

R: Could you tell me about how people behave when they are involved in Socratic seminar?

L: We would give our opinion and we would ask questions on what the article was about, on whatever we was reading, like on Tita we asked what do you think her religion is because we couldn't find out what her religion was

R: What have you noticed about your own behavior when you are involved in Socratic seminar?

L: I was asking questions mostly,

R: yeah – what kinds of questions would you mostly ask?

L: Why did Tita's mom not want her to get married? And then the class answered that question.

R: Has Socratic seminar influenced the way you interact with your classmates?

L: yeah, because me and some students don't really get along really in class but when we were in the circle we all somehow talked to each other and give our opinions.

R: Has your experience in the Socratic seminar changed the way you think of yourself as a student? How has it changed the way you see yourself?

L: yeah because I never was involved in- I'd go up to the board sometimes, I never did that in high school.

Appendix D

Transcripts of Socratic Seminars

Socratic seminar 1—Caged Bird—Maya Angelou

Jo: Ok I wanna start, I wrote one little word over here, to me I think it's about slavery, that is the first thing that came to my mind when I read it, 'cos like, because she state how a freed bird leaps, or whatever- and a caged bird is like tied down, and being that, during that time, like that is basically how the slaves were being treated

Victor: how they felt?

Jo: a caged bird

Pete: I think just, I think like this song could really like go for anybody

Students mumbling

Pete: I thought it was a song

Laughter

Pete: I think this poem can really go for anybody, I don't think she was actually talking about a caged bird, obviously, he could have been a bird but...

Josh: It was probably like an expression she used

Pete: Like an expression to it- I could see this poem like compared to a lot of people, a lot of people probably feel like a caged bird, maybe somebody feels like they are tied down, in like marriage or something.

Jessica: huh haha

Pete: Or like, I dunno, maybe you are right about slavery, it could be about slavery too.

Victor: and the bird in a cage being tied, we might feel like that sometimes.

Josh: Word.

Josh: the birds don't sing

Jessica: What birds don't sing?

Josh: birds do not sing

Leah: they do sing

Josh:-they hum

Jessica: Oh in audible

Christine: I was gonna say that

Leah: Why do you say it is about slavery?

Jo: Because... the poet, like the time that she wrote this poem was during slavery, the type of person that she is, a black poet, during those times that slavery was going on happening, and she says, sing for freedom, the caged bird sings for freedom, so I'm just like, maybe she is just saying the poem, for the people how the slave may have felt. Like Pete say, it could go for anybody, like an artist who sings, when they get on stage they could feel like a caged bird, or just somebody in general.

Leah: What do you think it means when he, she says, his wings were clipped, and his feet were tied?

Victor: Josh?

Laughter

Josh: that was for me?

Leah: yeah

Josh: Hmm. To tell you the truth I don't actually know but, I think that they was tied in the pain or whatever, I'm gonna give it that is my best answer, so they was tied they was going through it, their emotions,

Leah: do you know what I asked you?

Josh: no not really

Leah: I said his wings were clipped, and his feet were tied what do you think that means?

Ruth: So you can ask this as a general question you don't have to put people on the spot, we are trying to be supportive

Leah: I'm sorry Josh

Jessica: a bird's wings being clipped means that they can not fly, so he can't go anywhere, his feet being tied means that he can't go anywhere that way either- so he physically can't move.

Victor: like when somebody is behind bars he can't do anything – they are stuck basically-it's messed up

Jessica: like think of a bird in your cage that's like is in your home, like they can't go anywhere

Leah: Oh I see

-Jessica: that's what she is referring to in that.

Leah: It sounds like a bird that is on the street that is broken bird trapped in a cage.

Josh: A broken hearted bird

Leah: No like a bird with broken leg, trapped in a cage

Josh: but if he has his legs tied it is not broken

Jessica: It could be a reference to anything, it doesn't necessarily have to be a bird, that is just the title of it, like a reference she is using, it could be a person, it could be anything.

Pete: You could think of it like somebody in prison too, somebody in prison is behind bars, it is not really referring to the age of the bird, but being trapped in prison, or being trapped somewhere that doesn't let you do anything, that's just how you describe it -

Josh: that's the bird

Pete: That's just like the bird in the cage

Jo: getting locked up, that do tie you down.

Leah: Do you think the bird died in this?

Jo: No I think the bird was set free

Inaudible

Leah: In the first paragraph

Jessica: It is not like physically, actually a bird she is talking about, like she is just using that as a metaphor a acknowledge that – she might not even be speaking about a specific person,

Josh: She might be speaking about herself

Jessica: She might be speaking in general- She might be speaking about herself- didn't she just recently die? 5 years ago or something

Jo: hm hm

Pete: that's what I say, this poem is, maybe this poem was made a long time ago, it could be a reference to anybody, this poem is very open- based, not talking about somebody specifically, but using the example of the bird in the cage a lot of people could relate to it. A lot of people could read this poem and think, oh this poem really does relate to me, how I feel right now, maybe when I am working, this poem could mean anything, it really could be anything

Jessica: It could reference, somebody being stuck in a job

Pete: yeah,

Jessica: stuck in a dead end job, you don't have an education, you don't go anywhere, so you are stuck in your little cubicle for the rest of your life- like that is their cage.

Jo: So I had looked it and it had said in the poem the free bird has power and named the sky his own while acting on inborn, inborn impulses to fly low in the sky, the language and imagery surrounding the free bird is a (inaudible) and also indicated his authority and ownership in comparison with the free bird the caged bird lives with darkness pain and fear, so it is basically for anyone who is feeling down, or like..... basically

Victor: do you guys think there is such a thing as freedom? Just because this poem relates to being caged up, and it talks about freedom, what do you guys think- is there such a thing as freedom?

Pete: I think there is freedom, it's just, I think freedom is really hard to achieve, especially like here, you know like with the economy, with like you know nobody is really ever free, everybody has responsibilities, everybody has to pay taxes, everybody has to go to school to get an education, to grow, but in order to grow and follow your dreams, maybe becoming an artist or a teacher, that's kind of the freedom that you look for, or being able to buy your own car or house, that is a freedom, you are able to achieve, but freedom I don't think anybody is really really free....

Jessica: yeah like even in the third part it says "the caged bird sings with a fearful thrill" so he is still kinda like afraid to be free.

Jo: yeah..

Victor: I thought is was kinda like

Jessica: That is what it kinda seems like he wants to, but he's kinda a little bit he doesn't really know what is out there

Victor: I thought that when he says that he sings that was his only freedom just singing right? Cos he is caged up and he can't really fly anywhere, he is singing

Jessica: yeah...

Victor: like he said earlier you can't really achieve freedom freedom

Jo: I think freedom is within, like everybody finds their own freedom during their free time like whatever people like to do during their free time, their freedom, so singing could be like ...

Victor: yeah,

Pete: I really liked the metaphors in this poem too

Victor and Jo: yeah

Pete: like uh, uh the fifth line "the caged bird stands on the grave of dreams, his shadow shouts on a nightmare scream?" the ways she is describing things it is really deep, I remember Ronny said one part something, oh right here "the caged bird sings of a fearful

trill of things unknown” all these ways she is describing the poem really opens up and makes you think -wow like you see the,

Victor: Yeah, you see the message

Pete: Yeah you see the message or you see where she is coming from, and the way she is describing it too..

Victor: yeah

Pete: like I underlined , “and dipped his wings in the orange sun rays” I really like that piece because she didn’t just say, “oh the bird is flying up in the air where the sun is” she is like giving a good description of like what the bird, how it looks in the sun rays it is not really dipping its wings into the sun rays, you can picture it as the bird is flying in the air and the sun hits the birds wing, so like all these little descriptions makes the poem stand out, makes it more readable, you’ll think that ‘s a good representation, that’s a good phrase, it makes you want to read more of it.

Jessica: it gives you a good visual of it

Pete: yeah visual, oh that’s the word

General laughter

Pete: what do you think it means when it says, “the caged bird stands on the grave of dreams, his shadow shouts on a nightmare scream?”

Pause students all look at the poem

Josh: like somebody died

Leah: Somebody died and he is having a dream of them?

Rose: I think he is surrounded by his nightmares, like what frightens him the most, ‘cos he (inaudible...)

Victor: What I got from that was his dreams were dead, because he was caged up, he’d probably be dreaming about like flapping his wings, but he is caged up so...and his “nightmare scream” what I got from that too, was like that.... Oh damn I lost it... erm ...

Pause

Pete: If you really look at it the first line “the caged bird stands on the grave of dreams” what I see too, is he had dreams but he can’t achieve then since he is caged up, you know, also the second part, “the shadow shouts on a nightmare scream” I think that is more like, when he is describing a shadow he is describing his inner self, that his inner self feels sad depressed, I don’t think depressed is the right word but, depressed now that it is caged up it really can’t do anything, he can’t follow the dreams, and like I said a whole bunch of times, this poem can mean anything, how many people can relate to it- how many people have had dreams, have had visions of the life and their future and that they can’t achieve

it – maybe because of family, and this does kinda relate to the story that we are reading, “Like Water for Chocolate” Tita can’t get what she wants, because she is caged up, she has to take care of her mom, so anyone who reads this poem can really relate to it, you see these phrases these parts that really pop out, you see what this poem goes for, just this “grave of dreams” people have thought that they can’t achieve their dreams, either family member, or sick, or anything, anything really can be a “dead dream”

Jo: So this poem I was reading, came from her book, the autobiography she wrote called, “I know why the caged bird sings” and it was this autobiography from when she was three, it was basically about her childhood or whatever, and how she became a mother at sixteen, and ermm, how she was challenged with racism and being a mother at a young age, and stuff like that, so I guess that is a little bit about why she wrote this poem.

Victor: (nodding) wrote this...

Victor: points at Christine- do you like this poem?

Christine: laughs

Group laughs.

Pete: I mean I like this poem because I can see myself in this poem, because a couple of years ago (clears his throat) I didn’t drop out of high school, but I left high school early, but I left only for the intention, I felt like I was stuck, I felt like I wasn’t moving anywhere, I felt like I was just wasting my time, two years later, I finally decided to go to college, when I see this phrase, the caged bird stands on the grave of dreams, that really relates to me you know, because I have dreams, and I do

(Signal goes off for end of seminar)

Pete: but during the years and the times that go I see myself getting closer to my dreams, so reading this poem, I really see my own life into it.

Leah: So I have a question, so do you think that because he childhood was messed up, and she had a daughter, and she had to focus on her daughter, and that she had to stop what she was doing to focus on her daughter,

Pete: what in this poem? Maybe.

Rose: not necessarily I think that she had to put her life on hold for her daughter – but if you want a better life for you and your child then that is what you would pursue, I guess maybe she was..

Leah: she couldn’t do it...

Rose yes

Jo: maybe she went through some stuff just to get where she, where she, before she died. She actually wrote a book so probably went through a couple of obstacles, being a young mother, before she where wanted to be in life.

Pete: You reading that biography of hers, and having a kid so early, maybe that is what she was a mother at such a young age she didn't get to do the things she wanted to.

Jo: true.

Pete: so this poem relates to her, saying I feel like a caged bird, I can't do anything, I have all these responsibilities now, and now I can't pursue the dreams that I wanted to,

Jo: that goes back to her role during slavery

Josh: what this poem?

Jo: well not slavery, but racism, all that stuff..

Rose: I gotta line that I didn't really understand it says, "the fat worm's waiting on the dawn bright lawn" I didn't really understand that.

Melissa (from the outside group) starts to answer – then put s her hand over her mouth- sorry my apologies.

Leah: which line is?

Jessica: first paragraph on the back.

Students look at the line, flip it over

Jessica: second to last sentence

Jo: I think she is saying, free birds have access to the sky, worms and all that like

Victor: freedom, sky,

Leah: I dunno at some point they

Jo: talking about the free bird

Pete: yeah she is talking about the free bird, she is basically describing people who don't have responsibilities, like what does a bird eat? Worms.

Jo: worms

Pete: so they have all this freedom to eat whatever they want,

Victor: fly wherever they want

Leah: fly around

Pete: yeah fly wherever they want, so she is describing people who don't have her responsibilities, like what she is going through right now.

Josh: inaudible

Jo: and she says the caged bird her shadow shouts on a nightmare scream while the free bird is eating worms on a sunny day.

Jo: done.

Socratic Seminar 2: “Only Daughter”—Sandra Cisneros

Rose: Like when we was reading the sentences out loud, I think it was like in paragraph 4 I was still confused after where it stated “after 4 years in college and 2 more in grad school and still no husband my father shakes his head even now and says I’d wasted all my education.” That I don’t understand where they trying to go with that.

Jessica: If in the beginning, closer at the top, I don’t know where it is, I don’t even see it, erm, it says that point of her going to school is to find a husband. Like not really more so for education, so she can find a husband so after that he is disappointed she is not married yet.

Leah: How old is she?

Jessica: She graduated college, the grad school, she’d be 29ish, I may be wrong maybe 27, 28.

Leah: And she has a daughter?

Jessica: no, she

Leah: Oh that was “caged bird”

Jessica: yeah yeah yeah, she has the daughter, she has six brothers

Victor: This was very confusing to me, because like I thought at one point they were talking about the daughter trying to get the father’s approval, and then like at one point the father was telling the kids do this, not this, I just don’t understand, I just didn’t understand what they were talking about.

Pause

Victor: Like what was the main point of the story

Jessica: I think like he’s like blue collar, what’s the – blue collar worker- is that like the lower class? He is like, when he is saying with his hands he is like a mechanic, something like that

Victor: No I understand that

Jessica: He wants them to be better than what he was.

Victor: Yeah

Jessica: To do something better than he has. If you see in one of the paragraphs, he says they had to keep leaving their houses to go somewhere else, so it is probably because he is not getting work, so he has to kinda go find another job, or he finds another job in a different area, so he doesn’t want them to have to live that type of life

Victor: yeah

Jessica: to have more structure

Leah: I have a question, so I was half asleep when we read it, so all I heard was that his wife passed away.... Did it, did she? And he is lonely, it seems like, but I think (inaudible)

Lillian: In the beginning, you know it says like oh like 7 years

Leah: It is in paragraph 42nd- and he is talking about being lonely

Lillian: It is right here- in the third paragraph

Leah: since his wife passed away he wants to have a daughter

Rose: That is the same question I had

Jessica: No that's not

Leah: This is what I am reading, but that aloneness, that loneliness, therefore....

Jessica: No that is saying she was lonely because she had six brothers,

Leah: So she was lonely

Jessica: She was the only daughter, they didn't wanna play with here because she was female

Leah: why did he want her to have a kid?

Jessica: what?

Leah: So why did he want her to get married though?

Jessica: That sounds like a cultural thing more than anything

Victor: yeah

Pete: they are Mexican right?

Jessica: hm hmm

Pete: I feel like it is just in Mexico

Jessica: it is that's why I am saying it is a culture thing

Lillian: that's rude

Laughter

Pete: In "Like water for chocolate" it is the same way too.

Murmurs of yeah

Leah: Do you think has to relate to "Like water for chocolate" this story?

Victor: Not really, it is not that strict, in like water for chocolate that is that strict

Pete: what if it is, from Like water for chocolate

Ruth: it is not from like water for chocolate

Laughter

Josh: they both was from Mexico right?

Jessica: yes

Victor: But it says the mother was American right?

Rose: In paragraph 11 he states I have seven sons, being only he has six sons and one daughter, why did he refer his daughter as a son?

Leah: err

Josh: may I say the word, cos she was probably er, er, I'm just saying

Leah: wow a dyke

Josh: you ain't have to say she was a dyke

From the outer circle Ronald raises his hand

Ronald: can I just say something, the thing is what he meant to say was, Yete mon siete hijos, which in Spanish means to have seven kids

Lillian: yeah

Ronald: but in English you would refer to it as seven sons

Jessica: seven sons, 'cos she even says that in one of the things she doesn't think that he meant to say that he meant to say he had seven children. It says it in one of these paragraphs somewhere

Victor: see that is what I meant too, she felt like the black sheep because she was left out,

Leah: oh he did he corrected himself, not seven sons, six sons and one daughter

Victor: no, no she

Victor and Jessica: she corrected him

Leah: oh

Victor: that's why she was probably like the black sheep

Josh: she just dressed like a boy, I would say,

Victor: shaking his head

Pete: why would you say that?

Josh: because she came out as a girl, but he counted her as a boy

General murmuring nah, nah

Pete and Jessica: what he meant to say was

Jessica: what Ronald said it translates into English as

Lillian and Jessica: sons

Pete: Maybe he didn't want a girl maybe that's why he wants her to get married, to

Jessica: he wants to ship her off to another man, not be responsible for her anymore

Josh: but she kinda still a girl but she dress up as a boy

Jessica: she not kinda a girl, she is a girl,

Josh: I'm just saying she dress as a boy though,

Pete: where does it say that?

Jessica: it doesn't say that, do you get it now?

Josh: yeah.

Rose: Paragraph 6 – I think the story is more deeper than just her finding a husband, like she says she wants her father to introduce her as, “my only daughter the writer, not this is my daughter she teaches,” so I just feel like she wants to take her education and skills more seriously than trying to find a husband, do you guys agree with that?

Jessica: yeah like I think she wants to make that her education is more important than the fact she is not married, because that is not the ideal life that she wants,

Leah: what she experiences

Jessica: It doesn't seem like it

Rose: another question is do you think that her father cares about her education or

Rose and Leah: just wants her to get married

Lillian: throughout the story I feel like he gives more props to the guys than the girls

Jessica: yeah because it even says, where does it say, her brother graduated from medical school, this is on the first page

Pete: page 15

Jessica: yeah, it says when he graduated from medical school he fulfilled my father's dream of study hard and use your hands, use your head instead of your hands, so like he got all the props and everything for doing that, but when she graduated, he just like alright whatever.

Lillian: yeah whatever

Pause

Willy: I have a question, is it true that everyone tries to impress their parents, like their father mainly?

Pete: no

Jessica: no

Murmuring no

Victor: I feel like that is old school.

Jessica: that is another cultural thing too,

Victor: yeah, yeah, yeah- we just focus on our education.

Pause

Jessica: if you see at the very end, the last sentence, “of all the wonderful things that happened to me last year that was the most wonderful” that is her finally, feeling accepted by him

Leah: what she do?

Jessica: she wrote the story and it was translated into Spanish and she had him read it, like the last paragraph and a half it says she sat there waiting for him to read her writings, whatever, and that he asked where can we get more copies for the relatives, that is him showing that he is accepting it, that he is actually proud of her now , and that he wants to show off that she is a writer,

Josh: I think that’s true though

Laughter

Lillian: that’s real good

Josh: I really do

(9.44)

Jessica: why?

Josh: cos he is accepting the girl over a letter that she wrote it in Spanish and that he is giving it off to her relatives, that is a real true love right there

Laughter

Josh: He is a real person for that

Jessica: good point, (inaudible) 10:03

Josh: I'm just sayin..

Jessica: No I agree with you, he finally accepted her, that is showing love, not that he didn't love her before, but now he is

Lillian: showing her

Jessica: showing her he loves her,

Pause

Rose: Like Jessica said "of all the most wonderful things that happened to me last year that was the most wonderful, so you think that he is satisfied with his, her book coming out? Or...

Jessica: I think she is more satisfied with her father, approving of her

Victor: yeah

Jessica: cos she has been writing, she's been published, but I think she is more satisfied with the fact that he is proud of her..

Victor: he likes it- yeah

Jessica: that he likes it, he could have liked it more because of the fact it is about his home country, and that she wrote things that he could relate to, cos he even says, is this so and so and she says yes, he keeps reading, so he is relating to her writing, and she even says in the thing that he doesn't write or speak great English, so he may not have really understood her writings previous to that, cos they were all in English and now that this one is translated into Spanish he can understand it,

Pete: there is one part in the story that is kind of odd if you read it, paragraph 18 it says, "there was a glass filled with milk on the bedside of the table there were several vials of pills and balled Kleenex and on the floor one black sock and a plastic urinal I didn't want to look at but I did anyways Pedro Infantante was about to burst into song and my father was laughing" I really don't understand it

Leah: It sounds like somebody overdosed or something

Pete: yeah

Jessica: well she wrote it after she said he recovered from a stroke,

Lillian: so he is probably taking meds

Jessica: so , and she said all his down time is laying horizontally, so it's like he is probably like dying,

Leah: Oh

Jessica: like if he had a stroke, he is probably like still really sick

Pete and Lillian: yeah

Leah: her dad?

Pete: yeah

Leah: so he was laughing?

Jessica: at a show, he was watching a show

Pete: ok I see it now, like in bed basically, I see it

Jessica: Did you see above that on 16 you see her family is all there for the holidays and what not, and she goes down to say he is in bed, so he might not be well enough to partake in the family stuff, so she had to go in to see him

Pete: that makes sense. I kept reading that over and over again I couldn't get it,

Jessica: In 17, right in the middle it says, although my father recovered from a stroke two years ago, he likes to spend all leisure hours horizontally and that is how I found him.

Pete: hmm,

Pause

Leah: so what was the main part of this story? I mean the main..

Lillian: the main idea?

Rose: she wanted to follow her education and her father wanted her to get married but

Jessica: that's not what she wanted

Rose: hmm

Lillian: until towards the end he finally accepted her

Leah: why didn't he like her anyways?

Victor : I don't think he didn't like her

Lillian: it's just he had more preference for his six boys than for a girl,

Pause

Jessica: do you think he accepted her more so because he was dying, or because he actually cared?

Pete: well

Jessica: cos now if I am thinking about what you said, when you read the thing, like

Lillian: practically dying

Jessica: he was practically dying

Leah: both, I think

Pete: like, like like a sense of remorse,

Jessica: yeah kind of like I was a jerk to you your whole life, I wanna at least leave on a good term with you.

Mutters of yeah yeah

Pete: dang I didn't even think about that

Jessica: I didn't til you read that paragraph out loud- laughs

Victor: wait what was that?

Jessica: when you read the paragraph about how he had a stroke and was lying in bed and what not, I was saying does it seem like he is accepting her because he is like dying, and he wants to leave on a good note instead of having her feel like she was never accepted and feel like she was never have that answered

Leah: that's good

Jessica: I don't think we have anything else

Pause

Leah: oh, oh sorry

Jessica: no no go on

Leah: so this was written about her dad the whole time? 'cos in the content it says everything she had ever written she had written for him, what you think she meant, by that question?

Willy: I think, looking at paragraph 7, everything I had ever written had been for him, to win his approval

Lillian: this is what the story, basically is about

Jessica: it is probably about her writings been more important to her than getting married.

Leah: and this whole time he didn't notice her writings? He didn't like err...

Jessica: he couldn't read them, 'cos they were all in English, like that's another part, "I know my father can't read English words, even though my father my father's only reading includes the brown-ink *Esto* sports magazine from Mexica City" it's like everything he read was all in Spanish

Pete: she never noticed that? She never assumed that maybe he didn't like it because it was English, he can't read it. It's like trying to read Japanese, you don't know, you say you don't like it.

Jessica: yeah,

Rose: at least he coulda told her how he felt or something...

Leah: Was she Spanish?

Pete: yeah

Leah: so why didn't she just like

Lillian: just translate it herself, right?

Victor: she probably did (inaudible 17.34)

Jessica: it is like the other part where it translates to my son, a lot of writings may not have been able to translate exactly to how it is being said, so he may not have understood, if it were translated.

Time up.

Socratic Seminar 3—"Chronicles of Ice"—Greta Ehrlich

Rose: I honestly wasn't paying attention when she was reading it, 'cos I was reading something else, but when I was I don't understand what the text was about- could someone tell me what's the text about?

Willy: I think, he was talking about how he travelled to, I think - Argentina, to see the polar caps melting and to see (inaudible) and how they fall, but it also builds itself back up, I think wen as fast as it falls apart throughout the climate change over the year, like go warm, I guess the accumulation rate is slowing down and now it falls apart, the whole text is about how the glaciers are melting, and (inaudible)

Rose: thank you

Jo: Well to me, I think the story just like explains what a glacier is, and the importance of it, well not the importance of it,

Jessica: it's a reason

Pete: This story does describe what a glacier is, but you know in the story he explains it like, he explains it more than a glacier, he explains how a glacier became what it is, what was the story behind the glacier. For example at the top of page 104 he is always talking about "A glacier is not static. Snow falls, accretes, and settles until finally its own weight presses it down." So basically the weight the glacier is formed, and then on the next page, the page next to it, it is explaining how the glacier has its own story, how each glacier is like millions of years old, it has history behind it, and as it melts that history fades away, that history disappears so like he is not just talking about the physicalness of the glacier

he is talking about the story to why it is there, to how it got there to why it was formed, so in a way it surprises me you could talk so much about a glacier.

Pause-

Rose: do you all know what was his purpose of that trip? Was it to encounter glaciers or was it just a regular trip?

Jessica: He was just a traveler.

Jo: yeah

Willy: I think he just wanted to go to that place and see the

Jessica: yeah if you look at the beginning, it says he is “an avid traveler, having made trips to the Himalayas, which inspired her to write *Questions on*” and it just goes on about he would travel.

Pause

Jessica: (quietly talking to person next to her) look here he was a traveler.

Willy: It also goes on about how the weather changes majorly, as the book as so much as the floods, there may not even be winters, in certain areas in the world that usually have winters during the season

Jessica: yeah also explains there how a whole season is just gone

Willy: like a never sending summer

Jessica: hmm hmm

Pause:

Jo: in a paragraph 8, he says, “A glacier is an archivist and historian. It registers every fluctuation of weather. It saves everything no matter how small or big, including pollen, dust, heavy metals, bugs, and minerals. As snow becomes firm and then ice, oxygen bubbles are trapped in the glacier, providing samples of ancient atmosphere.” So I guess like, I don’t know like they use the glaciers to capture stuff, not capture something like- have records of like a story of how things, the weather- stuff like that.

Pause

Rose clears her throat

Jessica: I feel like in paragraph fifteen it pretty much explains why our climate is changing, like everyone is worried about “empire building and profit” and it is taking away from the “biological health of our planet.”

Pause

Jessica: he was pretty much saying it is the end of the world.

Willy: He also talks about there if is a chance to fix it- but he mostly says it could be beyond repair

Jessica: hmm hmm

Pause

Jo: in paragraph 16 they have like three questions, I don't know if you all want to look at them?

Jessica: the second one he is pretty much asking why have we traded for crop living and all that for workplace stuff, instead of live off the land and all that.

Jo: what do you mean by... I understand workplace and farming and all that (inaudible)

Pause

Ruth: could you just say your question again, I couldn't hear it

Jo: about understanding workplace part, but I don't understand what you mean by ceremonial lives, what do they mean by comparing the workplace to, what has that got to do with glaciers?

Pause

Pete: I think it is because he is trying to explain how the glaciers have a history, and that history back then people didn't work in like corporate places, people lived off the land, people only used the land for crops, for like hunting and stuff, and now that we use gas and we use all this stuff that is harming the environment, it is basically saying why did we like, why did we instead of being the way we are, why did we get worse, how come we traded everything that was perfectly fine for everything else that is not fine, it is causing more harm to the earth if anything, so he is basically comparing to the glaciers and the story behind the glaciers to our lives now, I think that is kinda where it is coming from

Jessica: yeah why build more than you were living off of?

Pete: yeah

Jessica: Like you were perfectly content living on the land why did you need to go like do more to make it ...(inaudible 12.16)

Leslie: what do you guys think the writer ended the conclusion like that?- paragraph 17.

Pause

Jo: I guess he is saying like glaciers are getting warm and he kinda ended it all saying, "Perito Moreno is still calving and mving, grabbing snowflakes, stirring weather, spitting out ice water, and it makes me smile."

Pete: yeah maybe he is just basically saying yeah everything is bad, but still like

Jo: but glaciers are still beautiful

Willy: so it is not all bad just yet.

Pete: It is crazy when he says on the same page, paragraph 16- “ Is this a natural progression or a hiccup in human civilization that we’ll soon renounce?” right there he is basically saying is everything that is happening now supposed to happen? Or did we mess up somewhere? Did we mess up?

Leslie: oh yeah.

Jessica: and then it is going to go bad?

Pete: and later are we gonna regret – it is gonna be our fault that we are here now?

Jessica: huhum

Pete: that’s so – when you think about it it is pretty crazy- cos it is true like, you don’t think about it, but you see how time progresses back in the day we didn’t have phones we didn’t have computer technology and now we do, would it have been ok just to stay as we did? Nobody had phones, nobody had computers, (14min, 29 secs- inaudible) or is it good that we grew and advanced into more civilized technology based society? Maybe we could have kind of found a way to fix our situation- maybe in the future we will, and maybe it won’t be considered a hiccup that we caused global warming.

Jessica: hmm

Pause

Alarm indicates end of 15 minutes

Willy: I don’t know why but at the end of paragraph 5 he talks about two types of glaciers, there are warm glaciers and there are cold glaciers, “Cold glaciers don’t glide easily; they are fixed and frozen to rock. They move like men on stilts- all awkwardness, broken bones of sheared rock.” Why they talk about two different glaciers, I guess because of that how they form differently, he talks about cold ones are stiff and still, and warm ones slide in and move around constantly,

Pause

Jo: on paragraph 9 at the end it says, “The retreat and disappearance of glaciers- there are only...” (pause the number is 160,000) Jo doesn’t say the number and laughs- never mind I won’t read it-

Pause

Time is up.