, where a significant shift was found toward student-centered modalities (Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Light, Calkins, Luna & Drane, 2009). Though a lot of research on faculty development has focused on the shift from teacher-centered to student-centered pedagogical approaches, there is little known about how this shift operationalizes in the classroom through the employment of new student-centered pedagogical methods. Additionally, the role that contemplative methods may play in catalyzing this shift is unclear.

Conclusion

Research suggests that contemplative practices can have a significant impact on student learning, and that faculty need the proper preparation in order to integrate those practices into the classroom (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Miller & Nozawa, 2002; Schwind et al., 2016; Sherretz, 2011). There is also a significant trend in the field of education to move from teacher-centered pedagogical modalities to student-centered modalities, such as contemplative pedagogy (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008; Light, Calkins, Luna & Drane, 2009). This research suggests that faculty development can have an impact on this shift toward a student-centered orientation, but

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

contemplative methods have not been studied in this regard. Faculty development programs have also been shown to help develop reflective practice among faculty (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008), which is an essential element in mindfulness practice, but the longer-term implications of this potential have not yet been studied.

Problem and Purpose Statement

Research has shown that contemplative practices can have measurable effects on attention, information processing, stress relief, and compassion (Foreman, 2012; Haynes, Irvine & Bridges, 2013; Schwind et al, 2016; Shapiro, Brown & Astin, 2008; Sherretz, 2011). Students have reported improvements in class climate, as well as their learning. Though these practices have long been employed in higher education, providing students with uniquely new and deeper ways to learn, we still lack key information required to cultivate faculty adoption of these practices in the classroom.

The purpose of this case study is to explore the emerging perceptions of faculty on contemplative pedagogy while participating in a professional development program on the topic at a northeastern religious university.

Research Questions

Central Question: How do faculty that participate in a professional development workshop on Contemplative Pedagogy (CP) at a northeastern religious university perceive the topic?

Sub-Questions:

1. How have faculty perceptions on CP evolved after the workshop?
2. How do they describe engaging with mindfulness practices in and out of the classroom?
3. How do they describe the impact of the professional development workshop on their perceptions of CP?

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Theoretical Framework

At the heart of CP is a notion that the practitioner is the center of the practice. In an educational setting, this typically refers to the experience of the student, and therefore CP could be defined as a learner-centered (or student-focused) instructional strategy. According to Prosser, Trigwell and Taylor (1994), a student-focused approach to teaching is one where the teacher encourages self-directed learning, provides time for students to interact in dialogue with the teacher and each other, and to develop or change student conceptions rather than to simply transmit content. The authors postulated that if approaches to teaching were better aligned with student's conceptions of learning, then student learning could be improved. Later research by Trigwell, Prosser and Waterhouse (1999) suggests that student-focused approaches generate deeper learning in students. However, they note that in order to facilitate a change in teaching approach, teachers need to change their own conceptions of teaching and learning, that is to change the philosophical and epistemological assumptions that underpin their choice of instructional strategy. A number of studies have linked professional development with changes in both conceptions of and approaches to teaching (Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008; Light, Calkins, Luna & Drane, 2009; Trigwell, Prosser & Waterhouse, 1999).

One important goal of many faculty professional development programs is to reflect on one's teaching practice (Hubball, Collins & Pratt, 2005). The authors argue that reflecting on teaching leads to greater self-awareness, better understanding of student learning, and implementation of appropriate pedagogical methods, among other benefits. Smyth (1992) relies on a definition of reflection by John Dewey, that reflection is the "persistent and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in light of the grounds that support it

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

and further consequences to which it leads.” Brookfield (2017) emphasizes the critical nature of reflection which is to become aware of assumptions through a variety of lenses, by “standing outside ourselves.” I would argue that in addition, we need to stand within ourselves and adopt a subjective contemplative stance as well as an objective critical stance. Loughran (2002) emphasizes the process as a catalyst for change in his analysis of reflective practice in the teaching professions.

Reflection is effective when it leads the teacher to make meaning from the situation in ways that enhance understanding so that she or he comes to see and understand the practice setting from a variety of viewpoints. Such learning can then impact on the development of one’s attitudes for reflection (Dewey’s [1933] openmindedness, responsibility, and wholeheartedness) and, in so doing, it is possible to highlight the link between reflection and the development of a genuine wisdom-in-practice as the knowledge gained through reflection is recognizable and articulative. (p. 34)

Perhaps most interesting is the application of reflective practice as advanced by Schön (1984) who identified two types of reflection: reflection-in-action, the act of reflecting in the moment of the action, that is while engaged in that which is being reflected upon, and reflection-on-action, reflection that takes place after the fact and in a different context, for example in a professional development workshop. For Schön reflection is deeply tied to the concept of knowing-in-action, a reframing of Michael Polanyi’s tacit knowledge, that is that individuals act with a specific implicit awareness in the moment even though they may struggle to describe the process. For example, educators’ knowing-in-action is the normal routine of the teaching process that has been developed through experience, and by example. When something

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

unexpected occurs in this routine, reflection-in-action is the act, sometimes tacit and unconscious, of recognizing and evaluating the situation and making instantaneous judgments in order to react or adapt to what's happening. Finlay (2008) aptly describes reflection-on-action as a professional's conscious act to "review, describe, analyse and evaluate their past practice with a view to gaining insight to improve future practice." She elaborates that each of these types of reflection aim to "build new understandings to shape [the professional's] action in the unfolding situation."

Schön suggests that these two types of reflection are at the core of "professional artistry," a term meant to capture the nuance of a practice that cannot be achieved through rational thought alone (Schön, 1987), similar to the concept of "pedagogical reflexivity" presented by Dee & Daly (2009). It is this idea of professional artistry that ties Schön's theory so well to a contemplative reflective practice, in the classroom, as well as outside of the classroom. It is essential that faculty maintain an openness to experience and presence in the classroom in order to achieve this reflexivity.

Taking the idea, a step further, Falkenberg (2012) proposes a model for teaching as a contemplative practice in itself. Falkenberg identifies three dimensions of this model: an ethical component, a noticing component and a mindfulness component. The ethical component gives rise to the notion that teaching is a moral endeavor and needs to be anchored in both understanding and improving our inner lives. The noticing component brings in an element of awareness tied with the intention to interrupt automatic patterns, if only to entertain alternatives. This is reminiscent of Schön's reflection-in-action but involves a conscious effort at exploring alternatives that precedes the situations in which an alternative behavior may be preferable. Finally, the mindfulness component which posits a form of conscious self-awareness that is both

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

non-judgmental and preconceptual in nature. He contrasts this with the awareness cultivated in reflection-in-action by emphasizing the utilization of the information gathered from this effort at a later point. These components form a contemplative version of professional artistry where there is a conscious effort in building self-awareness in the moment for use in a later process of conscious review.

Methodology

Qualitative research provides a window into the lived experience of individuals as they move through the world. This methodology recognizes the unique experiences of each individual as their own personal truth. In this study, the experience of each faculty member is exposing a single facet of the whole picture, which can best be explored qualitatively. Capturing the emergent quality of faculty perceptions calls for a case study approach in order to acknowledge the bounded nature of a professional development program. Yin (2013) suggests “you would use the case study method because you wanted to understand a real-life phenomenon in depth, but such understanding encompassed important contextual conditions—because they were highly pertinent to your phenomenon of study.” Creswell (2007) emphasizes the bounded nature of cases, as well as the use of multiple sources of data for analysis. In this study, the professional development context provides the bounded conditions for studying the phenomenon of emerging perceptions of CP. Barry MacDonald and Rob Walker (as cited in Bassey, 1999) stated that “case-study is the way of the artist, who achieves greatness when, through the portrayal of a single instance locked in time and circumstance, he communicates enduring truths about the human condition.” The case is seen through the eyes of the participants, a story that unfolds beginning with the sowing of seeds that grow and bloom long after the prefatory experience.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Researcher Bias

Qualitative research is inherently interpretive, which necessitates that the researcher's positionality be explicitly acknowledged (Creswell, 2013). The population that I am studying, is a group that I work with on a daily basis. They seek me out for pedagogical help which creates an implicit power dynamic. Though I have made clear in my recruitment materials that participation is completely voluntary with absolutely no penalty for not participating, the role I play at this institution might be enough to inhibit some faculty from participating or prevent some from being completely forthcoming in their interactions with me. Despite this danger, I feel confident that my unique position is actually a boon as it helps me to tailor the experience to the needs of faculty at this institution.

As a practicing meditator and yoga teacher, I have had more than two decades of experiencing utilizing contemplative methods. These experiences have the potential to color my interpretations of the experiences of the participants. However, it is my intention to allow the experiences of these individuals to speak for themselves without drawing on my own experiences in comparison.

Sampling

A purposeful sampling method was utilized in this study with self-selected volunteers. After a human subject review process, seven participants were recruited through email and word-of-mouth, primarily through expression of interest in participating in the professional development. Participation in professional development is a sign of interest and possible openness to exploring new pedagogical techniques and reflective practice. As such, it is important that faculty participants voluntarily chose to participate or not, on this basis. Recruitment materials made it clear that participation in this study was completely voluntary and

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

participants were free to opt-out of any activities without penalty. Further, faculty informed consent was obtained in person where they were provided a detailed description of the research and told that if they elected not to participate in the study they would see no negative impact on professional development opportunities and were free to participate in this workshop.

Data Collection Methods

According to Yin (2013), “the data collection in case study research is typically extensive, drawing on multiple sources of information, such as observations, interviews, documents, and audiovisual materials.” In this study, data was collected using a number of methods including surveys, interviews, and document analysis. Participants took pre- and post-workshop surveys in order to establish a baseline, taking into consideration previous exposure to the specific pedagogical approach covered in the workshop. Likert scale questions helped to establish group norms around mindful practices in and out of the classroom. Open-ended questions explored the emerging perception in more depth. The pre- and post- survey questions are in Appendix A & B. Follow-up interviews took place two months after the workshop where participants were asked open-ended questions. Documents were collected from participants that include syllabi and writing samples from the workshop. All interviews were audio recorded and transcribed. The interview protocol is in Appendix C.

Validity and Reliability

Creswell (2007) presents validation in qualitative research within a framework of trustworthiness, defined by characteristics such as: credibility, authenticity, dependability and transferability. In the last 30 years, views on validity in this context have evolved, from Lather’s (as cited in Creswell, 2007) post-modern take on an “open narrative with holes and questions” to Wolcott’s dismissal of validation as useless. Angen (as cited in Creswell, 2007) also viewed

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

validation in regard to trustworthiness, but as an “open dialogue on the topic” rather than definitively. This study draws on these perspectives of validity as an open question, utilizing best practices to guide the discovery and description of the findings. By honestly portraying these findings, the voices of the participants stand as evidence of their experience alone.

In order to maintain rigor and verify the accuracy of my conclusions, a variety of methods were employed, including member checking, thick description, and triangulation. According to Creswell & Miller (as cited in Creswell, 2013), validity in a qualitative study “is based on determining whether the findings are accurate from the standpoint of the researcher, the participant, or the readers of an account.” In this context, the validity is a measure of trustworthiness and credibility. In member checking, participants in this study had an opportunity to review the results and analysis in order to provide feedback in regard to how well they represent their perspective. After the interviews were complete and transcribed, all participants were provided with a draft of the report and given an opportunity to provide written feedback. In addition, thick description is a technique that employs a rich, detailed description of the case, in order to provide readers with a feeling of shared experience, which allows the reader to make their own inferences about transferability. Finally, triangulation involves utilizing multiple sources of data to discover common themes that converge into a perspective. In this study, documents, interviews and surveys were used in this way.

Data Analysis

After transcribing all of the interviews, the first step in analyzing the data was bracketing the text. Judi Marshall (as cited in Seidman, 2006, p. 117) defines bracketing as selecting the parts of the text that the researcher deems important, utilizing his or her judgment to generate meaningful “chunks” of content. I read through each transcription multiple times, highlighting

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

and commenting relevant sections with the research questions in mind. After bracketing the text, a matrix was developed in four categories (definitions of contemplative pedagogy, evolving perceptions of contemplative pedagogy, personal or professional mindfulness practices, and impact on teaching practices) and then populated with relevant bracketed sections from the interview and each survey, which was then coded for themes and summarized. A summary of these matrices can be found in Appendix D. From this matrix a set of profiles was developed to aid in cross-case comparison of the main research question.

Profiles

Michelle

Michelle is a doctoral student that has been teaching at this school for less than a year. She considers teaching to be a second career which began about 12 years ago, after completing a master's program here. At the time, she was the Director of Congregational Learning at a synagogue and felt it important to not only administer the programs, but also to teach some of them herself. She continued in that role, teaching every age group, for about 10 years. Additionally, she has taught at the elementary level, as well as in high school and adult education programs. Another role she has played is as a coach and mentor working with educators and directors of religious schools in all aspects of teaching and learning. In this capacity she has been able to draw on her past experiences as an athlete, which heavily informs her approach to leadership. Using these skills, she helps her mentees maneuver the emotional side of their roles. "It's not only the personal side of being a director, but how do you navigate and manage people's personalities, feelings, emotions, whether they are board or staff or clergy." Michelle brings this attunement to the emotional side of learning into her classroom teaching as well, modeling this approach for her students.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Michelle's philosophical approach to teaching is based on the premise of working with the whole person in a pursuit that's guided by experience, community, meaning and relevance. A strong proponent of experiential education, she also prefers dialogue, group work, and reflection over frontal teaching. She seeks to empower her students, giving them some autonomy over their learning so their experience in her class is individualized. A major shift in her philosophy was catalyzed when introduced to the concept of social-emotional learning. It shifted what she values and prioritizes in her classroom, cultivating an understanding that tending to the emotional well-being of her students is at least equally important as the skills and content knowledge they are there to learn. The impact on her teaching has been palpable, but also generated a sense of conflict with her assumptions of what teaching should look like in an academic setting. Experiencing the workshop in CP helped to relieve some of that tension, freeing her to experiment more in the following semester. With a renewed sense of autonomy in her role, she finds she is also bringing a more authentic self in the classroom, which is in turn recognized by the students, allowing them to bring their authentic selves into their learning. "I think I'm reaching them at a deeper level. I don't mean intellectually deeper; I mean emotionally deeper."

Using contemplative methods in the classroom is best supported by having a personal practice (Barbezat & Bush, 2013). Michelle developed a personal practice of yoga and meditation after taking a seminar on breathing a few years ago. This program taught her the necessity for emotional self-awareness and attunement, particularly for teachers. She brought these practices to the school she was working with at the time, helping teachers deal with stress through meditation and journaling, and drawing from her own experience using these practices. She also facilitated workshops on Social-Emotional Learning to arm them with

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

classroom techniques to help students make the most of their learning experiences and reduce their own stress. So, when she stepped into the workshop, she was already coming with an open mind, and a set of experiences to draw from. What she lacked was a model for how to effectively integrate these practices in a Higher Education setting. The workshop helped her to understand the relational qualities of CP, and the importance of bringing your authentic self to the classroom, which requires both intentionality and openness and how that creates an implicit shift in the dynamic between students and instructor. “There are moments in the classroom where [the power dynamic] does disappear and that's beautiful. And I think that's what I'm seeing is that when we're both present like that and true to who we are and almost equals in the sense of just being human beings. That's what I see it as being, which I never did before.”

Carol

Carol is an adjunct instructor that teaches a course on non-profit management. She has a wide range of experiences as both a teacher and a consultant. Though she has a history working in leadership roles in corporate and non-profit settings, she has focused on her own consulting practice for the last 15 years. As a teacher, she got started in an elementary school for two years, which was followed by a 5-year stint in Japan teaching adults English and American business practices. After a break from teaching for several years, she started teaching graduate students at a number of universities, including Harvard and Boston University before relocating a few years ago. As a consultant, she has focused primarily on leading retreats for board members and senior leadership and one-on-one coaching, working in both for-profit and increasingly non-profit sectors.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Carol's approach to teaching heavily emphasizes the use of storytelling, tying the stories to the skills the students need to learn. The stories act as a way to get the students engaged in concepts, like budgeting, that they may not be naturally drawn to otherwise. She also prioritizes the importance of self-awareness in leadership, which compels her to employ reflective methods in her class. Everyone has the capacity to lead or manage, but self-awareness is the key to unlocking that potential. She emphasizes the importance of stepping back "from the barrage of things coming in" to find a moment of quiet, introspective time. This is a critical component to effective leadership, and she uses stories to illustrate this to her students, framing this as a competency of self-care, which not only serves the self, but serves the organizations her students may someday lead. Over the years, her teaching style has shifted, largely as a result of her observations in the moment of her students. She noticed earlier in her career how her MBA students, who were mid-level managers going to school at night, would seem to lose steam as she talked and talked. That inspired her to make her classes more interactive and get the students to do more of the talking. Also, shifting between different environments and teaching contexts has compelled her to take very different approaches with her teaching through the years. She discovered that many situations in leadership and management are dependent on a variety of known and unknown variables which students had a really hard time understanding. These situations drove her to curate new materials, and think "broader and deeper about my teaching and put unimaginable amounts of time into course prep."

Carol's personal contemplative practices has been steady yet sporadic, but she takes regular opportunities to pause and clear the clutter of her mind, remove distractions, and place her focus where it needs to be. She has engaged in formal meditation practices, but the regularity is less than it once was, but she feels more competent at knowing when she needs it

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

most and allowing herself to stop and breathe. Since the workshop, she has developed some competency in deep listening skills through a course she is taking. This course has helped her to realize that she is a good listener and to recognize the empathic relationship she feels when in communication with another. It requires attending to some of the more subtle qualities of intercommunication and interrelation that become more recognizable when the mind is focused and deeply attuned to what's happening in the room. "I am now a different person in how I respond to the students and I get feedback from what happens in the way I always did, but that feedback is not the feedback it always used to be."

Carol's initial thoughts about CP centered on establishing a classroom environment that facilitates focus and attention on the learning, without a clear sense of how that may be accomplished, outside of banning technology. The approach is grounded in a certain disposition on the part of the instructor that lends itself to a more thoughtful learning experience. After the workshop, Carol's idea of CP had a dramatic shift. "The workshop certainly opened my eyes to an array of contemplative techniques that would enhance classroom learning." She began to make the connections between her own contemplative practices and the potential for similar activities in the classroom. There was a recognition that these types of activities are not only acceptable in the classroom, but actively used in Higher Education, even among her colleagues.

Aaron

Aaron began his teaching career as a doctoral student more than 40 years ago. During that time, he taught both undergraduates and grads, and realized quite early on that differences in learning style demand more equitable teaching methods. Since this formative experience, he has shunned extensive lecturing and has largely relied on a Socratic methodological approach to his teaching. A year or two after graduating, he began teaching at his current institution full

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

time. He started off in a sort of apprenticeship, being mentored in teaching a particular course that he was intended to take over the following semester. His mentor modeled a very similar teaching style to the one he had become comfortable with, which acted as a form of validation of his teaching instincts. Over time, he slowly moved into more and more administrative work and less teaching. Today, he is a full-time administrator, and only teaches one course per year.

As intimated previously, Aaron prefers a dialectical approach to teaching that engages his students in rich discussion with only a minimal amount of lecture. This approach was formed early on in his career and has changed very little ever since. He describes this preference as exciting as one never knows where a discussion may lead, whereas a lecture is prescriptive and by its nature non-interactive. For Aaron, it's less about covering a lot of material, though there is certainly a sense of ensuring that the core material is covered, but rather exploring the material at its edges is what he finds exhilarating. His methodology is all about providing his students with the skills, aptitude and zeal to explore the core texts of the field on their own, using foundational knowledge as a means to teach these competencies in relation to contemporary concerns and construct personal meaning or integrate with learning from other domains. Over the years, he has discovered that he is at his best as a teacher when he simply being true to himself and his teaching philosophy. If anything has changed, it is that he relies less on covering a certain amount of material in favor of exploring the richness and depth of the material he does cover, and how it relates to other things his students are studying. "I think in the long run it's probably more useful to have a little less material and a little more application or challenge or integration of it to what the other things they're doing or studying."

Even though Aaron admits to not having a mindfulness practice, per se, he has personally meaningful religious practices that, for him, serve that same purpose. It is an opportunity to rest

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

the mind, focus on something specific, and let go of all obligations and stresses, even for a few moments. “This was just quiet time. I find that helpful, comforting, refreshing...It's the palate cleanser at the meal. And in a way it's contemplative for me.” As a result of attending the workshop, Aaron tried incorporating some short meditation into the beginning of his course. “I haven't done it much but the couple of times I've done it; it felt artificial to me; it's because that's just not my style or hasn't been my style... The students actually, a couple of them said they appreciate it. I asked them to write down at the beginning of what things they were thinking about on that side of the threshold and what they would be able to sort of drop when they crossed into the classroom, a few students said it was useful. Did it really enabled you to stop thinking about those things? Nah, not so much... but it at least it brought up some level of consciousness for them.” He finds it somewhat inauthentic and out of his nature to apply these methods in the classroom, which may speak to his level of experience engaging in those practices himself.

Aaron was one of several participants that defined CP primarily in terms of reflection, though he focused more on the kind of reflection that happens in preparation for teaching, or as I like to call it: reflection before action. Even after the workshop, Aaron still referenced this sort of reflection as his go to definition, but now the reflection extended both to the moment of teaching and after. “I use it or understand it more in the sense of self-reflection about what I'm going to do in a class, what I'm doing in that class. And then sort of after the fact that... Did I do that? Did the class accomplish the kinds of things? Did they discuss the kinds of things? Did they explore the kinds of things that contribute to the whole for that semester?” Aaron did admit that his own definition differed from what he presumably viewed as my own working definition, as perceived in the workshop. “I know you use it more in a centering or maybe personally self-

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

reflective.” So, it is clear that his perspective of CP as a whole embodies more than what he finds personally relevant.

Lynn

Prior to her current work, Lynn had been teaching in public and religious schools for more than 13 years. As a student of history in her own undergraduate studies, she gravitated toward teaching history and social studies in her previous positions, and still incorporates that in her work teaching graduate Education students.

Throughout her career, she has strived to develop personal relationships with her students and help them find what is most meaningful to them, which lies at the heart of her teaching style. “I think that's been very important to me, even before I could name that as ‘Constructivist,’ is meeting the students where they are.” She also recognizes the important role of social-emotional learning in the development of learners, young and old. More recently, she has been teaching more and more online, where the kinds of relationships she is used to in a face-to-face setting develop quite differently. In fact, she considers the online format to be even more relational because students have to be more intentional in reaching out when they need something, rather than simply waiting until class is over to have a conversation. As her teaching has evolved, Lynn believes the biggest change has come in the form of being more transparent about the teaching methods she uses. “So, I actually say to them, I'm standing here doing this because you just read something that said that students need to know why you're doing what you're doing. So, I'm telling you now this is what we're doing and why we're doing it.”

Lynn doesn't claim to have any kind of personal contemplative practice, but she does consider herself to be reflective. She gives herself scheduled focus time when she needs to get specific things done, as she has a hard time fitting that in otherwise. She is also an avid walker,

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

which she finds helps her to cleanse the mind. Regardless of her personal practices, she has a self-awareness that she brings into her classroom. For example, she states that she speaks very quickly in class and that it would probably be helpful to students for her to slow down, but in the moment, she is not able to do that. Slowing down the mind requires one to slow down the breath (Barbezat & Bush, 2013). “Like I don't breathe, I don't breathe with them and I'm not going to.” She's equally aware of the fact that students are not always fully present in the classroom, but not completely sure how to remedy that. Coming out of the workshop, she was expecting to learn how to be more reflective in her own work, not necessarily how to use these techniques in the classroom. Now she seems to be somewhat intrigued, though still quite hesitant. “I'm interested to know more. I'm not sure. I'm still not sure. It's the thing that I would prioritize for things I need to do with my life, you know, it's hard to balance.”

David

David has been teaching with his current institution for the last 18 years in the School of Education. Prior to that, he taught as a staff developer, as a graduate student, in a high school, and even taught swimming at a camp. His experience teaching at the high school led him to pursuing his graduate studies, as he quickly realized he needed additional training and support. After graduating, as he was working to help develop staff at public schools, he attended a series of workshops on active learning that became highly influential to his personal teaching style. “I mean it just made a lot of sense to me because I was teaching people how to teach new skills and dispositions and competencies and never thought of that as what I was doing. I was thinking of it more like professing.” That experience was a major influence on David's teaching; it taught him how to integrate aspects of effective course design, hands-on activities, and reflection into his classes. To David, the class should be engaged in a joint inquiry, doing group

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

work, teaching one another, and drawing from personal experience. Since one of David's primary content specialties is in social-emotional learning, this is of particular importance. His approach to teaching embodies the essence of social-emotional theory, viewing his relationships with students as foundational. As an example, he sometimes takes class time to attend to the emotional well-being of his students, helping them to let go of any stress or anxiety that may impede learning.

A big shift in his teaching came when he started teaching online, which now constitutes about half of his course load. Like many online instructors, he struggles with the lack of emotional connection in the online format. "We had emotional moments in this community that sometimes people share personal stuff, on the discussion board [it] was not the same. I miss that sitting together and checking in that way at one time." However, to help engage the students more in this format, he spends a lot of time creating videos and facilitate discussions to help foster a sense of community. Time (and tenure) has given him more confidence in his teaching, allowing him the space to experiment. "I could let go and let people have more of a conversation. I could try an activity; it might fall flat and that's fine. I'll be able to recover from whatever that is." His experiences have allowed him to move away from how he was taught in graduate school into letting it "go with where they're at more."

David claims to not have any personal practices that he would categorize as contemplative, but in the classroom, he is aware that much of what constitutes Social-Emotional learning overlaps with CP. He views his development in this area as an organic process that comes from increasing self-awareness through engagement with the SEL framework, as opposed to an intentional process of identifying and analyzing emotions and regulating them with intention. David views SEL as focusing more on the problem that framework is addressing, and

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

contemplative practice more on the emotional awareness itself. “I don't have a regular journaling practice. I don't have a regular meditative practice and I mean I regularly reflect on my teaching, but it's more kind of reflection-in-action.” Despite his assertions about his lack of contemplative practices, he does spend some time running on the weekend where he gets to “replay the week” and have a conversation with himself about things that need to be done.

Hannah

Hannah is a language professor that started her teaching career about 50 years ago while pursuing a master's degree in English Literature. Over the years she has worked at several universities in the United States and Canada. Early on in her career she taught Hebrew, which is her native language, even though this was not the subject of her studies. She started by observing other instructors which gave her the building blocks she needed to teach the subject herself. Over time, she taught Hebrew in more and more places, and a career began to blossom. After moving from school to school for many years, she eventually landed in her current position and decided to pursue doctoral studies in Applied Linguistics to formalize her education in language teaching, which ultimately took her about 10 years to complete. While in the program, she took several courses in second language acquisition and assessment. She now is the editor of a journal for Hebrew professors and has moved into the area of online teaching.

Her approach to teaching is highly logical. Since language learning is highly skill-oriented, she knows exactly what skills she wants her students to have and structures a learning experience in order to accomplish those goals. “I always know where I'm going. Along the way I learned that I have to tell the students where they are going. Because it's not that obvious to them always why I'm doing a certain activity or why we moved from one thing to the other. So, I have to tell them what is the rationale for that. I'm always aware of the fact that one thing has to

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

lead to another in a logical way...everything builds on each next step.” Since the beginning of her career, this has defined the way she approaches teaching her students. “In terms of my approach, I think personality is destiny. There are certain ways I approach my own learning, my own studying, and doings, you know, and that’s what I am. That’s all I teach.”

Hannah considers herself reflective in the sense that she does think about what happens in her courses and makes adjustments accordingly, but she does not have any practices that she defines as contemplative, either personally or in her teaching. “I have no patience for Yoga and never dabbled in meditation. That’s just. Sorry. Not Me.” She was very open to listening and experiencing new methods in the workshop, but primarily out of intellectual curiosity, not a desire to try out new practices in her classroom. For her it comes down to a sense of comfort and familiarity that is lacking when it comes to contemplative practices, yet she recognizes that there may be ways to explore contemplative approaches that are more familiar to her. “I don’t think I can lead them in such personal practices, since I don’t practice myself, but maybe I could ask them every once in a while, to reflect on their study habits and class preparation and on what was their take away from class.”

Dina

Dina is an administrator and professor in the School of Education. She got her start teaching at the age of 17 in her home country of Israel. For many years she had been taking dance classes until one day her teacher offered her a teaching opportunity. She had no idea what she was doing initially, but over the next couple of years she began to understand how to break material down into its components to make it easier to learn, and her teaching improved. After some time in the army, she studied Comparative Literature and got a teaching diploma in Hebrew Language and Literature. She continued to teach dance, and eventually moved to the

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

United States where she taught dance at a variety of schools. “I think that what I learned from it is that you really need to be very good at what you are doing before you are teaching it, but not only this, you really need to understand where does it all come from, there is a source for all these things.” After teaching dance for so many years, she sought a change and decided to utilize her teaching diploma to teach Hebrew at a local religious girl’s school, followed by other schools. Over time, she found that she needed more education because teaching Hebrew as a second language was very different than what she was prepared for in her education. She enrolled in a summer program at her current institution in teaching Hebrew as a second language. This experience led to her later coming back to the school to complete her doctorate, studying the integration of arts and education. After graduating with her doctorate, Dina moved on to teach with a few other schools, but eventually came back as an administrator and adjunct professor.

Drawing on her dance background, Dina strongly believes in the importance of contextualizing learning, that students need to understand how what they’re learning contributes to the whole. “You really need to encourage. You need to sort of build it inside a strong foundation so students will understand why they are studying it; that it's going to take them somewhere; that there is a goal; that there is a reason why they are doing it. So, contextualizing what you are studying and really learning how to break everything into small pieces. So later on, students will be able to study something that is a very, very small, but understand that it's connected to the bigger thing, is all from the dance.” She teaches with an awareness of each student’s goals and how she will help them achieve them. To engage her students in this process, she prefers to use an experiential learning approach, giving students a variety of activities that spark their creative imagination. However, she always contextualizes these

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

experiences within a larger theory or history. Over time, she has evolved her teaching, developing more and more sophisticated ways of engaging her students. Moving into teaching online has inspired the biggest growth for her, offering her opportunities to completely rethink how she engages with her students. “How will I do it? How will I take the exercises? How will I take the conversation that sometimes happen just on the fly with students, but structure them in a way that it will still be interesting and will create good conversation.”

Dina had previously participated in some CP workshops that I lead at a neighboring institution. From these experiences, she identified in the pre-workshop survey beholding, which Haynes, Irvine & Bridges (2005) describes as a deep experience of art or objects through close observation and intersubjectivity, and deep listening as practices that she identifies with and engages in with her teaching. With a background in the arts, these practices seem a natural fit for her teaching. On a more personal level, she has explored meditation and other mindfulness rituals to help her focus her mind.

Having had those workshops as prior experiences, Dina had a pretty strong sense of what CP is from the start. Her initial responses, prior to the workshop, were focused on the practices she had previously been exposed to, beholding and deep listening, but also drew from her dance background and the types of thoughtful reflection that accompany teaching dance. After the workshop, Dina’s perception of CP was expressed more generally as reflection and slowing of the mind, rather than about any specific practices. Still, Dina was quick to point out that she is “against hopping on every new invention there is in education. I’m totally against it.” With that said, she values opportunities to go deeper with her students, which is why she embraced the idea of certain practices that are compatible with her teaching style.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Discussion

Perceptions of Contemplative Pedagogy

According to Barbezat and Bush (2013), CP is a teaching method that “uses forms of introspection and reflection that allow students to focus internally and find more of themselves in their courses.” The defining factor in that definition is that it allows students to find more of themselves. Arthur Zajonc (2015) defines CP as a collection of practices and methods that “support the development of student attention, emotional balance, empathetic connection, compassion, and altruistic behavior, while also providing new pedagogical techniques that support creativity and the learning of course content.” Deborah Haynes (2005) underscores the difficulty in defining contemplative practice as there are a large variety of forms and methods employed to “develop concentration, deepen understanding and insight, and to cultivate awareness and compassion.”

The participants in this study had fairly wide-ranging perceptions of what constitutes CP, some of which were impacted by exposure to and experience with these methods in the workshop setting. More evolved notions of CP were generally held by those with some evidence of personal practice, even among those with prior exposure to the topic, which supports the notion that a personal practice is a potential prerequisite for utilization of CP practices in the classroom, or at least a good indicator for utilization of these methods. Prior to the workshop, most participants recognized the quality of reflection inherent to contemplative practice, whether that reflection is applied at the course design level or utilized with respect to what happens in the classroom. Aaron stated, “I see the term as meaning that the instructor thinks about and formulates the goals of a course before it is developed in the form of a syllabus.” Similarly,

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Hannah identified it as reflecting on “my methodology and pedagogy so as to maximize effectiveness.”

Shortly following the workshop, many of the definitions were more nuanced and specific, referencing general ideas such as awareness, presence, and intentionality as well as more specific practices like deep listening and meditation. While Carol’s initial thoughts on CP connected to some general themes of mindfulness, her thoughts after the workshop were articulated far more distinctly. “A deliberative and intentional process to help students approach material as free as possible from distractions and as attentively as possible to new learnings, with pacing that supports them as they integrate new learnings into their frame of reference for their accumulated knowledge and sense of self.” Several others still equated CP with reflective practice, but even those responses were a little more nuanced. Dina added “thinking slowly, avoiding rush decisions, taking time” to help indicate the type of reflection involved. David relied on SEL language to frame his definition.

Several months after the workshop, some of the participants showed signs of careful thought and consideration, as well as the pursuit of further development in this area. These participants were far more likely to have some sort of personal practice, or prior experience with CP. Carol had pursued a course in deep listening, Aaron and David had attempted to utilize some of the techniques in their courses, and Michelle deepened her yoga and meditation practices. Some participants restated their resistance to contemplative practices, both personally and in the classroom. Unsurprisingly, one workshop participant was not able to change their conceptions of what types of practices would work for them in the classroom. They expressed concerns that it didn’t feel natural, or they weren’t qualified to use them. Still, most participants recognized the potential value that contemplative methods bring to the teaching and learning

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

process, even if they fell short in the recognition of the depth with which these practices can reach.

Contemplative Pedagogy and Reflective Practice

Contemplative Pedagogy is primarily concerned with the implementation of contemplative practices within the classroom context for the benefit of student learning. It is interesting then that most participants primarily connected CP to a form of teacher reflection, rather than as a classroom technique. Yet, as has been established, in order to effectively integrate CP into the classroom, it is important for one to have a personal practice to draw from. Most of the participants in this program did not have a regular personal practice, and the few who did had expressed CP in terms of student learning, as well as a form of teacher reflection. This pattern is suggestive of a relationship between personal experience and one's conception of teaching. Further research would be required to draw any conclusions about this point.

Trigwell, Prosser and Waterhouse (1999) describe two poles on the spectrum of conceptions of teaching: teaching as transmission of information and teaching as helping students to develop and change their conceptions. This can be broadly thought of as teacher-centric and learner-centric pedagogies. Contemplative Pedagogy is squarely in the learner-centric end of the spectrum, but still many faculty members fail to embrace contemplative methods in the classroom. If faculty members need to change their conceptions of teaching in order to embrace new approaches to teaching, then perhaps additional detail is required to further define teaching conceptions. Changing teaching conceptions would necessitate the primacy of focusing on the implementation of contemplative practice by faculty members as a means for reflecting on their practice. In order for faculty members to consider utilizing contemplative methods in the classroom, it must become a tacit expression of their personal experience,

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

essentially a part of their personal model of knowing-in-action. Only then can faculty members be enabled to embrace contemplative methods into their professional practice.

Future Research

In this study, the emerging perceptions were explored within the context of a single workshop, but other studies suggest that changes in teaching approaches tend to require more extensive interventions (Dee & Daly, 2009; Gibbs & Coffey, 2004; Gunersel & Etienne, 2014; Light & Calkins, 2008; Light, Calkins, Luna & Drane, 2009). Future research in this area should consider employing a deeper engagement, providing multiple experiences utilizing contemplative practice to reflect on teaching practices. Research should also explore faculty resistance to utilizing contemplative techniques within their professional reflective routine. Further study on the connection between personal practice, conceptions and approaches to teaching, and utilization of contemplative classroom practices would help to elucidate the connections between these three elements.

Contemplative Pedagogy is still a developing field, with few practitioners. When exposed to the practices, as applied in the classroom, many faculty members are attracted to the possibilities they present for learning. Discovering ways of opening minds toward this field and providing opportunities to experience the practice may not only help to expand the field but improve student learning on a larger scale.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

References

- Bach, D. J., & Alexander, J. (2015). *Contemplative Approaches to Reading and Writing: Cultivating Choice, Connectedness, and Wholeheartedness in the Critical Humanities. The Journal of Contemplative Inquiry, 2(1)*.
- Barbezat, D. P., & Bush, M. (2013). *Contemplative practices in higher education: Powerful methods to transform teaching and learning*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Bassey, M. (1999). *Case study research in educational settings*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Brookfield, S. (2017). *Becoming a critically reflective teacher*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage publications.
- Dee, J. R., & Daly, C. J. (2009). Innovative models for organizing faculty development programs: Pedagogical reflexivity, student learning empathy, and faculty agency. *Human Architecture, 7(1)*, 1.
- Falkenberg, T. (2012). Teaching as contemplative professional practice. *Paideusis, 20(2)*, 25-35.
- Finlay, L. (2008). Reflecting on reflective practice. *PBPL paper, 52*, 1-27.
- Foreman, K. (2012). *An exploration of the potential of meditation to inform teaching practice* (Doctoral dissertation, Auckland University of Technology).
- Gibbs, G., & Coffey, M. (2004). The impact of training of university teachers on their teaching skills, their approach to teaching and the approach to learning of their students. *Active learning in higher education, 5(1)*, 87-100.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

- Gunersel, A. B., & Etienne, M. (2014). The impact of a faculty training program on teaching conceptions and strategies. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education, 26*(3), 404-413.
- Haynes, D. (2005). Contemplative practice and the education of the whole person. *ARTS: The Arts in Religious and Theological Studies, 16*(2), 8-10.
- Haynes, D. J., Irvine, K., & Bridges, M. (2013). The blue pearl: The efficacy of teaching mindfulness practices to college students. *Buddhist-Christian Studies, 33*(1), 63-82.
- Hart, T. (2004). Opening the contemplative mind in the classroom. *Journal of transformative education, 2*(1), 28-46.
- Hubball, H., Collins, J., & Pratt, D. (2005). Enhancing reflective teaching practices: Implications for faculty development programs. *The Canadian Journal of Higher Education, 35*(3), 57.
- Light, G., & Calkins, S. (2008). The experience of faculty development: patterns of variation in conceptions of teaching. *International Journal for Academic Development, 13*(1), 27-40.
- Light, G., Calkins, S., Luna, M., & Drane, D. (2009). Assessing the Impact of a Year-Long Faculty Development Program on Faculty Approaches to Teaching. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education, 20*(2), 168-181.
- Loughran, J. J. (2002). Effective reflective practice: In search of meaning in learning about teaching. *Journal of teacher education, 53*(1), 33-43.
- Miller, J. P., & Nozawa, A. (2002). Meditating teachers: A qualitative study. *Journal of In-Service Education, 28*(1), 179-192.
- Morgan, P. F. (2012). Following contemplative education students' transformation through their "ground-of-being" experiences. *Journal of Transformative Education, 10*(1), 42-60.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

- Prosser, M., Trigwell, K., & Taylor, P. (1994). A phenomenographic study of academics' conceptions of science learning and teaching. *Learning and instruction, 4*(3), 217-231.
- Schön, D. A. (1984). *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action* (Vol. 5126). Basic books.
- Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner: Toward a new design for teaching and learning in the professions*. Jossey-Bass.
- Schwind, J. K., McCay, E., Beanlands, H., Martin, L. S., Martin, J., & Binder, M. (2017). Mindfulness practice as a teaching-learning strategy in higher education: A qualitative exploratory pilot study. *Nurse education today, 50*, 92-96.
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. Teachers college press.
- Shapiro, S. L., Brown, K. W., & Astin, J. A. (2008). *Toward the integration of meditation into higher education: A review of research*. The Center for Contemplative Mind in Society. Retrieved from <http://www.contemplativemind.org/admin/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/MedandHigherEd.pdf>
- Sherretz, C. E. (2011). Mindfulness in education: Case studies of mindful teachers and their teaching practices. *Journal of Thought, 46*(3/4), 79.
- Smyth, J. (1992). Teachers' work and the politics of reflection. *American educational research journal, 29*(2), 267-300.
- Trigwell, K., Prosser, M., & Waterhouse, F. (1999). Relations between teachers' approaches to teaching and students' approaches to learning. *Higher education, 37*(1), 57-70.
- Yin, R. K. (2013). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Sage publications.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG
FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Zajonc, A. (2016). Contemplation in education. In Schonert-Reichl, K. A., & Roeser, R. W.
(Eds.), *Handbook of Mindfulness in Education* (pp. 17-28). New York: Springer.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Appendix A

Pre-Workshop Survey

Section 1

On a scale from 1 (Completely Disagree) to 5 (Completely Agree), please note the extent with which you agree or disagree with the following statements.

1. I have my own regular mindfulness practice (e.g. meditation, yoga, journaling).
2. I use mindfulness practices in my classes with my students.
3. I sometimes feel overwhelmed by my professional responsibilities.
4. My students sometimes feel overwhelmed by their academic responsibilities.
5. I believe mindfulness practices might help me feel less stress.
6. I believe mindfulness practices might help my students feel less stress.
7. I believe mindfulness practices might help my students learn better.
8. I don't think mindfulness practices are appropriate in the classroom.
9. I often reflect on my own teaching.

Section 2

Please answer the following questions as fully and honestly as possible.

1. What does the term Contemplative Pedagogy mean to you?
2. Please describe any personal or professional experiences you've had with mindfulness.
3. How have, or would, you use mindfulness practices in the classroom to aid student learning and engagement?

Section 3

1. Do you plan to attend the workshop titled Slow Teaching, Deep Learning: Contemplative Approaches to Student Engagement? Choices: Yes or No

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Appendix B

Post-Workshop Survey

Section 1

On a scale from 1 (Completely Disagree) to 5 (Completely Agree), please note the extent with which you agree or disagree with the following statements.

1. I have my own regular mindfulness practice (e.g. meditation, yoga, journaling).
2. I use mindfulness practices in my classes with my students.
3. I plan to use mindful practices with my students in the future.
4. I sometimes feel overwhelmed by my professional responsibilities.
5. My students sometimes feel overwhelmed by their academic responsibilities.
6. I believe mindfulness practices might help me feel less stress.
7. I believe mindfulness practices might help my students feel less stress.
8. I believe mindfulness practices might help my students learn better.
9. I don't think mindfulness practices are appropriate in the classroom.
10. I often reflect on my own teaching.

Section 2

Please answer the following questions as fully and honestly as possible.

1. What does the term Contemplative Pedagogy mean to you?
2. Please describe any personal or professional experiences you've had with mindfulness.
3. How have, or would, you use mindfulness practices in the classroom to aid student learning and engagement?
4. Please reflect on your experiences with Contemplative Pedagogy since the previous survey. Include reflections on either the workshops, if you attended at least one of them.

Section 3

1. Did you attend the workshop titled Slow Teaching, Deep Learning: Contemplative Approaches to Student Engagement? Choices: Yes, the entire session; Yes, but I left early; No, I did not attend.

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Appendix C

Interview Protocol

Background Questions

1. How long have you been teaching?
2. Describe the subject-area you teach.

Pedagogical Approach

1. How would you characterize your teaching style?
2. How would you characterize your teaching methods?
3. How has your teaching style and methods evolved over time?
 - a. If changes have occurred: How have these changes taken place?
 - b. If no changes have occurred: What do you think has prevented your teaching from evolving?

Contemplative Practice

1. What does Contemplative Pedagogy mean to you?
2. Describe your experiences with mindfulness practices.
 - a. If any
 - i. About how often do you engage in any of these practices?
 - ii. How have these practices influenced you as a teacher?

Professional Development

1. Did you attend either (or both) of the professional development workshops?
2. If yes:
 - a. Why did you choose to partake in the workshop(s)?
 - b. What did you hope to gain?
 - c. What did you learn from the workshop(s)?
 - d. As a result of your participation, what have you done differently in regard to reflection on your teaching?
 - e. As a result of your participation, what changes have you made in your teaching style or methods?
 - f. As a result of your participation, what specific changes have you made in your course(s)?
 - g. As a result of your participation, how has your view on Contemplative Pedagogy changed?
3. If no:
 - a. What prevented you from participating?
 - b. How do you feel about using mindfulness practices in the classroom?
 - c. Under what circumstances would you participate in a workshop on Contemplative Pedagogy?

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Appendix D

Findings Matrices Summaries

Contemplative Pedagogy Definitions

Participant	Pre-workshop Survey Response	Post-workshop Survey Response	Interview Response
Michelle	Connects students to a personal way of learning; encourages metacognition; connect learning to life experience	Present and reflective as teacher; Present and reflective as student	Presence; relationship between teacher and students; authenticity; democratizing power, equalizing
Carol	Thoughtful learning progression; modulated presentation; reduced competition in the classroom	Free from distractions, attentive in learning; integrating learning with sense of self; clearing and refreshing the mind; deep listening	Reflection, processing, time for absorption
Aaron	Develops course goals in advance; considering appropriate teaching methods to meet objectives	Thinking about course goals in advance; methods used to approach goals	Self-reflection of goals for the class; reflecting on achievement of those goals after class; aware of use for centering, but not for him
Lynn	Reflective practice/pedagogy	Reflective	Reflective practitioner; connections to practice
David	N/A	Intentional and planful in teaching of the overall flow and big picture of a class, minute-to-minute interactions, one's own emotional state, and the social and emotional state of students/class climate	Pedagogy that incorporates an awareness of self; applying the implications of an attention to self in practice; social-emotional self-awareness and self-regulation in students; reflective practice; mindful of how one handles situations
Hannah	Reflective practice	Reflective practice	Reflective practice; reflection-on-action
Dina	Deep listening; object observation; reflective practice	Reflection; slow thinking; taking time	Reflective practice; discernment; less reactive

Evolving Perceptions of Contemplative Pedagogy

Participant	Pre-workshop Survey Response	Post-workshop Survey Response	Interview Response
-------------	------------------------------	-------------------------------	--------------------

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Michelle	Only used mindfulness in K-12; instrumental model; breathing exercises for transitions; journaling	Feels uncomfortable using breathing & meditation in higher ed	It's more than an instrument; it's about the connection between students and instructor; power dynamics
Carol	Not something she's done; Not very clear about it; about creating a thoughtful class climate; no technology	More expansive idea of contemplative techniques in the classroom; journaling; enhanced personal practice	Understands it as a pedagogical tool, not just for personal growth; recognition that these practices are acceptable in higher ed
Aaron	Has tried having students clear their thoughts at the beginning of class	Previous workshops have been helpful	Contemplative practices are not in his nature
Lynn	Values creating a climate of openness; open to using contemplative practices for this purpose	Not too much since the workshop	Too much to the method to learn in a one hour session; interested in learning more; self-care is important
David	N/A	Had attended previous workshops; topic calls for continuous attention	Material is not totally unfamiliar; first time seeing the practice and theory come together
Hannah	Not familiar with such practices	Students engage in self-reflection in their activities and experiences as learners	Does not see the relevance to language learning; does see value in reflecting on the why and how of learning; perhaps as a motivator; doesn't know how to do it
Dina	Asks students to spend time looking at an object or picture and give guiding questions; help them to focus and engage with materials for a long time	Thinking best when walking or on a bike; being outside can think better than behind a computer	Against hopping on every new invention there is in education

Personal & Professional Mindfulness Practices

Participant	Pre-workshop Survey Response	Post-workshop Survey Response	Interview Response
Michelle	Action research using meditation and journaling; facilitated workshops in Social-Emotional Learning	Attended a seminar on the breath; have maintained a consistent meditation practice	It's important to care for the social-emotional needs of students; consistent meditation practice; bringing her

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

			authentic self into the classroom; understand these concepts on a deeper level
Carol	Sporadic personal meditative practice; regular pauses to clear the mind; timed sessions of productive time	Training in meditation; fairly steady practice	Becoming more self-aware of when a pause and breath is needed; listening differently, deeper; taking a course on deep listening; feeling compassion deeper from the class
Aaron	Attended a few workshops; enact religious rituals in a similar way on a daily basis	Attended some workshop sessions	Religious practices that mirror some of the purposes of contemplative practices; finding quiet time
Lynn	Used protocols to “unpack” a teaching/learning session	Participated in a workshop	No specific practices she’d define as mindful; reflective
David	N/A	Worked extensively in Social-Emotional Learning field; participated in two workshops; use transition rituals, journaling, and “temperature taking” activities.	No specifically contemplative practices; reflect on teaching; long runs
Hannah	Explain or justify classroom activities to help motivate students	No mindfulness practices	No patience for yoga and never dabbled in meditation
Dina	Took some workshops and signed up for a mediation app	Working and reworking on courses and assignments to make everything fit together	Mindfulness practice before bed

Impact on Teaching Practices

Participant	Post-workshop Survey Response	Interview Response
Michelle	Meditations sessions in K-12 schools with teachers and students	Not teaching since workshop
Carol	No tech in the classroom; Opening class with breath focus and intention setting; journaling; adapting lessons for deep listening	Opening class by having them stop and sit quietly

EXPLORING EMERGING PERCEPTIONS OF CONTEMPLATIVE PEDAGOGY AMONG FACULTY PARTICIPATING IN A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

Aaron	Tried opening class with breathing transition	Experimentation, but it felt inauthentic
Lynn	Self-awareness of presentation style and need to slow down	Would like to help students be less distracted, but no changes.
David	Transition rituals; “temperature taking”; pause and focus activities; focus on metacognitive skills	Added material on mindfulness in a class; experimented with breathing exercises during opening sharing circle
Hannah	No changes, but maybe I can ask them to reflect on study habits and class preparation	No changes
Dina	Assignments that ask for reflection on beliefs and life experiences	Hasn’t taught since workshop