

THE SYMPHONY AS DESCRIBED BY
J. A. P. SCHULZ (1774):
A COMMENTARY AND TRANSLATION

Bathia Churgin

In recent years we have come to recognize more and more the significance of Classic theoretical sources for our understanding of the Classic style. Definitions and discussions of the symphony found in 18th-century treatises and dictionaries were first traced by Robert Sondheimer in his old but valuable study *Die Theorie der Sinfonie im 18. Jahrhundert* (1925).¹ Perhaps the best known of these definitions appeared in J. G. Sulzer's dictionary of the arts entitled *Allgemeine Theorie der Schönen Künste* (2 vols., Berlin and Leipzig, 1771 and 1774). The symphony article in volume 2 was written by J. A. P. Schulz (1747–1800), probably in 1773 when he was twenty-six. Although the great Berlin theorist J. P. Kirnberger had been responsible for all the music articles in Sulzer's *Theorie* up to the one on "Modulation," Schulz furnished material for this and succeeding articles, becoming the sole author of all articles starting with the letter "S" to the end of the alphabet.²

Schulz himself was a pupil of Kirnberger in the period 1765–68.³ In 1768–71 he was the musical accompanist of Princess Sapiha of Smolensk, and he travelled with her through Austria, France, and Italy, thereby gaining a much wider acquaintance with musical styles of the time. In 1773 Schulz returned to Berlin, where Kirnberger invited him to work on the articles for Sulzer. Schulz's later career saw him active as the musical director of the French theater in Berlin, 1776–78, and the court composer of Prince Heinrich of Prussia in Rheinsberg, 1780–87, where he led performances of French operas and operettas. Thus his remarks in the symphony article concerning overtures to French operatic works reflect a considerable knowledge of that repertoire. In 1787–94 Schulz was the *Kapellmeister* and director of the Royal Theater in Copenhagen. Though he composed operas, theater music, and choral, chamber, and keyboard works, Schulz has been remembered in music history particularly as a Lieder composer, his most famous works being the three collections of *Lieder im Volkston* (1782, 1784, and 1790). He was also the teacher of the Danish composer C. P. E. Weyse.

Sulzer's *Theorie* had remarkable success. It went through three issues from 1771 to 1777, new editions in 1778/79 and 1786/87, a second revised edition in 1792/94, and a third in 1796/97, which was reissued with further changes in 1798.⁴ Several of Schulz's articles were influential, like his discussion of the

sonata.⁵ With respect to the symphony article, all of paragraphs 2–3 and parts of paragraphs 4–6 were quoted in H. C. Koch's *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* (vol. 3, 1793), and paragraph 3 and most of paragraph 4 in Koch's *Musikalisches Lexikon* (1802).⁶ Thus as late as 1800 a sensitive theorist like Koch, who was well acquainted with the music of Haydn and Mozart, still considered valid a number of Schulz's most important statements, especially his discussion of the independent or chamber symphony.

Schulz follows the Baroque-influenced stylistic classification of the symphony into three types: chamber, theater, and church. This symphonic classification was introduced in Johann Mattheson's *Kern melodischer Wissenschaft* (1737) and *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (1739).⁷ It was taken up immediately by J. A. Scheibe, who described each type of symphony in detail for the first time in essays dated November 24 and December 1, 8, and 15, 1739 (later published in his volume *Critischer Musicus* [1745]). These early references to the chamber or independent symphony are further indications of its emergence in the 1730s as a distinct genre.

Many of Schulz's remarks are original, and they illuminate several important aspects of the three symphonic types in Classic music up to c. 1773. In his first paragraph Schulz refers to the replacement of the overture (meaning here the French overture) by the "lighter form of the symphony." He suggests that the symphony originated in the partita (i.e., the orchestral suite); this is certainly one important—and neglected—source of the Classic symphony,⁸ together with such sources as the concerto, Italian overture, and trio sonata.

Undoubtedly most significant are Schulz's remarks about the allegro movements of the chamber symphony. Though intensive research on the Classic symphony has uncovered a vast and varied repertoire, Classic symphonic writing is still measured by many musicologists and even Classic specialists according to the criterion of thematic development, as found in the works of Haydn and Beethoven. Despite his conservative training, however, Schulz never mentions thematic development. Instead, he emphasizes strong contrasts in texture, dynamics, and rhythm, with the introduction of "great and bold ideas" and unpredictable, startling modulations. "Extravagance" and "seeming disorder" in melody and harmony, as well as imaginative structure, are the basic ingredients of the symphonic allegro as he views it.

Schulz's description thus offers a healthy corrective to our still unbalanced approach to the Classic symphony, which usually centers on connections at the expense of disconnections. To be sure, it is not that connections are unimportant. Schulz carefully qualifies his remarks by referring to *apparent*—not real—disorder in melody and harmony. But his insistent concern with the varied sources of contrast and surprise in the symphonic allegro underlines the significance of these elements in the Classic style.

It might seem that Schulz's concept of the symphonic allegro was influenced by the highly charged dramatic style of the *Sturm und Drang* in the late 1760s and early 1770s. However, these characteristics are not limited to the "official" period of the *Sturm und Drang* but appear in symphonies by

many composers from c. 1750 on. The fact that Koch quotes just those parts of Schulz's description that emphasize the dramatic aspect shows that these traits were generally thought of as typical of the symphony in the late 18th century as well. The composer whom Schulz singles out as having written allegros "that are models of the genre" is the Belgian Pierre van Maldere (1729–68);⁹ the allegros of such works as the symphonies in B-flat, Op. 4/3 (published in 1764), and in D, Op. 5/1 (published in 1765), illustrate all the traits mentioned by Schulz.

Especially striking in Schulz's definition is his enumeration of textural contrasts that include both homophonic and imitative settings, unison passages, and independent bass and middle voices. These comments underscore the great importance of textural diversification in Classic music, a still neglected trait of Classic style. They also suggest that the use of contrapuntal textures in the symphony was more common than we suppose and not an exclusive technique of the Viennese school. Though Schulz stresses contrast in general, he also points out the effectiveness of a crescendo that is introduced together with a "rising and increasingly expressive melody." This is surely one of the earliest references to an essential feature of Classic style: concinnity, or the coordination of musical elements in support of structural and expressive effects.¹⁰

Despite the introduction of the standard four-movement plan by Johann Stamitz in the late 1740s, Schulz deals solely with the three-movement symphony, which remained a popular alternative to the four-movement cycle to the end of the 18th century.¹¹

Schulz's association of the symphony with the expression of "the grand, the festive, and the noble" apparently pertains only to allegro movements, since he acknowledges a substantial variety of mood in slow movements. Schulz reiterated his view of the "more fixed character" of the symphony in his article on the sonata, a form he identifies with a wide range of expression. While even today we may still hold to this concept of the symphonic allegro, there are many exceptions from the 18th century on. In terms of the Classic symphony itself, other allegro types include the singing, pastoral, and humorous or *buffo* allegro, the first appearing more often in the 1770s. Schulz, maintaining his ideal, actually criticizes the aria-like qualities in the overtures of C. H. Graun and Hasse.

The uniform approach to the allegro movements implies a non-differentiation of the first and last allegros. Schulz's characteristic cycle therefore contains a balancing finale just as carefully worked out and as powerful as the first movement. This type of finale, which existed from the earliest period of symphonic composition, appears in the symphonies of Maldere as well. Its roots go back to the three-movement Baroque concerto (like Vivaldi's Op. 3/8), and it furnished the model for the strong, even climactic finale so frequent in the Romantic symphony. Here again, more possibilities exist than Schulz implies. A stylistic contrast in the finale occurs in many Classic symphonies. In the early Classic symphony and overture, it was automati-

cally produced by the frequent use of the minuet conclusion. *Buffo* finales and other lighter types are also common from the beginning. Even Koch notes in his *Lexikon* that the last movement "mostly has a cheerful or humorous character."

Schulz's observations regarding the overtures to Italian and French operas and operettas are self-explanatory. They reflect his experience with these forms as both conductor and listener. A strong prejudice against Italian music expressed on this topic also colors his article on the sonata, a prejudice found in some other German writings of the Classic period.

No list of composers is attached to Schulz's article until the volume published in 1787, where 29 names appear in haphazard order. The proportion of significant composers, however, is much higher than in the list of 72 names published in 1794, while the 1797 edition adds such leading figures as Pleyel, Rosetti, Vanhal, and Wranitsky. The list emphasizes composers of chamber symphonies, a fact important in itself. However, the complete list cannot be considered representative. About half the names belong to minor and even obscure musicians, many of whom composed few symphonies (like Azais, Bailleur, Bonesi, Kaa, and Kammel). Two figures, Cambini and Devienne, are notable rather as composers of *symphonies concertantes*. On the other hand, the list omits several good early symphonists—undoubtedly forgotten by the late 18th century—figures like Agrell, Brioschi (Broschi in the list probably refers to Riccardo Broschi, the opera composer and brother of Farinelli), the Camerlohers, Chelleri, Guillemain, M. G. Monn, and Roman. More surprising is the absence of such popular Italian overture composers as Leo, Galuppi, Jommelli, Sacchini, and Sarti. Also missing are the French composers Martin, Le Duc, and Rigel; the Viennese d'Ordoñez; and the more isolated Kraus (Stockholm) and Brunetti (Madrid). No separate references occur for the Haydn brothers or the Stamitz father and sons such as those given for the Bachs, Bendas, and Grauns. Citations are most complete for the North German and Mannheim schools.

It is probable that Schulz himself compiled these lists, thus explaining the nearly complete absence of Italian and French overture composers, whose music he denigrates in the article. Schulz's authorship also explains the presence of so many German *Kleinmeister* and composers connected with the Berlin and Copenhagen musical scenes (like Hartmann, Höckh, Kospoth, Riedt, and Zarth).

Symphony¹²

A piece of instrumental music for many voices that is used in place of the now obsolete overture. The difficulty of performing an overture well and the still greater difficulty of composing a good overture have given rise to the lighter form of the symphony. [This] originally consisted of one or more fugal pieces

Symphonie

Ein vielstimmiges Instrumentalstück, das anstatt der abgekommenen Overtüren gebraucht wird. Die Schwierigkeit eine Overtüre gut vorzutragen, und die noch grössere Schwierigkeit, eine gute Overtüre zu machen, hat zu der leichteren Form der Symphonie, die Anfangs aus ein oder etlichen fugirten Stücken, die

alternating with dance pieces of various types, which was generally called [a] partita. To be sure, the overture was still used before large pieces of church music and operas, and one made use of partitas only in chamber music. But soon one also became tired of dance pieces [that were performed] without dancing, and finally settled for one or two fugal or nonfugal allegros that alternated with a slower andante or largo. This genre was called [the] symphony and was introduced in chamber music as well as before operas and in church music, where it is still in use today. The instruments that belong to the symphony are violins, violas, and bass instruments; each part is strongly reenforced. Horns, oboes, and flutes can be used in addition for filling out or strengthening.

One can compare the symphony to an instrumental chorus, just as one [can compare] the sonata to an instrumental cantata. In the latter, the melody of the main voice, which is played by only one instrument, can be of such a nature that it stands and even requires embellishment. On the other hand, in the symphony, where each part is more than singly performed, the melody must contain its greatest emphasis in the written notes themselves and cannot tolerate the slightest embellishment or coloration. Also, because the symphony is not a practice piece like the sonata but must be played immediately at sight, no difficulties should occur therein that could not be grasped at once by a large group and performed distinctly.

The symphony is excellently suited for the expression of the grand, the festive, and the noble. Its purpose is to prepare the listeners for an important musical work, or in a chamber concert to summon up all the splendor of instrumental music. If it is to satisfy this aim com-

mit Tanzstücken von verschiedener Art abwechselten, bestand, und insgemein *Partie* genennt wurde, Anlass gegeben. Die Overture erhielt sich zwar noch vor grossen Kirchenstücken und Opern; und man bediente sich der Partien blos in der Kammermusik: allein man wurde der Tanzstücke, die ohne Tanz waren, auch bald müde, und liess es endlich bey ein oder zwey fugirten oder unfugirten Allegros, die mit einem langsamern Andante oder Largo abwechselten, bewenden. Diese Gattung wurde Symphonie genennt, und sowol in der Kammermusik, als vor Opern und Kirchenmusiken eingeführet, wo sie noch itzt im Gebrauch ist. Die Instrumente, die zur Symphonie gehören, sind Violinen, Bratsche und Bassinstrumente; jede Stimme wird stark besetzt. Zum Ausfüllen oder zur Verstärkung können noch Hörner, Hoboen und Flöten dazu kommen.

Man kann die Symphonie mit einem Instrumentalchor vergleichen, so wie die Sonate mit einer Instrumentalcantate. Bey dieser kann die Melodie der Hauptstimme, die nur einfach besetzt ist, so beschaffen seyn, dass sie Verzierung verträgt, und oft sogar verlangt. In der Symphonie hingegen, wo jede Stimme mehr wie einfach besetzt wird, muss der Gesang den höchsten Nachdruck schon in den vorgeschriebenen Noten enthalten und in keiner Stimme die geringste Verzierung oder Coloratur vertragen können. Es dürfen auch, weil sie nicht wie die Sonate ein Uebungstück ist, sondern gleich vom Blatt getroffen werden muss, keine Schwierigkeiten darin vorkommen, die nicht von vielen gleich getroffen und deutlich vorgetragen werden können.

Die Symphonie ist zu dem Ausdruck des Grossen, des Feyerlichen und Erhabenen vorzüglich geschickt. Ihr Endzweck ist, den Zuhörer zu einer wichtigen Musik vorzubereiten, oder in ein Kammerconcert alle Pracht der Instrumentalmusik anzubieten. Soll sie diesem Endzweck voll-

pletely and be a closely bound part of the opera or church music that it precedes, then besides being the expression of the grand and festive, it must have an additional quality that puts the listeners in the frame of mind required by the piece to come, and it must distinguish itself through the style of composition that makes it appropriate for the church or the theater.

The chamber symphony, which constitutes a whole in and for itself and has no following music in view, reaches its goal only through a full sounding, brilliant, and fiery style. The allegros of the best chamber symphonies contain great and bold ideas, free handling of composition, seeming disorder in the melody and harmony, strongly marked rhythms of different kinds, powerful bass melodies and unisons, concerting middle voices, free imitations, often a theme that is handled in the manner of a fugue, sudden transitions and digressions from one key to another, which are all the more startling the weaker the connection is [between them], [and] strong shadings of the forte and piano, and chiefly of the crescendo, which, if it is employed at the same time as a rising and increasingly expressive melody, can be of the greatest effect. Added to this comes the art of connecting all voices in and with one another so that their sounding at the same time allows only one single melody to be heard, which requires no accompaniment, but to which each voice contributes its part. Such an allegro is to the symphony what a Pindaric ode is to poetry. Like the ode, it lifts and stirs the soul of the listener and requires the same spirit, the same elevated powers of imagination, and the same aesthetics in order to be happy therein. The allegros in the symphonies of the Netherlander *Vanmaldere*, which can be viewed as a model of this genre of instrumental music, possess all of the above mentioned characteristics, and bear witness to the greatness of

kommen Genüge leisten, und ein mit der Oper oder Kirchenmusik, der sie vorhergeht, verbundener Theil seyn, so muss sie neben dem Ausdruck des Grossen und Feyerlichen noch einen Charakter haben, der den Zuhörer in die Gemüthsverfassung setzt, die das folgende Stück im Ganzen verlangt, und sich durch die Schreibart, die sich für die Kirche, oder das Theater schickt, unterscheiden.

Die Kammersymphonie, die ein für sich bestehendes Ganzes, das auf keiner folgende Musik abzielet, ausmacht, erreicht ihren Endzwek nur durch eine volltönige, glänzende und feurige Schreibart. Die Allegros der besten Kammersymphonien enthalten grosse und kühne Gedanken, freye Behandlung des Satzes, anscheinende Unordnung in der Melodie und Harmonie, stark marquirte Rhythmen von verschiedener Art, kräftige Bassmelodien und Unisoni, concertirende Mittelstimmen, freye Nachahmungen, oft ein Thema, das nach Fugenart behandelt wird, plötzliche Uebergänge und Ausschweifungen von einem Ton zum andern, die desto stärker frappiren, je schwächer oft die Verbindung ist, starke Schattirungen des Forte und Piano, und vornehmlich des Crescendo, das, wenn es zugleich bey einer aufsteigenden und an Ausdruck zunehmenden Melodie angebracht wird, von der grössten Wirkung ist. Hiezu kömmt noch die Kunst, alle Stimmen in und mit einander so zu verbinden, dass ihre Zusammentönung nur eine einzige Melodie hören lässt, die keiner Begleitung fähig ist, sondern wozu jede Stimme nur das Ihrige beyträgt. Ein solches Allegro in der Symphonie ist, was eine pindarische Ode in der Poesie ist; es erhebt und erschüttert, wie diese, die Seele des Zuhörers, und erfodert [sic] denselben Geist, dieselbe erhabene Einbildungskraft, und dieselbe Kunstwissenschaft, um darin glücklich zu seyn. Die Allegros in den Symphonien des Niederländers *Vanmaldere*, die als Muster dieser Gattung

their composer, whose premature death has deprived art of many additional masterpieces of this kind.

The andante or largo between the first and last allegro has indeed not nearly so fixed a character, but is often of pleasant, pathetic, or sad expression. Yet, it must have a style that is appropriate to the dignity of the symphony. [It] must not, as it seems to be becoming fashionable, consist of mere trifles that, if one really wishes to trifle, could be better applied in a sonata, or have a good place in symphonies before comic operettas.

Opera symphonies assume more or less the character of the chamber symphony, as it suits itself to the character of the opera to be presented. Yet, it seems that they tolerate less extravagance and should not be so well worked out, because the listener is more attentive to that which is to follow than to the symphony itself. Since most of our large operas seem to have the same character and as their basis a mere dazzling of the eye and ear, the symphony already has its effect even if it just makes a nice sounding noise. The opera symphonies of the Italians, at any rate, never have a different characteristic. In the allegros the instruments make noise over a drum bass¹³ and three chords, and dawdle in the andantinos without strength or expression. In addition, no listener in Italy pays attention to the symphony. [C. H.] Graun has a great deal more artistry and puts character into his opera symphonies; yet his tender soul lacked the fire necessary for it. Beautiful song, which never left him, as precious as it is, nevertheless makes a weak effect in every symphony. One believes one is hearing a fiery opera aria being performed by instruments. In this

der Instrumentalmusik angesehen werden können, haben alle vorhin erwähnte Eigenschaften, und zeugen von der Grösse ihres Verfassers, dessen frühzeitiger Tod der Kunst noch viele Meisterstücke dieser Art entrissen hat.

Das Andante oder Largo zwischen dem ersten und letzten Allegro hat zwar keinen so nahe bestimmten Charakter, sondern ist oft von angenehmen, oder pathetischen, oder traurigen Ausdruck; doch muss es eine Schreibart haben, die der Würde der Symphonie gemäss ist, und nicht, wie es zur Mode zu werden scheint, aus blossen Tändeleien bestehen, die, wenn man doch tändeln will, eher in einer Sonate angebracht werden, oder in Symphonien vor comischen Operetten einen guten Platz haben können.

Die Opersymphonien nehmen mehr oder weniger von der Eigenschaft der Kammersymphonie an, nachdem es sich zu dem Charakter der vorzustellenden Oper schickt. Doch scheint es, dass sie weniger Ausschweifung vertragen, und auch nicht so sehr ausgearbeitet seyn dürfen, weil der Zuhörer mehr auf das, was folgen soll, als auf die Symphonie selbst, aufermerksam ist. Da die mehesten unserer grossen Opern denselben Charakter und eine blossen Ohren und Augenverblendung zum Grund zu haben scheinen, so thut die Symphonie schon ihre Wirkung, wenn sie auch nur blos wol klingend lärmet. Wenigstens haben die Opersymphonien der Italiäner niemals eine andre Eigenschaft. Die Instrumente lärmten in den Allegros über einen Trommelbass und drey Accorden, und tändeln in den Andantinos ohne Kraft und Ausdruck; auch achtet kein Zuhörer in Italien auf die Symphonie. Graun hat ungleich mehr Kunst und Charakter in seine Opersymphonien gebracht; doch fehlte seiner zärtlichen Seele das hiezu nöthige Feuer. Der schöne Gesang, der ihn nie verliess, so schätzbar er auch ist, ist in jeder Symphonie doch

field, Graun would have been surpassed by his brother, the late concertmaster, who found the true spirit of the symphony in certain chamber symphonies. Hasse too has surpassed him in this regard, although his opera symphonies also have many aria-like qualities.

The French, in their symphonies preceding operettas, try to alternate frivolous passages with lofty thoughts. But all their loftiness degenerates into bombast. In order to convince oneself of this, one need only see one of the best French symphonies in score or listen to it. Since operettas generally have more that is characteristic than large operas, it is unnecessary that each work always begin with a symphony. Many operettas can have a character for which the grandeur of the symphony is not at all appropriate. Here would be the opportunity to invent new forms that would be suitable for each work, to which one can give the general title "Introduction," so that they would not be confused with the symphony, whose goal should really be only the splendor and grandeur of instrumental music.

The church symphony distinguishes itself from the rest above all through its serious style of composition. It consists often of only a single movement. It does not tolerate, as does the chamber symphony, extravagance or disorder in the melodic and harmonic progressions, but proceeds in a steady manner, faster or slower, according to the nature of the expression of the church piece, and strictly observes the rule[s] of composition. Instead of the magnificent, it often has a quiet nobility as its goal, and best suited for it is a pathetic, well worked-out fugue.

nur von matter Wirkung. Man glaubt eine feurige Opernarie zu hören, die von Instrumenten vorgetragen wird. Graun würde in diesem Fach von seinem Bruder, dem verstorbenen Concertmeister, übertroffen worden seyn, der in einigen Kammersymphonien den wahren Geist der Symphonie getroffen hat. Auch hat Hasse ihn hierin übertroffen, obgleich dessen Opernsymphonien auch viel arienmässiges haben.

Die Franzosen suchen in ihren Symphonien vor den Operetten Tändeleien mit erhabenen Gedanken abzuwechseln. Aber alle ihre Erhabenheit artet in Schwulst aus; man darf, um sich hievon zu überzeugen, nur die erste die beste französische Symphonie in Partitur sehen, oder anhören. Da die Operetten überhaupt mehr Charakteristisches, als die grossen Opern haben, so ist es nicht ausgemacht, dass es jedesmal eine Symphonie seyn müsse, womit das Stück anfängt. Manche Operette kann einen Charakter haben, wozu sich das Grösse der Symphonie gar nicht schickt. Hier wäre Gelegenheit, neue Formen zu erfinden, die jedem Stück angemessen wären, und denen man den allgemeinen Namen *Introduction* geben könnte, damit sie nicht mit der Symphonie, die eigentlich immer nur die Pracht und das Grosse der Instrumentalmusik zum Endzweck haben sollte, verwechselt würden.

Die Kirchensymphonie unterscheidet sich von den übrigen vornehmlich durch die ernste Schreibart. Sie besteht oft nur aus einem einzigen Stück. Sie verträgt nicht, wie die Kammersymphonie, Ausschweifungen oder Unordnung in den melodischen und harmonischen Fortschreitungen, sondern geht in gesetzten und nach Beschaffenheit des Ausdrucks des Kirchenstücks geschwindern oder langsamern Schritten fort, und beobachtet genau die Regel [sic] des Satzes. Sie hat statt des Prächtigen oft eine stille Erhabenheit zum Endzweck, und verträgt am besten eine pathetische und wol ausgearbeitete Fuge.

Among others symphonies have been composed by:¹⁴ *Joh. Adam, *C. F. Abel, Azais [Azaïs], *C. P. E. Bach, *J. C. Bach, *George and Franz Benda, Ant. Bailleur, Frz. Beck, L. Boccherini, J. J. C. Bode, Bonesi, Broschi, Ant. Bulant [Bullant], Gius. Cambini, Chrstn. Cannaluch [Cannabich], Gaud. Comi, *Czarth [Zarth], Desormery [Désormery], Devienne, Dittersdorf, E. Eichner, Mich. Esser, *Ant. Filz, *Förster, Flor. L. Gassmann, J. J. G. Gayer, G. Gebel, Frz. Jos. Gossec, J. Th. Greiner, *C. H. Graun, *J. G. Graun, Joh. Hartmann, *Hasse, *Haydn, C. F. Hennig, *Hoegk [Höckh], *Leop. Hofmann, Frz. Ant. Hofmeister, Horn, *Ign. Holzbauer, J. W. Hertel, *Janitsch, Frz. Ign. Kaa, A. Kammel, J. F. Klöffler [Klöffler], v. Kospoth, G. A. Kreussner [Kreusser], Frz. Kraft, Kürzinger, *F. P. Kunzen, Lampugnant [Lampugnani], Leehmans, C. G. Lidarti, Lorenziti, Andr. Luchesi, L. Maier, *G. B. Martini [Sammartini?], A. W. F. Misliweczek [Josef Myslivecek], Miraglio, *Mozart, *Neruda, **Pleyel, G. Pugnani, *Raab, *Richter, *Riedt, Rose, **Rosetti, *Stamitz, *Schwindel, M. J. Treschi [C. G. Toeschi], **Vanhall, *Vanmalder [Vanmaldere], *Wagenseil, **Wranitzky, and many others more [u. v. a. m.].

Symphonien haben, unter mehrern, gesetzt: *Joh. Adam, . . .

NOTES

¹ See also Eugene K. Wolf and Jan LaRue, "A Bibliographical Index to Robert Sondheim's *Die Theorie der Sinfonie*," *Acta Musicologica* 37 (1965):79-86. Excerpts from Schulz's definition, with brief comments, appear in Sondheim's study on pp. 39-41.

² Heinz Gottwaldt and Gerhard Hahne, "J. A. P. Schulz," *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* 11:249.

³ The information about Schulz given in this paragraph comes from the *MGG* article cited above, 245-53.

⁴ For details of these editions see François Lesure, ed., *Écrits imprimés concernant la musique*, *RISM B VI* (Munich: Henle, 1971), 2:812-13. Copies of Schulz's article were examined from all the issues and editions. I wish to extend my thanks to the following libraries for sending me xerox copies of the articles: Staatliche Bibliothek, Bamberg; Universitätsbibliothek, Basel; Stadt- und Universitätsbibliothek, Bern; Music Library, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill; Universitäts- und Stadtbibliothek, Köln; Music Library, Yale University; Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, Vienna; Zentralbibliothek, Zürich. The "Neue vermehrte zweyte Auflage" (1792/94) has been published in a facsimile edition (Hildesheim: Olms, 1967), 4 vols. and Index.

⁵ See the translation of this article and remarks by William S. Newman in *The Sonata in the Classic Era*, 2d ed. (New York: Norton, 1972), pp. 23–25.

⁶ Koch's *Versuch*, 3:301–4. Koch introduced his quotation in the *Lexikon* by saying that Sulzer (i.e., Schulz) had described the symphony “in an appropriate manner” (“auf eine treffende Art”).

⁷ Mattheson's remarks appear in *Kern melodischer Wissenschaft*, p. 125, and in *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, p. 234.

⁸ The influence of the orchestral suite can be seen in some early symphonies that contain a mixture of abstract and dance movements. One example is a four-movement symphony by Fortunato Chelleri (1690–1757), published as No. 6 in *Six symphonies nouvelles* (Paris: Boivin and Leclerc, c. 1742–51). The cyclical plan, fast-slow-fast (giga style)-minuet, resembles the early G-major symphony by G. B. Sammartini, J-C 39 (probably composed in the 1730s). Though the minuet in Sammartini's symphony is borrowed from a trio sonata, the Chelleri symphony suggests that the order of movements may be original and not a later arrangement, as this writer has proposed elsewhere. Another, striking example is an early symphony ascribed to J. J. Agrell (1701–65), located in Uppsala, Universitetsbiblioteket, copied no later than 1748. This is a true suite-symphony in six movements: fast-slow-minuet-fast-slow (resembling a loure)-fast (like a gigue). The work has been edited by Lennart Hedwall (Stockholm, 1961). The date is indicated by the appearance on the Ms parts of the name J. G. Sander [Johan Gotthard Zander], a member of the Royal Chapel in Stockholm who died in 1748.

⁹ The only extensive study of Maldere's life and works is by Suzanne Clercx: *Pierre van Maldere, virtuose et maître des concerts de Charles de Lorraine (1729–1768)* (Brussels: Palais des académies, 1948).

¹⁰ See Jan LaRue, *Guidelines for Style Analysis* (New York: Norton, 1970), pp. 16, 142–44.

¹¹ Even Koch mentions the four-movement cycle as an afterthought in his *Versuch*, 3:314–15, a reference he actually omits in his *Lexikon*. For the emergence of the four-movement symphony in the works of Stamitz, see Eugene K. Wolf, “The Symphonies of Johann Stamitz: Authenticity, Chronology, and Style” (Ph.D. dissertation, New York University, 1972), 1:182–85, 235–46.

¹² This translation was originally made several years ago by my student assistant at Vassar College, Dorothy Setian. It has since been corrected by this writer and Dr. Kurt Ermann of the Language Department, Bar-Ilan University (Israel). I wish to express my thanks to Dr. Ermann for his valuable assistance. The German text used comes from the 1794 edition of Sulzer's dictionary, which is slightly more consistent and modern in spelling and punctuation than the 1774 text. It also contains the final paragraph with the list of composers.

¹³ This term denotes a repeated-note bass.

¹⁴ The list of composers follows the spelling of the 1794 edition, with corrections, if necessary, given in square brackets. One asterisk is placed next to names listed in 1787 and two asterisks next to names added in 1797.