SOCIAL MOBILITY THROUGH RURAL-URBAN MIGRATION

A CASE OF TRADITIONAL ‘MANGANIYAR AND LANGA’ DESERT TRIBES OF RAJASTHAN, INDIA

ANJALI SINGHVI

A Thesis Presented to the Faculty of Architecture and Planning
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Master of Science in Urban Planning
March 2015
Guided by: Dr. Joyce Klein Rosenthal
Reader: Kaja Kuhl
Figure 1: A group of folk artists performing at the world sufi spirit festival in Jodhpur, Rajasthan | 2014, Source: Author
“If the cause of poverty is marginalization, the cure is inclusion.”

Richard John Neuhaus.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, Professor Joyce Rosenthal, for her constructive comments on my thesis and for her on-going encouragement throughout this challenging, yet rewarding process. Secondly, I would like to thank my reader, Professor Kaja Kuhl, for her perspectives and advice and for always being an inspiration.

Many people have shaped this thesis and the most instrumental have been the Manganiyar and Langa musicians of Rajasthan. Thank you for everything and for being so enthusiastic to share your stories with me and for giving me your valuable time to answer my questions.

Last but not least, this thesis would not have been possible without the guidance and support of my family- Maa and Aman.
ABSTRACT

This research investigates the concepts and perceptions of ‘social mobility’, which can simply be described as the movement of people or a group of people within or between the social strata of the society (Sorokin, 1959), in a rarely studied context of rural-urban migration, marginalization and cultural heritage in the state of Rajasthan, India. The case study is focused on the ‘Manganiyar’ and ‘Langa’ desert tribes of Rajasthan, who belong to the traditional classes of the Rajasthani Folk music.

Additionally, it aims to understand how the cultural heritage of these tribes, help improve or not improve, the tribes’ positive movement on the ladder of social mobility, otherwise simply known as ‘upward mobility’.

Primarily, this study explores the perceptions of social and cultural mobility India, where marginalization and social stratification is still very prominent, even after 68 years of Independence. By contextualizing the age-old system of social hierarchies in India from the perspective of social mobility in lower classes of the society, this research aims to increase the understanding between policy, power, privilege and social inequality.

The research used qualitative research methods such as interviews of the migrants and qualitative data review of government policies and programs for folk artists. The results of this research show trends towards higher horizontal social mobility and also a significant positive impact on the vertical social mobility for the migrants i.e. the Manganiyar and Langa tribes that are engaged in non-traditional jobs. On the contrary, the migrants engaged in traditional jobs sometimes experience vertical social mobility after migration, but there is no upward mobility thereafter. The antithesis is found to be true in specific circumstances where indicators of social mobility are bent heavily towards income and prominence within the traditional job itself.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract (i)
Acknowledgements (iii)
List of Tables and Figures (vi)

## Chapter I. Background

1.1 Historical Context ........................................ 10
1.2 Location of research ..................................... 12
1.3 Motivation of the Study .................................. 14
1.4 Objectives and research questions.................... 14
1.5 Scope and limitations ..................................... 16
1.6 Research Benefits ......................................... 16

## Chapter II. Review of Literature

2.1 Introduction ............................................... 17
2.2 Marginalization and Migration in India: critical perspectives .................................. 18
2.3 Spatial Migration: defining the conceptual model ....................................................... 18
2.4 Role of Government and Political Context ....... 19
2.5 The Environment ........................................... 19

## Chapter III. Conceptual Framework

3.1 Key Concepts ............................................. 20

## Chapter IV. Ethnographic Overview: a study in pictures

4.1 The Manganiyar and Langat .................. 21
Chapter V. Methodology

5.1 Research Design ........................................ 30
5.2 Research Controls .................................... 31
5.3 Validity Threats and Risks ......................... 31
5.4 Methods I: Interviews ............................... 31
  5.4.1 Patterns of Social Mobility: synthesis of the interviews ...................... 37
5.5 Methods II: Data Review and Analysis ........ 46
  5.5.1 Overview of the study areas .................... 47
  5.5.2 Review of spatial data of migration for Manganiyar and Langa tribes .... 47
  5.5.3 Review of tourism data .......................... 47
  5.5.4 Review of government policies pertaining to folk artists .................. 47

Chapter VI. Discussion and Recommendations .... 49

Bibliography ..................................................... 51
Appendices ....................................................... 57

Appendix A: Interview Guide
Appendix B: Consent Forms
LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 1: A group of folk artists performing at the World Sufi Spirit Festival in Jodhpur, Rajasthan, 2012 | Source: Author

Figure 2: Pre and post-partition Map of India showing Rajasthan as a part of present day Pakistan.

Figure 3: The Thar Desert, Jaisalmer 2004 | Source: Picture by Serge Duchemin

Figure 4: Location Map: India | Source: Author

Figure 5: Map of India showing Rajasthan and its major cities | Source: Author

Figure 6: Harris Todaro model—decision to migrate (Source: Todaro, 1970). A framework of the analysis of the migration decision.

Figure 7: Preliminary Concept Map | Source: Author

Figure 8: Concept triangle diagram | Source: Author

Figure 9: Systems influencing social mobility | Source: Author

Figure 10: Manganiyar and Langa children after a musical performance at the World Sufi Spirit Festival in Jodhpur, Rajasthan | 2012 Source: Author

Figure 11: Thar Desert, Jaisalmer | Source: Author

Figure 12: A group of Langa folk musicians in Jodhpur, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 13: Thar Desert, Jaisalmer | Source: Author

Figure 14: A person playing the ‘Rawanhathha’ instrument in Jaisalmer city | Source: Author

Figure 15: A Langa with the instrument ‘Kamaicha’ in Jaisalmer city | Source: Author

Figure 16: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians performing in Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 17: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians in Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 18: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians in Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 19: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians performing in Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 20: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians performing in Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 21: A group of Manganiyar folk musicians performing in the Thar Desert of Jaisalmer, Rajasthan | Source: Author

Figure 22: The Manganiyar Seduction by Roysten Abel, Melbourne festival 2011.

Figure 23: Jodhpur city | Source: Author
Figure 24: Jodhpur city | Source: Author
Figure 25: Map: 1991 population ranges of villages and towns in Jodhpur district. (Source: Kothari, 2006)
Figure 26: Jaisalmer, Thar Desert | Source: Author
Figure 27: Jaisalmer city | Source: Author
Figure 28: Jaipur city | Source: http://www.justwalkedby.com/keyword/rajasthan/
Figure 29: Group of Manganiyars performing in Jaipur | Source: http://alankarmusicalgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/your_image4-943x345.jpg
Figure 30: Data comparison diagram between three cities | Source: Author
Figure 31: Artist colony, Jaisalmer | Source: Author
Figure 32: Map showing where musicians live and their population in Rajasthan | Source: Kothari, 2006
Figure 33: Map showing the distribution of the five major musician castes in Rajasthan | Source: Kothari, 2006
Figure 34: Manganiyar villages and their number of households in Rajasthan | Source: Kothari, 2006
Figure 35: Manganiyar villages and their number of households in Rajasthan | Source: Kothari, 2006
Figure 36: Langa villages and their number of households in Rajasthan | Source: Kothari, 2006

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Population of major cities selected for this research | Source: Census of India, 2011, *all cities are taken as their districts for the table.
Table 2: Manganiyar musicians by district | Source: Kothari, 2006
Table 3: Sarangiya Langa musicians by district | Source: Kothari, 2006
Table 4: Popularity of Main Tourist Destinations of Rajasthan (See A F Ferguson & Co – Management Consultancy Division, 2001)
1.1 Historical context

The earliest surviving evidence on the subject of human migration is as old as two million years, and can be found in the paleontology of our ancestors Homo erectus, who migrated out of Africa (Springer, 2010). If we look at the concept of human migration through Darwinism\(^1\) (Darwin 1988), some interesting overlaps can be found. One, for example, that movement of humans from one place to the other is also a by-product of the theory of natural selection. While Darwin’s natural selection only examines preservation of the genetic evolutions that are favorable to increase a human’s chances of surviving, in case of Homo erectus, more than just the scientific mutations, in my opinion there were probably some psychological adaptations too, due to the natural changes in the environment that led the Homo erectus to flee Africa. Thus, Darwin’s theory of evolution by natural selection (Darwin, 1988) appears to coincide on most points with the views expressed on Homo erectus’ migration out of Africa, especially with reference to the need for survival in both cases. However, whether it was genetic migration in Darwin’s theory of natural selection or physical out-migration of the Homo erectus, it is evident that in both cases migration in some form or the other has been an essential attribute to the survival and evolution of human species. Similar to migration, the concept of social mobility is also decades old, for example, “in the Old Testament; historians have depicted the rise of men of new classes to positions of economic and political power (Miller, 1960)”

Thousands of years ago, the present Rajasthan state in India was part of the Indus valley civilization in the northwestern part of the Indian subcontinent, comprising of major urban centers like Sindh, Punjab and Rajputana, which later on dissolved into present day Pakistan and India (Khan, 2014) after the 1947 partition (Figure 1). These northwestern pre-partition bordering states were exceedingly rich in their own musical cultures and traditions. Consequently, there was cross-border migration of musical cultures, to which present-day Rajasthan owes its folk musical influence.

Belonging to this folk discipline of the Rajasthani music, are two communities of hereditary Muslim musicians called the “Manganiyar” and the “Langa”, whose ancestors have been instrumental in shaping the folk music of Rajasthan, as we know now (Ayyagari, 2012).

These musician tribes can be identified with the minority group and the scheduled caste/tribes\(^2\) of India. Ethnomusicologist Victoria Lindsay noted during her research in India that, in the hinterlands of the desert state of Rajasthan, Manganiyar musicians were the lowest of the low in the village hierarchy (Lindsay, Victoria, 2015), despite being one of the two original ‘gharanas’ (musical classes) of Rajasthani folk music.

---

\(^1\) A theory that inherent dynamic forces allow only the fittest persons or organizations to prosper in a competitive environment or situation (Darwinism, 2016)

\(^2\) The use of the term ‘scheduled tribes’ here is in context of the official designation given to various groups of historically disadvantaged people in India (Schedule Caste Welfare, 2012)
There is evidence that the marginalization (pg. 11) of these professional Muslim musicians of Rajasthan (Manganiyar and Langa) is not something new and they’ve always been considered as one of the lower classes of the society and continue to be marginalized, at both economic and social levels (Bharucha, 2003), even 70 years after independence. This also speaks of the prevalence of the Caste system in India that divides groups of people based on the level of the social rank they were born into.

There is a popular saying in the rural parts of Rajasthan that for a true Rajasthani, the actual wealth is the wealth of tradition and not wealth in monetary terms. However, for the Manganiyar and Langa tribes, this unusual nature of wealth does not always help them improve their social status in the society and in fact, the traditional and orthodox values they so firmly believe in can prove rather damaging to their social mobility as seen in the case of Langas from Jodhpur (pg. 47). These musician communities, originally belonging to the rural part of the state first began to migrate from their villages to the urban areas about a hundred years ago, and have been migrating since, essentially as a means to earn money and improve their social status. According to one definition by the United Nations (UN), migration is defined as a “form of geographical or spatial mobility involving a change of usual residence between clearly defined geographic units.” The usual residence is further defined as “the place at which the person lives at the time of the census, and has been there for some time or intends to stay there for some time (UN, 2014).”

Now bringing new to the old philosophies, let’s trace back this rural-urban migration in India. Migration from rural to urban centers has been going on in India since its independence in 1947. However, the phenomenon reached its peak during the early 2000’s, when India saw a colossal hike in the number of incoming migrants in the major urban city centers like, Mumbai, Delhi, and Bangalore etc. According to the 2001 Census of India, rural to urban migration during the year 1961-1971 was 18.7 percent, which increased to 19.6 percent in 1971-81 and to 21.0 percent in 1991-01. The rural to urban migration in Rajasthan during 1999-2001, taken as a percentage of the total urban population was 6.18, which was moderately high compared to other bordering states like Gujarat and Madhya Pradesh. (2001 Census of India, Migration tables). This particular migration was a response to not only better employment opportunities, but also to a desire of improving social standing and thus moving towards a better quality of life. In some regions of India, three out of four households include a migrant (Srivastava, 2003).

---

2 Caste system in India is a kind of social organization system that divides a group of people based on the level of social rank they were born into. For e.g. A son of a barber (usually ranked as a lower-income caste in India) will automatically be categorized and labeled as his father’s caste and given the same advantages/disadvantages and social treatments in the civil society pertaining to his caste.

4 Vertical and Horizontal social mobility explained at page 10.
1.2 Location | Context for research

The regional context for this research is the desert state of Rajasthan (Figure 2) located on the northwestern part of India (Figure 3). It is the largest state by area in India and is often listed as one of the most popular tourist destinations in the country for domestic as well as international tourists. According to the Lonely Planet, “every third foreign tourist visiting India also travels to Rajasthan, as it is a part of the Golden Triangle [New Delhi, Agra, Jaipur] for tourists visiting India” (Singh, 2002). Tourism itself accounts for eight percent of the state’s domestic product (“Visting Rajasthan”, 2015).

The map in Figure 4 illustrates some of the major cities of Rajasthan, namely the capital city Jaipur, Jaisalmer, Jodhpur and Udaipur. The traditional music of Rajasthan is said to have originated from the rural parts of the above-mentioned cities long before the India-Pakistan partition took place. Due to being located close to the Pakistan border, Rajasthan’s traditional music shares a lot of similarities from the other side of border as well, namely from the Pakistani province of Sindh (Kothari, Komal, 1972).
Figure 4: Location Map: India | Source: Author

Figure 5: Map of India showing Rajasthan and its major cities | Source: Author
1.3 Motivation of the study

This thesis is inspired by curious observations of the phenomenon of migration in marginalized communities of Manganiyars and Langas in Rajasthan, India. It primarily aims to investigate the role of rural-urban migration in altering the social mobility of the traditional and ethnic group of ‘Manganiyar and Langa’ tribes in Rajasthan. These two ethnic groups are famous for their unique and innate talent of singing Rajasthani folk music and they represent the two traditional classes of musicians in Rajasthan, India. This study is grounded on the premise that certain key indicators can contribute towards increasing or decreasing the social mobility of these migrant groups. Examples of some of these indicators are income, land ownership, type of employment, government interventions etc. It also intends to highlight the conditions under which this migration takes place and more importantly, to what extent does it contribute (or not) to the economic development of the city especially in terms of tourism in Rajasthan, which is the state with the highest foreign tourism in India. While the research aims to draw upon mostly from primary sources including interviews, recordings and observations, it also aims to discover the visual evidence of the rural-urban migration using secondary data sources like government data including migration tables, spatial data for the region and state of Rajasthan etc.

A second part of the research involves spatially studying the patterns of migration from the of these tribes, and overlapping layers of major environmental events such as droughts in the origin location of migration, thus, further analyzing if factors of environmental turbulence may have interacted with the laws of migration and social mobility.

The purpose of this research is also to learn more about marginalization and social mobility in the unprivileged classes of Indian society through a case study of musician tribes of Rajasthan. For decades, the social division of classes and stratification has been inherently imbued within the deepest roots of the Indian civil and social system. The Indian social stratification or the caste-system is unlike any other in the world, because of its roots in the extremely rich and strict culture of India, while at the same time having its origins in the British colonization (Desai, 2005). This research aims to explore the phenomenon of social mobility, and what it translates into, in one of the most talented, yet low-income and low-status communities of Rajasthan, India. Ultimately, the purpose is to understand the role of rural-urban migration as a process or factor of improving social mobility in these desert tribes of Rajasthan.

1.4 Objectives and Research Questions

The theoretical foundations and literature review suggest several questions regarding the relationship between social mobility and rural-urban migration. After the migration to urban areas, would the Manganiyar and Langa tribes of Rajasthan undertaking rural-urban migration and engaged in traditional occupations, such as music, dance etc., show a significantly greater decrease in their social mobility in comparison to the group belonging to the same tribe but involved in different occupations such as construction work etc.? Consequently, are social mobility and rural-urban migration positively associated?

In order to answer the above-mentioned questions, the present investigation was undertaken with the following objectives:

To study the relationship between the rural-urban migration and social mobility among the desert tribes of Rajasthan in the context of various indicators such as income, type of employment, permanence of migration, land ownership etc., and also to look at the substance of marginalization and its relationship with economic development in terms of tourism.

The following research question was addressed to achieve the objectives mentioned above:

Research Question:

How does rural-urban migration affect social mobility within the rural tribes of Rajasthan?

The following hypothesis was formulated based on the research question:

i) The group consisting of traditional tribes undertaking rural-urban migration and engaged in traditional or culture-related occupation such as folk music will show a significantly greater decrease in their social mobility in comparison to the group belonging to the same tribe, but engaged in non-traditional and non-cultural occupations such as construction work etc. post-migration.

5 Traditional: The meaning of the term ‘tradition’ used here is in context of a belief that is passed down within generations of people having a symbolic meaning or significance (Thomas, 1997).
Operational Definitions of Variables:

Since the terms used in the research, ‘social mobility’, ‘migration’ etc. are highly complex and require detailed explanations, therefore, for the purpose of this research a perspective on each concept is addressed, which is grounded in the theories of these concepts already published, such as the United Nations definition of migration. Therefore, the positive or negative relationships between these concepts are based on these explanations and definitions mentioned below.

Operational definitions used in this research:

  Social Mobility: Russian-American sociologist Sorokin (1959) was one of the first researchers to study and define the concept of social mobility. He defined social mobility as “any transition of an individual or social object or value, from one social position to another”, where social position is usually explained in terms of an individual’s income and occupation.

  Further, he described horizontal social mobility as shifting of an individual or a group of individuals from one social group to another, both of which being on the same level, for example two individuals with similar occupations or similar incomes. Lastly, he described vertical social mobility as the movement from one social stratum to another, not necessarily on the same level, and usually defined in terms of income and occupation (Sorokin 1959).

  On the other hand, according to Mabogunje (2010), there is also a “socioeconomic [or vertical] dimension of the movement other than the spatial (horizontal) one, while undertaking rural-urban migration. He further describes the vertical dimension involving a permanent transformation of skills, attitudes, motivations, and behavioral patterns”.

  Perhaps, it’s most useful to define social mobility in terms of income and employment, as has been done by various scholars (Sorokin 1959; Miller, 1960). However, there are several other indicators that can help us assess an individual’s social mobility. For instance, “upward mobility can be related to changes in residential location within the city (Mabogunje, 2010)”.

  From the analysis of the several interviews conducted, it was seen that social mobility for a marginalized population, or the perception of social mobility for a marginalized population could depend greatly on factors such as Education, Government support, Access to job opportunities etc. More specifically, the above-mentioned factors were responsible for a trend towards upward mobility for a marginalized individual, namely the Manganiyars and Langas in this study.

Similarly, other indicators were responsible for showing a trend towards a decrease, or no improvement in social mobility of the individual. Examples of such indicators are: Caste, Location and Orthodox cultural and religious values (such as willingness to switch the profession).

  Therefore, social mobility for an individual or a group of individual can be defined using an amalgamation of both types of indicators discussed above, a) those responsible for upward mobility and b) those responsible for lower social mobility or no improvement in the social mobility.

     Rural-Urban Migration: Migration is defined by the United Nations (UN) as a “form of geographical or spatial mobility involving a change of usual residence between clearly defined geographic units.” The usual residence is further defined as “the place at which the person lives at the time of the census, and has been there for some time or intends to stay there for some time (UN, 2014).” Similarly rural-urban migration can be defined as the movement from a rural (usual) residence to an urban-residence.

     Marginalization: According to one definition, marginalization is defined as “the process through which persons are peripheralized on the basis of their identities, associations, experiences and environments”. Marginality is further defined as “the condition of being peripheralized on these bases” (Hall, 1994).
1.5 Scope and Limitations

With the limitations of the research methods addressed later in the report, it is important to set forth here the scope and limitations for the study as a whole. Firstly, the research is limited to the concept of marginalization looked at from the Indian perspective and the Indian civil and social structures, such as the caste-system\(^6\) and reservation system\(^7\). This thesis is about studying the phenomenon of social mobility of a marginalized individual or a group of individuals belonging to the ‘Manganiyar’ or ‘Langa’ community, with respect to their musical skills; tourism in the state of Rajasthan; role of public and private sector initiatives; and factors influencing social mobility, such as income, housing etc. A thorough analysis of such factors that can influence their social mobility post rural-urban migration is therefore conducted.

The Manganiyar and Langa are both exclusively hereditary communities who make their livings [sic] as musical performers and genealogists for higher-caste patrons [Growing into Music, 2016]. They are a community of folk musicians and artists who originally inhabit the rural parts of Rajasthan and migrate to the urban areas in search of better opportunities.

Therefore, the boundaries of this research remain in the geographical areas, to where these communities of folk musicians have migrated from their villages of original residence.

At its core, this study questions the social inequalities and prejudices associated with the term ‘traditional’\(^8\) in India. This also leads to inquiring into the perceptions and the very existence or lack thereof, of the concept of social mobility for a marginalized population.

Thereby, this research tries to understand the complex relationships between policies, power, privilege and folk music. However, it is directed more towards the qualitative aspects of social mobility than the quantitative and statistical aspects, e.g. analyzing mobility tables. It also investigates concepts like fame and competition within these two communities of singers in the common geography of rural-urban migration.\(^9\) The research also takes into account the cultural and religious biases, shown by the subjects of this study (the tribes of Rajasthan), when it comes to the discussion of the key concept of social mobility.

As explained above, there are many complexities in the examination of social mobility of this kind; therefore, this thesis is not only about proposing planning policies to advance the social status of folk musicians, but the intention of this study is also to get a deeper understanding of the culture of the ‘traditional marginalization’\(^11\) in India which in its own unique way hinders the upward mobility for any marginalized population.

Lastly, this research is a culmination of a fieldwork project including numerous interviews, observations and discussions, the idea for which first came into existence when the researcher attended a music festival in Jodhpur\(^12\) three years ago, where these incredible folk musicians had performed.

1.6 Research Benefits

The research will be beneficial to professionals in the planning practice who study the phenomenon of human migration from rural to urban areas and the concepts of social stratification in Southwest Asia. It will also be resourceful to people interested in studying social mobility and migration within the context of the ethnomusicology of the Rajasthani folk music propagated by the famous Manganiyar and Langa tribes.

The present research can also serve as a valuable pilot study in the field of marginalization and social inequalities associated with it, which can further give direction to a larger and more comprehensive study in the future.

\(6\) Caste system in India is a kind of social organization system that divides a group of people based on the level of social rank they were born into. For e.g. A son of a barber (usually ranked as a lower-income caste in India) will automatically be categorized and labeled as his father’s caste and given the same advantages/disadvantages and social treatments in the civil society pertaining to his caste.

\(7\) Reservation system of India, which is essentially built upon the caste system described above, is the process or action where the Government reserves a percentage of seats in public and private sectors of education, employment, etc. for the marginalized classes. Apart from the quota of caste-based reservation, it also includes various kinds of subsidies to the economically and educationally disadvantaged people of the society. These disadvantaged people are divided into categories based on their castes defined by the Government of India, such as Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), Other Backward Classes (OBC), etc. To the present date, reservation system continues to be practiced in contemporary India.

\(8\) For instance, there is wage discrimination by the organizers of a music festival, because the performers are uneducated and unable to negotiate, and most importantly because they are folk singers, hence automatically considered uneducated and backward.

\(9\) There is a competition between the two groups for grabbing musical programs and shows etc., since both communities have common ancestors and essentially belong to the same profession of folk music and culture.

\(10\) Both Manganiyar and Langa are Muslims and hence do not allow their women to work outside of their homes or participate in singing/performing in public, and even though both tribes mainly have Hindu patrons and many times use devotional song lyrics for the Hindu Gods such as Lord Krishna, Lord Ganesha etc.

\(11\) Explained at page 10.

\(12\) World Sufi Spirit Festival, 2012, Jodhpur, Rajasthan, India—now known as the World Sacred Spirit Festival http://worldsacredspiritfestival.org/
CHAPTER II: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

2.1 Introduction

Migration is defined by the United Nations as a “form of geographical or spatial mobility involving a change of usual residence between clearly defined geographic units.” The usual residence is further defined as “the place at which the person lives at the time of the census, and has been there for some time or intends to stay there for some time (UN, 2014).” Similarly rural-urban migration can be defined as the movement from a rural (usual) residence to an urban-residence or simply as the movement of people from rural areas to urban centers.

Frequently, rural-urban migration has been analogous with either economic growth or employment/income patterns (Harris and Todaro, 1970; Roe and Saracoglu, 2004; Hugo, 2012). However, less has been written about migration from the perspective of the social mobility of the migrants post-migration (Srivastava, 2003; Dineshappa and Sreenivasa, 2014, Bock and Iutaka, 1969). Moreover, throughout many developing economies of the world, the relevance of this phenomenon of internal migration has not been adequately considered (Srivastava, 2003) given the fact that migration has indefinitely been the biggest contributor to rapid urbanization in developing countries such as India and China (Mazumdar, 2008). For example, the migration of rural labor to urban areas in China since the mid-1980s has created the largest labor flow in world history (Zhao, 1999). As Todaro has put it, “The significance of the migration phenomenon in most developing countries is not necessarily in the process itself or even in its effect on the sectoral allocation of human resources. It is in the context of its implications for economic growth in general and for the “character” of that growth, particularly its distributional manifestations” (Todaro, 1980).

Widely talked about in the developing literature on rural-urban migration are two famous theories, a) Harris and Todaro model developed in 1970 (Todaro, 1970) and b) push and pull hypothesis for migration, where example of a push factor is unemployment, and pull factor is demand for labor etc. (Heberle, 1938).

Both these models have been elaborated to a great extent to take into account explanations of why people migrate and to what distance do they migrate. For example, Harris and Todaro 1970 model (figure 6) depicts a detailed framework with multiple factors influencing a migrant’s decision to migrate, many of which are either capital based or value based e.g. urban income, costs of migration etc.
However, what hasn’t been given enough attention is the question of what happens to the migrants in terms of their social mobility after they’ve moved from their rural origins (Waldinger and Lichter, 2003). What is the condition of their social status in the places they have migrated to? Alternatively, is there an improvement or lack thereof in their social status after migration from rural to urban areas? (Water, 1994; UNESCO, 2013). According to McCatty, (2004), “people from rural areas may rise to positions of affluence that were previously thought to belong to other levels of the society” after migrating to urban areas, however, what are the determinants for this rise in position for the migrant and what is the permanence of this movement? These are some of the gaps in the existing literature that need to be filled. Although these models were written exclusively for developing countries, their concepts have been fairly applied to some migration scenarios of developed countries as well.

### 2.2 Marginalization and Migration in India: critical perspectives

Migration is intimately connected with marginalization especially in the rural parts of India, where the term “backward” is the official terminology used by the government, (Akbar, 2006) for the communities deemed as economically and socially backward. This causes the migrants to live a life of limited social mobility, as the communities feel restrained that they’re born into a socially backward class. However, in effect is also the age-old reservation system in India for these “backward” classes of people, that provide reservations in various economic sectors of the society, but whose provisions have continued to be greatly misused and misjudged (Kausar, 2015). Comparing the ‘Reservation System’ of India to the ‘Hukou System’ or the household registration system in China urges to think about the complexities of policy design and its implications on social mobility and migration. Although the inverterate question of ‘how marginalized are these communities?’ lacks certain protracted data, nevertheless this is an important factor essential for anyone studying migration and measuring its social costs and externalities in the less developed parts of the world. According to a UNESCO report for the International Consultative Forum of Education for All (EFA Forum) “Marginalization occurs when people are systematically excluded from meaningful participation in economic, social, political, cultural and other forms of human activity in their communities and thus are denied the opportunity to fulfill themselves as human beings” (UNESCO, 2000). However, in the context of the folk musicians of the great Thar Desert, marginalization is not solely a result of exclusion, rather it pertains to a more stigmatized view of the meaning of the term ‘traditional’.

‘Traditional’ is automatically designated as “backward” even in modern India. While the prejudices against traditional or folk originate from the ‘caste system’ (pg. 11) mentioned earlier, there is an obvious misunderstanding of about why these prejudices continue to exist. For instance, in many of the nineteenth and twentieth-century ethnographic works based on cultural ideologies from both colonial and postmodern perspectives, “dancers were considered prostitutes, musicians were believed to be illiterates, and folk performances were just “simple” in the way of all regard for “primitive” cultures at the time” (Erdman, 2007) because they belonged to the lower classes of the society, but also because they were simply more ‘traditional’, and hence considered a lower caste by the so-called less traditional folks. Thus, even when there is social inclusion, it does not necessarily attest a higher social status in this context. This paradox arises because of the stigma associated with the cultural or traditional identities of a group of people.

### 2.3 Spatial Migration: defining the conceptual model

Rural-urban migration also represents an essentially spatial component of the economic development of a region. The social movement of people is typically in both horizontal as well as vertical dimensions, where horizontal dimension represents the spatial movement from one place to another, and vertical dimension involves movement within the social strata of the society, broadly termed as the social mobility (Sorokin, 1959; Miller 1960). It can be reasoned that the lines of argument in the scope of most of the research done on rural-urban migration hasn’t considered the phenomenon as a spatial and dynamic process, but an economic one. To understand the cause-effect relationship of migration, it soon becomes significant to construct a spatial conceptual framework within which this migration operates. Early theories on migration such as the Zipf’s law (Zipf, 1946) have been quite unanimous in suggesting that the distance and direction of the movement determines the destination of the movement and the rate of migration decreases with the increase in the distance to the urban area. However, to understand the ‘vertical’ aspect of the rural-urban migration, it is imperative to understand the general patterns of the complex behavior of an individual migrant spatially. Also, for purposes of comparison in space and time, the results should be quantified and mapped into their spatial correlations. For the Manganiyar and Langa desert tribes of Rajasthan, the nature of the rural-urban migration is more unique and interesting to map spatially because there is no permanence of migration.

---

14 *Hukou System*: Hukou system is a household registration system in China, which requires a person to register his family records of identification. It is a system that officiates a person as a resident of that particular area where the registration is made. “Because of its entrenchment of social strata, especially as between rural and urban residency status, the Hukou system is often regarded as a form of caste system” (Perry, 2006).

---

18
2.4 Role of the Government and Political Context

The role of a governing body in India has been extremely crucial in defining marginalization. Even before the British Raj came into power, some "Indian regimes had actively enforced the privileges and disabilities of various castes" (Galanter, 1963), and there is evidence of similar discrimination during the British rule as well. It is interesting to note here though the evolution of how the governing power shifted from the 'caste' itself to a higher body of law. During the later years of the British rule in India around 1850s, "the core of caste autonomy consisted in the power of a caste to make rules for itself and to constitute tribunals to enforce these rules; the decisions of these tribunals would not be disturbed by the government" [Galanter, 1963]. However, in post-independence (1947) Modern India, the boundaries of power changed when the new constitution was enacted. Although the new constitution abolished acts such as 'untouchability', it failed to take control of the local prejudices and alter the rules that the castes held for them. For example, some castes did not allow and consider it a taboo for women to participate in any form of work outside of their homes. Their male counterparts held the domain for that. Similar instances can be seen in the Manganiyar and Langa desert tribes of the Muslim caste, who still consider it a taboo for women to work beyond the boundaries of their households, several years after the new constitution. This resistance to modernism has therefore attested to the wide gaps between marginalization and upward mobility. In the context of this gap regarding the caste-based marginalization in India, emergence of several non-profit organizations promoting the folk and traditional music culture can be seen.

There is enough evidence to say that the “Caste-based/factional, intra-class, and other intra-rural conflicts cut across and involve both urban and rural areas, and influence political attitudes toward economic policies, global trade, and spatial planning” [Parthasarathy, 2012]. However, whether it’s the caste-based reservation system or the decade old cultural biases and prejudices against a caste, the political system affects the quality of life and social rank of these migrants after they migrate from rural to urban areas, and cannot be left from the equation while studying rural-urban migration of low-income communities in India.

2.5 The Environment

Assessing the evidence of migration has shown us the guaranteed adverse effects of migration on our environment. Not only in terms of physical environmental disturbances such as pressure on land, common renewable resources etc., but also biological effects, for example, health risks. Even though, the environmental dimension of migration doesn’t seem to be the priority in many researches on migration, where the focus is in fact more on political and economical aspects, it is imperative to study the consequences of the footprint of human migration on the environment. For simplicity’s sake, there are two kinds of relationships that can be drawn between migration and environment. First, the impact of migration on the environment, and second the migration as a result of environmental factors. Both are equally demonstrative of being crucial in different scenarios in the developing world. However, in context of these relationships, the links between rural-urban migration specifically and the environment have not been adequately studied. “Migration has always been one of the ways in which people have chosen to adapt to changing environments and escape the environmentally degraded areas” (Laczko, 2009). Moreover, the accelerating rate of environmental change certainly increases the interrelationship between migration and the environment and hence, it is important not to view environment and any kind of migration as isolated from one another; but rather as interdependent variables.

There is enough evidence to say that the “Caste-based/factional, intra-class, and other intra-rural conflicts cut across and involve both urban and rural areas, and influence political attitudes toward economic policies, global trade, and spatial planning” [Parthasarathy, 2012]. However, whether it’s the caste-based reservation system or the decade old cultural biases and prejudices against a caste, the political system affects the quality of life and social rank of these migrants after they migrate from rural to urban areas, and cannot be left from the equation while studying rural-urban migration of low-income communities in India.

2 "Untouchability is the avoidance of physical contact with persons and things because of beliefs relating to ritual purity and pollution. It is an intrinsic feature of the Hindu caste system" (Shaft, 2006). Untouchability is no longer practiced in India.
CHAPTER III: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

3.1 Key Concepts

The conceptual framework for this research was built upon the literature review, experiential knowledge and the preliminary studies already done in this field of study.

A few theories evolving from this kind of framework have been illustrated in the figure 7 below. The guiding principle behind the main theory for this research was the interrelationship between rural-urban migrations, marginalization and social mobility, all looked through the filter of tradition and culture in India. An ethnographic study of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes was conducted to gain experiential knowledge about the tribes’ own perceptions of social mobility. However, there were limitations of observations during the ethnographic study due to the Hawthorne effect or the observer effect, according to which the act of observing something changes it [Fox, 2008].
CHAPTER IV: ETHNOGRAPHIC OVERVIEW

A study in pictures

4.1 The Manganiyar and Langa

The state of Rajasthan in India is the largest by area, and consists of two distinct geographic areas: “the Thar Desert in the west and north, characterized by frequent famines, scanty rainfall, and sparse population; and the hilly, forested, fertile land to the south and east” (Arnold, 2000). Music is an essential part of the daily life of a Rajasthani, mostly used for “mundane entertainment, for sacred devotional offerings to the gods and ancestors, for welcoming seasonal changes” (Arnold, 2000). According to the famous folklorist Komal Kothari who has worked very closely for over a decade with the Manganiyar, Langa and other musician tribes of Rajasthan, the reason for music being so integral to the people of Rajasthan is due to the long dry months of the harsh desert summer, where farmers don’t have enough farming work to do (Kothari, 1972).

“Many of the twenty-six districts making up modern-day Rajasthan were once princely states that provided the main source of patronage for the arts. The courts of the rajas of Bikaner, Jodhpur, and Udaipur were homes for many performers, but the most impressive and serious patrons were the rajas of Jaipur. For the several hundred years preceding India’s independence in 1947, these kings employed professional musicians of both sexes and from both Muslim and Hindu backgrounds in the famed Gunjikhana ‘Department of Virtuosos’ (Erdman 1985:82). Thus they supported generations of hereditary musicians, vocal artists, and dancers who were expected to perform in the court and in the adjoining temples as well as in royal processions.” (Arnold, 2000)

However, as the princely states dissolved and the rulers of Rajasthan lost their power, with it was lost the culture of the royal musical patronage.

“Rajasthan has an elaborate system of professional musician groups that pass down their traditions orally to younger generations within their own caste. Some of these communities are sedentary, receiving regular patronage for their services and performances from local nobility. The Manganihars, Langas, Dhadhis, and Dhols are four such performance communities in the western desert regions; in accordance with the jajmani system, they provide musical services to the feudal lords, usually Rajput families. Other entertainers are migratory, traveling from Marwar to the more affluent eastern regions in search of new patrons and performance opportunities.” (Arnold, 2000)

As mentioned above, Manganiyar and Langa have predominantly been migratory tribes mainly because of their music and because of their need for finding new patrons for their folk music. However, it is evident from the interviews conducted for this study that in modern India, more than looking for patronage, these tribes migrate to provide a better quality of life to their families and thus achieve a greater social status.
The Langa musician community is believed to have migrated from Sindh (now in Pakistan), and call themselves Sindhi Sipahi and is fluent in playing the instrument ‘Sindhi Sarangi’ and ‘Khartal’. The word Manganiyars, originates form the term “Manganihar”, literally meaning, “to beg”, and indicates low social status (Arnold, 2000). The Manganiyar community plays the instrument ‘Rawanhattha’ and ‘Khartal’ (figure 14 & 15).

The main difference between the Manganiyar and Langa tribes is that they both serve different patrons. The Manganiyars serve mainly Hindu patrons and the Langas serve the Muslims. However, it seems that this trend is now changing as both the communities perform for a vast audience regionally, nationally and even abroad. Both the tribes have similar singing styles, including devotional songs and improvised old Rajasthani folk songs.

While it is common knowledge that there is a clear distinction between folk and classical musical styles in Rajasthan, some musicians during this research have claimed that, “the classical music originated from the folk styles that they perform”. It is important to note here that there is an increasing bias for classical music being more superior for folk music in India, (Ayyagari, 2012), the reason that it requires more formal training. The Manganiyars in Jaisalmer have migrated from villages near Barmer district, and the Langas in Jodhpur have migrated from their village Barnawa in the Barmer district in Rajasthan.
Figure 14: A person playing the ‘Rawanhathha’ instrument in Jaisalmer city [Source: Author]
Figure 15: A Lango with the instrument 'Kamaicha' in Jaisalmer city. [Source: Author]
Figure 16: A group of tanga folk musicians performing in Jodhpur, Rajasthan| Source: Author

Figure 17: A group of tanga folk musicians in Jodhpur, Rajasthan| Source: Author
Figure 22: The Manganiyar Seduction by Roysten Abel, Melbourne festival 2011.
CHAPTER V: METHODOLOGY

5.1 Research Design

The research design and methods used in this study follow a qualitative approach, using qualitative data review and analysis. The research is conducted in two parts: I) Understanding different perceptions of social mobility of the folk musician migrants based on the interviews of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes in Rajasthan and, II) qualitative review of data such as demographics, tourism rates, government policies etc. specific to the area of migration. The reason for selecting a qualitative assessment approach is to balance out the biases given by the migrants in the study involving interviews of the migrants, and also to look at the broader perspective of rural-urban migration by including quantitative data about these migrants.

Qualitative research design:

I) Interviews

The qualitative approach used for the interviews is partly observational and partly participatory. The intention is to study the culture of migration with the members of the communities of the ethnic groups Manganiyar and Langa, to understand their perceptions on social mobility and migration. The interviews follow both structured and unstructured interviews with the subjects of the study. The language of the interview depends on what the subject is familiar and comfortable conversing in, whether it is Hindi or English. Primarily, the interviews were conducted with two categories of migrants who have migrated from rural to urban areas, a) migrants engaged in traditional occupations and b) migrants engaged in non-traditional occupations.

A total of 15-30 migrants in each category were interviewed in three cities around Rajasthan: Jodhpur, Jaisalmer and Jaipur. The interviewees were provided with a consent form at the beginning of the interview and the combined interview responses were then translated (from Hindi to English) and coded accordingly. Other interactions with the subjects included observations during their musical performances in the cities mentioned above. Some examples of non-traditional occupations as observed from the interviews include, construction worker, day laborer, waiter, painter etc.

II) Qualitative Analysis

Since the process of migration is inherently spatially dependent, the first part focuses on gathering data related to the patterns of migration of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes using demographic and literacy data from the 2011 Census of India, migration tables and other sources such as the National Sample Survey of India, 65th round. This also includes collecting and overlapping layers of data for major environmental events such as droughts etc., specific to the location of origin of the migrants. The purpose is to qualitatively assess if factors of environmental disaster and turbulence are spatially associated with migration and social mobility.

The second part of the study includes a) data of tourism to contextualize the influences of traditional folk music on the demand for tourism and consequently the economic development in the state and the country and b) reviewing government policies that influence social mobility of the folk musicians in Rajasthan.
5.2 Research Controls

For the purpose of this study, only the male demographic variable was considered for qualitative analysis because of the availability of the sample variable. However, female subjects were included in some aspects of the qualitative study such as video recordings, images etc.

5.3 Validity Threats and Risks

Since the context for this study is specific to the conditions of rural-urban migration of the Manganiyar and Langa musicians of Rajasthan, it may not be possible to entirely generalize the findings of this study in other settings, contexts and populations that are experiencing rural to urban migration. Since income is a crucial indicator in assessing social mobility in this study, questions about income were asked in the interviews. Therefore, in terms of anticipated risks, there is a chance of invasion of privacy involved in participating. To minimize this the subjects were informed at the beginning of the interview that they could choose whether or not to disclose information about their income. Care was taken to obtain informed consent and protect the confidentiality of the participants to minimize risks in the research. Personal information in this research such as names was only recorded with consent, and when given voluntarily. Images and recordings produced during the research were all taken after the participants signed the consent form.

5.4 Methods I: Interviews

5.4.1 Overview of the study areas

For the three cities selected for this research, rural vs. urban rates of population were calculated using the raw population data from the 2011 Census of India. Below is a table showing the different population rates for all the three cities. Jaisalmer has the highest rural population with 86.71%, followed by Jodhpur and Jaipur.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>JODHPUR</th>
<th>JAISALMER</th>
<th>JAIPUR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>65.70 %</td>
<td>86.71 %</td>
<td>47.60 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>34.30 %</td>
<td>13.29 %</td>
<td>52.40 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Population of major cities selected for this research | Source: Census of India, 2011. *All cities are taken as their districts for the table above.
I. Jaipur

Figure 23: Jodhpur city | Source: Author

Figure 23: Jodhpur city | Source: Author
Jodhpur city also known as the ‘blue city’ is one of the most popular tourist destinations in Rajasthan. The map above shows the population of various villages and towns in the Jodhpur district, which is home to nearly 66% of the population in the district. The landscape of the city is semi-arid with scarce vegetation characteristics, and the city is subject to frequent droughts and water cuts. Jodhpur city shares its border with Jaisalmer, Barmer, Pali, and Nagaur. Out of the two tribes in focus, the Langas migrate to Jodhpur city more than the Manganiyars, from their villages in the Barmer district. They are also the most prominent folk musician communities in Jodhpur. The map below shows the five major musician castes of Jodhpur and where they are located. Other musician communities present in Jodhpur are Dhadhi and Dholi. The subjects interviewed in Jodhpur for this research belonged to the Langa musician caste.
II. Jaisalmer

Figure 26: Jaisalmer, Thar Desert | Source: Author

Figure 27: Jaisalmer city | Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Source: Census of India, 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy rate</th>
<th>Source: Census of India, 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>51.83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>78.95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jaisalmer is the least populated district in Rajasthan with only 1.3% of the population living in the urban areas. The reason behind this low urban population is said to be the recurring famines and droughts that cause people to move out of this city (Kothari, 2006). The Map above shows the number and location of villages in Jaisalmer, including their populations. It has an extreme hot and dry climate, with little vegetation. A large part of this city is part of the great Thar Desert. It is also known as the golden city and it shares its borders with Pakistan.

The main professional musician caste found in Jaisalmer is the ‘Manganiyar’. They form the largest musician community in Jaisalmer.

“The Manganiyar are Muslim by religion but their social organization nevertheless follows the basic Rajput pattern for Western Rajasthan. The caste is divided into exogamous sub-castes comprised of agnatic descendants, which are, typically, nominally coupled with standard names indicating connection with patron, place or Rajput descent. Some Manganiyar practice agriculture and limited animal husbandry, as well. Manganiyar, like other traditional performers, are hired on an occasional basis for All India Radio and television. In more recent times, they have been taken on extensive tours in India and abroad, performing at numerous cultural festivals” (Kothari, 2006)

The famous musical instrument only used by the Manganiyar musicians is the ‘Kamaicha’. The Manganiyars are famous for the performing on this special instrument, and some of the Manganiyars also build the instrument themselves. The Manganiyars migrate to Jaisalmer from their villages in Barmer and Jaisalmer district and are the largest professional musician tribe in Rajasthan.
### III- Jaipur

![Jaipur city](http://www.justwalkedby.com/keyword/rajasthan/)

**Figure 28: Jaipur city**

![Group of Manganiyars performing in Jaipur](http://alankarmusicalgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/your_image4-943x345.jpg)

**Figure 29: Group of Manganiyars performing in Jaipur**

---

**Population**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Source: Census of India, 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Literacy rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Source: Census of India, 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>51.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>82.46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4.2 Patterns of Social Mobility: Synthesis of the Interviews

Before we begin to analyze the perceptions of social mobility for the Manganiyars and Langas, it is crucial to note here, based on the interviews, what social mobility means to these desert musicians. Social mobility for the male Manganiyars and Langas should not be confused with amassing wealth, as these tribes consider themselves wealthy, owing to the vast lands that they own in their villages. For instance, for a Manganiyar family interviewed in Jaisalmer, owning huge estates in the villages might mean that they are at a higher social status in that village. However, this wealth of land only does not necessarily mean higher social status once they migrate out from the villages to more urban areas, where land value is not the only factor for upward mobility.

From the 47 interviews conducted for this research, the data for all can be synthesized into three basic patterns exhibiting different perceptions of social mobility. The figure above shows these three patterns with either traditional or non-traditional occupations and with either increasing or decreasing social mobility. It is important to note that these patterns are exhibited post rural-urban migration.

From the interview data, the longevity of migration i.e. the difference between migrating a decade ago vs one year ago did not matter for these migrants because for most migrants, rural-urban migration is a dynamic process, than a static one, i.e., they frequently travel back and forth from their villages and the cities.

When asked about the reason for migration from rural to urban areas, for both the groups interviewed, a) migrants engaged in Traditional occupations and b) migrants engaged in Non-Traditional occupations such as construction worker, painter etc., the reason was the perception that their social status will increase after they migrate to the urban areas.

But, if we look at the scenario in the places of destinations of their migration, there were huge disparities between the subjects’ perceptions of social mobilities. For instance, Pattern C depicting perceptions of lower social mobility while being engaged in a more traditional occupation was exhibited by most subjects, and Patterns A and B were only found in a few subjects. The table below shows the distribution of the subjects according to the social mobility pattern that they showed.
These patterns also depended heavily on the location of the city and the patterns of migration. For example, overall, the migrants from Jaisalmer showed signs of upward mobility, whereas almost all the migrants included in this study for Jodhpur city believed that they had no signs of improvement in their social status/rank after migrating to the urban areas. This was largely also due to the fact that Jaisalmer attracts more tourists than Jodhpur and therefore, has more opportunities. Also, both the patterns exhibiting upward mobility were found in the interviews of Jaisalmer and not Jodhpur.

There were several factors that were found responsible for influencing the perceptions of social mobility for these tribes; however, there were some complex perceptions about social mobility that were difficult to assess in terms of their views of their social status. For example, “Rajasthani musicians who have travelled the world, staying at the best hotels in capital cities around the globe, choose to return to the dramatically opposite locales of their modest villages, as if they had never left” (Kothari, 2006), (assuming here that staying in the best hotels in capital cities is a sign of a higher social status). It was predominant in almost all the interviews that the subjects were not ready to accept a higher social status if it meant trading their music for it. If given a choice of a high paying job, but in a more urban profession, all of them refused to be a part of a scenario where music wasn’t a part of their lives. The question then arises, is there a need for efforts to improve the social status for these musician tribes, when in fact, they might not care so deeply about it.

To analyze and compare social mobility for different groups of Manganiars and Langas, the following criteria/factors were taken into consideration. These were divided into (1) higher social status and (2) lower social status. These criteria were derived from the 47 interviews conducted and from the scholarly research done on this subject by (Sorokin, 1959) and (Mabogunje, 2010).

The following diagram (1.1) on the right shows the criteria for higher social status: Factors such as income, employment, and education all contribute towards elevating the social status of an individual. Most of the interviewees answered yes to these factors for improving the social status in some way or the other. For example, the migrants believed that if they were more educated, they would get better opportunities for work in the city and thus would achieve a higher social status. Income and Employment are the main indicators for upward mobility as per Sorokin, 1959) and (Mabogunje, 2010).
1.1 Criteria for Upward Mobility

Income  Occupation  Ownership  Education  Government support

1.2 Criteria for: Lower Mobility or no improvement in social mobility

Caste  Low Education  Location or Place of Origin  Housing  Gender

Awareness of Govt support  Willingness to switch profession  Seasonal Occupation  Classical or folk training
Mame Khan is an internationally renowned Manganiyar musician, famous for his performance of the song ‘Chaudhary’ in the ‘Coke Studio’, a renowned television series for music aired both in Pakistan and India. He belongs to a village called ‘satto’, about 110 km from Jaisalmer near Sindh border. His ancestors originally migrated to Jaisalmer from ‘Sindh’. Mame Khan is an exceptional in the pool of subjects that were interviewed for this study, in that he exhibited a totally unique pattern of upward social mobility than the rest of the subjects belonging to the same caste.

Mame Khan’s family migrated to Jaisalmer because of lack of opportunities back in their villages., and because Mame Khan had a bigger vision for his career in music.

His father, who also taught him the skills of folk music and instruments, was one of the first to build a house at the ‘artist colony’ in Jaisalmer, for which the land was donated by an aristocrat ‘Lalit Pawar’ in 1991. Below is an image of houses in the artist colony, where Mame Khan lives with his family.

His journey on upward mobility started when a known person, for playing the instrument ‘Dholak’, sent him abroad as part of a music festival. His first big break was when he did playback singing for a Bollywood movie. Throughout his career numerous people who saw his talent and pushed him into the right directions supported him. Although not formally trained in classical music, due to the exposure he got from other famous classical singers, with whom he toured abroad, Mame Khan eventually learnt and adopted classical music style in his singing. His performance at Coke Studio was applauded internationally and won him fame as a folk musician.
It is really interesting to see that Mame Khan did not disregard folk, rather accepted and endorsed it and eventually made it his identity. According to him, “If you keep your roots, then folk music can take you to great unimaginable heights” - Mame Khan

Therefore, in this scenario, it was the association with ‘folk’ that helped him achieve fame and higher status in the society. Mame Khan now has a personal manager, a website and over 12,000 fans on Facebook. He also did not have a formal school education after a certain lower grade; however, he gave his interview in part English, part Hindi. This shows a clear distinction between pre and post upward-mobility scenarios.

There were several factors that affected Mame Khan’s social mobility, however, the diagram below depicts the key indicators that affected his status the most as a Manganiyar folk musician.

**Mame Khan’s social mobility: Factors determining higher status**

There are some factors that could also affect downward social mobility for Mame Khan, and below are some factors that represent that. The circles inside the big circle are pull factors that restrain the upward social movement; whereas the elements on the border of the social boundary are the ones that help towards the upward mobility of Mame Khan. The size of the circle represents the strength of its effect on social mobility.

![Mame Khan's social mobility diagram](image-url)
Interview with the Sikandar Khan Langa:

More than 80% of the subjects interviewed belonged to Pattern ‘B’, thereby showing a serious trend in no improvement in the perceptions of social mobility for most subjects. Sikander Khan is a Langa musician belonging to Jodhpur. His grandfather first came to the city 100 years ago from a village called Barnawa in the Barmer district. Originally, his ancestors used to sing for the Raja of Jodhpur. According to Sikander Khan, there is more than a 1000 Langa musicians living in Jodhpur itself, they are however, not as big a group as the Manganiyar musicians.

Sikandar Khan explains how there is a strong competition for work as a musician in Jodhpur, because of different Langa musician communities living here.

This competition often leads to really low wages, as the artists fear that they’ll lose the opportunity if they negotiate for a higher salary. Sikander Khan explains how in their villages, they are still highly valued and have a higher social status, however, because of the preference between of classical music training over folk, they are often misled and discriminated against. This is one of the reasons the Langa community is training their kids in classical music too, so that in future they are not discriminated against as they did.

Sikander Khan’s and other Langas in this community experience wage discrimination for musical programs. For example, in the World Sufi Festival held in Jodhpur, the Langa musicians were given 1/15th of the amount of salary that was given to other international artists. However, according to Sikander Khan, “just because to look like this, with the turban and dhoti, they think we are not educated and hence they think even this much is good enough for us”.

Sikander Khan, Jodhpur
Hence, the Langa musicians have to simultaneously engage in hard labor to sustain their families, because music alone does not provide them enough for even one person.

He also explains that the musical profession opportunities are highly seasonal, depending on the tourism. For example, the three months of winter are full of opportunities and shows, but the other nine months, they aren’t many.

For Sikander Khan, the government isn’t doing enough to promote the folk culture in Jodhpur and to encourage these folk artists. “There are no subsidies or benefits for us”.

Langas in Jodhpur migrate back and forth between their villages and Jodhpur, because most of them have their families back in their villages. They migrate to the city for income and employment. Despite the difficulties in the musical profession in Jodhpur, Sikander Khan and his friends say, “we will never quit music, even if someone puts a gold crown on our heads, its our 700 years old heritage”.

People who promise them opportunities abroad, and take their money for visa and passport and then never get back also often mislead the Langas. None of the Langas interviewed in this study were educated enough and most of them lacked even a formal school education. The Langas have often migrated to cities outside of Rajasthan for employment opportunities, but prefer to always come back, since their Rajasthani folk music valued the most in Rajasthan. According to Sikander Khan, waiting for musical shows is like “a farmer waiting for the rain in the desert”.

He also mentioned that the Manganiyars do much better than them in terms of getting more folk music opportunities because they have a very strong community and always go forward as a community and not individually, which the Langas lack. Sikander agrees that their passion for music is what still keeps them going and not wanting to quit the musical profession. He adds that if wasn’t for the tourism, they would not be getting even the opportunities they get now, and so they’re grateful. He feels that the government can do much in promoting the Rajasthani Folk music and the folk communities, in terms of opening schools, organizing folk-only music festivals etc.

Sikander Khan illustrates that in the end, its everyone but them who is at an advantage, for example, he talks the famous Indian folklorist Komal Kothari, who spend most of his life studying and writing about the Manganiyars and Langas. Komal Kothari was awarded a Padma Bhushan, but Sikander adds, “he was not even from our community, and none of our ancestors and brothers about whom he wrote, got any kind of recognition”.

However, in the end, for Sikander Khan, if its fame associated with anything other than the folk music, for example cricket or another job, then it doesn’t want it.

**Sikander Khan’s social mobility: Factors determining lower social mobility**

There are some factors that affect the downward social mobility for Sikander Khan. The circles inside the big circle are pull factors that restrain the upward social movement; whereas the elements on the border of the social boundary are the ones that help towards the upward mobility of Sikander Khan. The size of the circle represents the strength of its effect of social mobility.
Interview with the Farooq Khan Langa:

Farooq Khan was a subject who quit musical profession in order to get more income and a better social status. He belongs to the Langa community and started off with a profession in music, but later realized that there is no scope of growth and improvement in this field. He went on to finish his college education and get a better job. Although, he switched his profession, he is still deeply connected to his folk and traditional values, and wants to write biographies on his famous Langa ancestors. Currently he earns much higher than the rest of the Langas in the same community, despite being one of the youngest. He also teaches children English in his free time.
There are some factors that affect the upward mobility for Sikander Khan. The circles inside the big circle are pull factors that restrain the upward social movement, whereas the elements on the border of the social boundary are the ones that help towards the upward mobility of Farooq Khan. The size of the circle represents the strength of its effect on social mobility.
5.5 Methods II: Data Review and Analysis

Review of spatial data of migration for Manganiyar and Langa tribes

The following maps above show the distribution on Manganiyars and Langas in Rajasthan, clearly showing Jaisalmer and Jodhpur as two main locations of concentrations.

The map above depicts the concentrations of Manganiyars and their number of households in Rajasthan. As evident from the sources used before, the Manganiar tribes are strictly confined to Jaisalmer and some parts of Barmer and Jalor. This shows that the inter-city migration for the Manganiyar community is not common.

The table above clearly shows the number of people involved in the musical profession from the Manganiyar communities. It is safe to assume that all the females are not included in the set of musicians here. However, it is unclear whether the rest of the people in the community are unemployed or working in a non-traditional profession.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRICT</th>
<th>MUSICIANS</th>
<th>COMMUNITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BARMER</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIKANER</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAISALMER</td>
<td>484</td>
<td>1232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JALOR</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JODHPUR</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Manganiyar musicians by district | Source: Kothari, 2006
The Langa musicians belong mostly in the Jodhpur district and the map above clearly shows the concentration of Langa households in Jodhpur and parts of Barmer from where they migrate to Jodhpur. It is curious to observe that the majority of both the communities are based in two different cities, even though they hail from the common rural areas from where they migrate. This could be due to the competition between the two tribes for better opportunities and shows etc. However, it is evident from the data that between the two tribes, the Langas are the ones at a disadvantage, mainly because of the comparatively low tourism in Jodhpur than Jaisalmer.

II- Review of tourism data

It is evident that tourism in Rajasthan state is increasing over the years and that Jaisalmer and Jodhpur are one of the most popular tourist destinations for domestic and International tourists (Masselos, 2009). The table above shows the popularity of major tourist destinations in Rajasthan. The table clearly shows that the nature of tourist activity for Jaipur, Jaisalmer and Jodhpur are all related to culture and heritage. Therefore, it can be argued that culture and heritage implies or at least includes the cultural performances of the folk musicians and other folk artists. Hence, it’s okay to say that the Manganiyar and Langa artists of Rajasthan are in some way responsible for promoting tourism in Rajasthan for both domestic as well as International tourists and thereby contributing to the economic development of the most touristic destination in India.

III- Review of government policies and other efforts pertaining to folk artists

Several Government policies and programs, and efforts by external agencies were reviewed from government documents and reports on the criteria of benefits, promotion and inclusion of the folk tribes and folk music culture in the modern society. Based on the criteria mentioned above, these were finally divided in three levels: a) The Intergovernmental committee for the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage by UNESCO, b) The Sangeet Natak Akadami: National Academy of Music, Dance and Drama, Government of India and c) efforts at local and municipal level. At national level no clear policies were found pertaining only to the Manganiyar and Langa artists of Rajasthan, but at local and municipal level, several initiatives were in place, however they differed end from city to city.

From UNESCO’s Intergovernmental committee for the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage, ninth convention report, no programs were listed to promote the folk culture of Rajasthan or to improve the social status for a folk artist in India, despite being so culturally rich and ethnically diverse.
However, there were a few policies and objectives that serve only the artists that are already famous or that have achieved something in the field of music. For example, the Sangeet Natak Akademi (National Academy of Music, Dance and Drama) provides artist relief fund to artists that have special conditions, such as, circumstances requiring medical treatment etc. Folk artists and performers are generally not considered a part of this scheme and even if it was, the policy is not very accessible to the uneducated class, which most of the folk artists are. The central government also has several initiatives that it has proposed to promote folk art and culture too, such as:

1. Stageplays grant scheme
2. Scholarships and fellowships
3. National Cultural Exchange Programme
4. Guru-disciple tradition Plan
5. The young talented artist Plan
6. Documentation of endangered artforms
7. Theatre renovation plan
8. Activities Shilpgram
9. Loktrng- National Folk Dance Festival and the celebration of the Octave-northeast

(Government of India, 2016)

Despite these proposals, its evident from the primary analysis of the interviews that none of these have been taken advantage of by the marginalized groups of Manganiyar and Langa tribes of Rajasthan, mainly because they are not aware of these benefits and are not educated enough to take full advantage of them.

Apart from the central government efforts, there were several local efforts that the local municipality and the local government of Jaisalmer were providing for the folk artists. One such effort included providing land for building houses in an artist colony in the city of Jaisalmer. This allowed them to organize themselves properly in the city and take advantage of other opportunities related to tourism. The land was given as a gift to all the folk artists, mainly the Manganiyars, as a motive to promote the folk culture of the city. The local government also established schools for children interested in learning folk music.

Several other initiatives were organized by the local ministers to promote these folk artists through tourism, for example, getting hotels and resorts to hire these folk musicians to perform for the tourists. The local government was also responsible for organizing shows and events only dedicated to the folk culture of Rajasthan. Due to these efforts, the musicians also sometimes got opportunities to travel for music shows abroad.

The most important thing to note here is that any such effort at local or regional level was absent in Jodhpur. Moreover, the artists in Jodhpur experienced discrimination from the organizers at the government organized cultural festivals, in terms of income and opportunities. This was also one of the reasons given by the Langa artist for leaving the music profession and working as a construction worker, which also gave him more reliability in terms of income.

The diagram below shows a comparison between the three cities Jaisalmer, Jodhpur and Jaipur in terms of the data for cultural tourism, education level of the interviewees and rural population.

In the end, it was found out that more tourism and more education had a positive impact on the social mobility of the migrants, i.e. Interviewees from Jaipur had higher perceptions of social mobility than Jaisalmer and Jodhpur. Also true was the fact that more tourism in Jaisalmer was an important factor in improving perceptions of social mobility of the migrants.
CHAPTER VI: DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

As seen in the interview analysis earlier, it is evident from the interview data and the different patterns of perceptions of social mobility that there is no significant improvement in social mobility for the migrants who are working as folk musicians, compared to the migrants that are working as construction workers for example. Therefore, there is a trend, and the direction of the results leads support to the hypothesis stated earlier that the group consisting of traditional tribes undertaking rural-urban migration and engaged in traditional or culture-related occupation such as folk music show a significantly greater decrease in their social mobility in terms of income, ownership, education, access to government support etc. in comparison to the group belonging to the same tribe, but engaged in non-traditional and non-cultural occupations such as construction work etc. post-migration. However, out of the three patterns of migrants discussed in Figure 14, pattern A showed improvement in social mobility, even after being engaged in a traditional occupation. This was the case for Mame Khan, who is a famous folk singer and belongs to the Manganiyar caste. He felt that his increase in the social status can be attributed to factors such as education, awareness and leadership. Due to this increase in social mobility for Mame Khan, opportunities such as access to higher education, traveling abroad etc. opened up for him. Additionally, vertical social mobility (income, employment) can be seen for groups A and C, and horizontal social mobility (social status) can be seen only for group A. While group B exhibits no kind of upward mobility post-migration in terms of the social status.

Group of people belonging to pattern B did not show any improvement in their social status, rather they felt that they were the targets of social inequality and discrimination in terms of daily wages and income. The interviewees felt that the factors responsible for this discrimination were mainly their lack of education and awareness about access to better opportunities.

Group of people from Pattern C were mainly those who had left the profession of music, in order to get better job opportunities. Although these people were also familiar with the musical training they were not practicing it. These people showed that they had a higher improvement in their social mobility after changing their professions to construction work etc. in terms of access to education and government support, and one of the main reasons for this they felt was that there was no taboo associated with ‘culture’ anymore, since they longer belonged to cultural occupation. Additionally, since they were no longer associated with the ‘traditional’ aspect in their occupations, they felt that they were subject to less discrimination based on the perceptions of traditional (e.g. uneducated and poor). For example, they had access to salary negotiations, when it came to their jobs opportunities, which was not the case when they were engaged in the traditional music sector.

Out of the three cities that were considered for the interviews, Jaisalmer and Jodhpur, being located closer to the villages of the Manganiyar and Langa were the main focus of the interviews for the tribes still engaged in traditional occupations. Jaipur, on the other hand only included subjects that are no longer working as folk musicians.

Jaisalmer showed a trend for upward mobility, mainly due to the awareness of the community groups, leadership within the communities, and most importantly because of various government efforts that are in place for improvement of folk artists in Jaisalmer. Jodhpur, on the other hand showed a downward trend in terms of social mobility of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes, which can be attested to the fact that musicians from Jodhpur were comparatively more uneducated than musicians from Jaisalmer, and also lacked leadership in the community for instance, in Jaisalmer, one group of Manganiyar musicians interviewed had a declared leader for their community, who would being in opportunities for the entire groups as a whole and thus had access to a wider information network of the folk music industry in Rajasthan. Tourism also played a huge role in this result, for example, Jodhpur had much less tourists during the entire winter season compared to Jaisalmer, which is a more preferred destination for domestic and international tourists. From the interviews conducted, all the interviewees agreed to the fact that more tourists meant more opportunities for the folk musicians and traditional artists.

It is curious to note here that all the subjects exhibited a passion for music within their communities and that allowed them to continue working as folk musicians even though there was less income and scope for upward mobility.

In the end, it is clear that there needs to be an effort to improve the quality of life of these musicians in terms of their wages, education, benefits and opportunities, while at the same time trying to not shift them from their native traditional occupations of folk music. However, it can also be argued that there needs to be a way to improve the social status of the migrants by altering the perceptions of marginalization and traditional occupations in India, in addition to introducing policies and initiatives that benefit the economic status for these desert tribes.

As Shubha Chaudhri has noted, “I am skeptical about the goal of making the musicians more widely known because their indigenous music is not meant to be commercial. It’s a niche audience for this kind of thing”. Contrary to that, famous musician Roysten Able, who has worked on ‘The Manganiyar Seduction’, argues that the musicians “will have to make their music more contemporary”, as he’d done with this show if they want to popularize it. All this attests to the fact that in the end, the perception of the folk v/s modern needs to change first.
Lastly, it is important to observe that even though the marginalization in these communities is caused by age-old rules and regulations based on the caste-system, “It’s not hard to marginalize people when they’ve already done it to themselves.” - Rosemary and Rue, Seanan McGuire, [2009]. Therefore, efforts should be made so that these tribes are not continued to be marginalized and are included in the social system and feel confident about their the value of their talent.

Recommendations

As Bashi (1997) writes, “migration studies often involve a comparison of different ethnic groups’ performances in various social processes (like assimilation, acculturation, and socioeconomic attainment” , however, to narrow the gap between marginalization and social mobility, it is crucial that the research done in this field takes into account the conceptions of ‘cultural’ and ‘traditional’. There should be set priorities in this kind of research based on rural-urban migration that takes into account the concepts of marginalization and other factors that can influence social mobility. Policymakers and planners must engage these marginalized communities of Manganiyar and Langa into more inclusive and participatory methodologies for improving their social rank in the society.

Need for Participatory Policies

Marginalized people of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes, and especially women must be included in the planning process and encouraged to talk about the problems that they face, in terms of access to education, employment, health etc. in order to alter the taboo of not allowing women to work outside of their homes. “In any sustainable development policy must take care to include all the marginalized groups in society, especially women, since they plan an important role as users and managers of their surrounding natural resources” (Gupta, 2010). Efforts at local and national level must be made to encourage participation of these unprivileged tribes. According to Srivastava (2003), “because of lack of data, migration is largely invisible and ignored by policy makers”, therefore, the government agencies must take into consideration the missing data of these marginalized communities while planning for participation and inclusion.

Ethnographic studies must be included as a part of such research, as it informs the true nature of the perceptions of social mobility that the marginalized communities hold.

Since education is a major factor for influencing social mobility, as seen in the interview analysis earlier, there should be several efforts at local and national level to reduce illiteracy within these marginalized populations. It is crucial to do this because these tribes constitute a large portion of the population in Jaisalmer and Jodhpur, and contribute heavily to tourism and economic development.

Efforts should be made to popularize folk music by setting up schools, visitor and learning centers etc. in order to remove the taboo from the word ‘folk’ and ‘traditional’ and also to promote tourism. The Sangeet Natak Academy and other government initiatives should include promotion of folk artists that are not already famous. Folk and classical music must be promoted together, so as to narrow the gaps between the two music styles and make them both equally remunerative.

Importance in Urban Planning: preserving cultural identities

It is crucial to note the importance of social inclusion of these Manganiyar and Langa desert tribes of Rajasthan in the planning processes. These tribes are valuable to the culture and music of Rajasthan, and are also major contributors to the tourism activities in Rajasthan, therefore planning efforts in the cities of Rajasthan must include ways to help these communities sustain and create a better livelihood for themselves, while still being engaged in the folk music profession. It is also pivotal to preserve the culture of folk music in Rajasthan, where classical music training is being preferred more and more daily, over folk musical training. By preserving the folk culture of Rajasthan, using participatory and inclusion planning techniques, an example can be set for scenarios involving similar scenarios as the Manganiyar and Langa musician tribes.

Mahbod Seraji writes in the Rooftops of Tehran,

“I write that crime is an unlawful act of violence that can be committed by anyone, and that punishment is the consequence designed for criminals who don’t have the economic means to cover it up. Throughout history, men of wealth and power have been exempt from facing the consequences of their evil deeds. Crime, therefore, can be defined as an offense committed by an individual of inferior status in society. Punishment is a consequence forced on the perpetrator of the crime only if he occupies one of the lower steps of the social ladder”

If we look at the definition of marginalization defined earlier in the text (pg. 10), marginalization is defined as “the process through which persons are peripheralized on the basis of their identities, associations, experiences and environment” (Hall, 1994).

Thus, in this sense, the act of Marginalization is no less than a crime, and must be taken seriously while studying and planning for marginalized communities and their social mobility.
Bibliography


McCatty, Machel (2004), The process of rural–urban migration in developing countries. An honors essay submitted in fulfillment of the degree of Bachelor of Arts to Department of Economics, Carleton University, Ottawa, Ontario


Appendix: A Interview Guide

Sample Interview Questions (English): During this interview, your answers will be recorded in the form of written notes and audio/video recordings.

Check one. Do you belong to: Manganiyar Langa Other

Age: Gender: M F Location:

1. Are you currently or have you been previously engaged in the profession of Classical folk music or related traditional livelihood?
   1.1 If yes, has this been an indefinite commitment or otherwise?
   1.2 If previously engaged in classical music profession, what was the reason for you to quit the traditional music career?
   1.3 If yes, what is your current title in the folk music profession?
   1.4 If no, in what employment sector are you currently engaged in?
   1.5 Were you born into a family of folk musicians? If no, why did you decide to not get involved in the classical music profession, despite having been born in a family of traditional professional musicians?

2. Have you migrated to the city?
   2.1 If yes, what’s the reason for your migration?
   2.2 If yes, are you partly or fully engaged in traditional occupations?
   2.3 If yes, have you migrated to the city permanently?
   2.4 Do you own a house or land in the city?
   2.5 Has your income and social status improved after coming to the city? How?

3. Would you trade-off your music for a higher standard of living, if it also means a higher rank in the social status? If yes, why?

4. What’s your approximate per annum salary through these musical jobs? Is it sufficient to sustain your entire family?

5. Traditionally, only male members of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes participate in the tradition of classical folk music. Why is that? Are female members involved in other occupations?

6. What is your perception of social mobility (defined as the movement within social classes in a society) in context of your current employment?

7. For the most part, the people who come to watch you perform are tourists. Do you know that the performances have an international audience?

8. What is your education attainment?

9. How is the government involved in facilitating the traditional music market?

10. Do you ever think about advancing your musical profession, in terms of teaching etc.?

11. Is your musical expertise passed on through the generations as a source for employment, or as part of a legacy?
Interview Guide: Hindi

साक्षात्कार प्रश्न: इस साक्षात्कार के दौरान, आपके जवाब लिखित नोटस और ऑडियो / वीडियो रिकॉर्डिंग के रूप में दर्ज किए जाएंगे।

एक को चिह्नित करें: मांगनियार लांगा अन्य:
उम्र लिंग: सीलिंग पुलिंग स्थान:

1. क्या आप वर्तमान में या पहले कभी शास्त्रीय लोक संगीत या संबंधित पारंपरिक आजीविका के पेशे में शामिल हुए हैं?

1.1 यदि हाँ, तो क्या यह एक अनिश्चितकालीन प्रतिबंधन की गई थी या अन्यथा?
1.2 आप आप पहले से शास्त्रीय संगीत के पेशे में लगे हुए थे, तो पारंपरिक संगीत कैरियर को छोड़ने के लिए आप का क्या कारण था?
1.3 यदि हाँ, तो लोक संगीत के पेशे में अपना मौजूदा पद क्या है?
1.4 यदि नहीं, तो आप वर्तमान में किस रोजगार के क्षेत्र में लगे हुए हैं?
1.5 क्या आप लोक संगीतकारों के परिवार में पैदा हुए थे? आगर हाँ, तो क्यों आपने पारंपरिक पेशेवर संगीतकारों के परिवार में पैदा होने के बावजूद, शास्त्रीय संगीत पेशे में शामिल नहीं होने का फैसला किया?

2. क्या आपने शहर में देशांतर गया है?

2.1 यदि हाँ, तो आपके प्रवास का क्या कारण है?
2.2 यदि हाँ, तो क्या आप आधिक रूप से या पूरी तरह से पारंपरिक व्यवसायों में लगे हुए हैं?
2.3 यदि हाँ, तो क्या आपने स्थायी रूप से शहर में देशांतर गया कर लिया है?
2.4 यदि हाँ, तो क्या आप अपने घर या शहर आरोपी या अक्सर रहते हैं? क्यों?
2.5 क्या आप शहर में किसी घर या जमीन के मालिक हैं?
2.6 क्या आपकी आय और सामाजिक स्थिति में शहर में आने के बाद सुधार हुआ है?
कैसे?

3. क्या आप अपने संगीत को छोड़ सकते हैं एक उच्च मानक के लिए, जिससे सामाजिक अवस्था में भी एक उच्च पद मिले? यदि ना, तो क्यों?
4. इन संगीत समबंधित नौकरियों के माध्यम से आपकी अनुमानित सालाना वेतन क्या है? यह अपके पूरे परिवार को चलाने के लिए पर्याप्त है?

5. परंपरागत रूप से, मामलियार और लामा जनजातियों के केवल पुरुष सदस्य शास्त्रीय लोक संगीत की परंपरा में भाग लेते हैं। ऐसा क्यों है? महिला सदस्य क्या अन्य व्यवसायों से जुड़ी है?

6. अपने वर्तमान रोजगार के संदर्भ में (एक समाज में सामाजिक क्षेत्र के भीतर का संचलन) सामाजिक गतिशीलता की आपकी धारणा क्या है?

7. अधिकांश पर्याटक आपके प्रदर्शन को देखने के लिए आते हैं। क्या आपको पता है के आपके अंतरराष्ट्रीय दर्शक क्या है?

8. आपने कहा तक की शिक्षा प्राप्त की है?

9. सरकार किस तरह से परंपरागत संगीत को बढ़ाने के लिए कार्यरत है?

10. क्या आपने कभी अपने संगीत शाखा को अपने अग्रसर करने के बारे में सोचा है? जैसे कि सिखाना पढ़ाना आदि.

11. क्या आपकी संगीत विशेषता एक विशद से हिस्से के रूप में पीढ़ी दर पीढ़ी प्रशिक्षित की जा रही है? या सिर्फ एक आय के स्रोत के रूप में?
Hello, I am a researcher with the Department of Urban Planning at the Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation at Columbia University, conducting interviews about rural-urban migration of the Manganiyar and Langa tribes in the state of Rajasthan, India to better understand the relationship between social mobility and rural-urban migration.

During this interview, you will be asked to answer some questions about your perceptions about social mobility and the process of rural-urban migration, your reasons for migration etc. These questions should take about ten to fifteen minutes. However, please feel free to expand on the topic or talk about related ideas.

Also, if there are any questions you would rather not answer or that you do not feel comfortable answering, please say so and we will stop the interview or move on to the next question, whichever you prefer.

With your permission, we will record the interviews, through notes and possibly digital recordings, but your interview will be kept anonymous. We will not record your name or other identifying information to protect your privacy. The investigator considers that the risks of participating in this research are anticipated to be no more than minimal.

Participant’s Agreement:

I am aware that my participation in this interview is voluntary. I understand the intent and purpose of this research. If, for any reason, at any time, I wish to stop the interview, I may do so without having to give an explanation. I certify that I am 18 years of age or older and freely give my consent to participate in this study. I have discussed the study with the researcher, I have had the opportunity to ask questions and have received satisfactory answers. The explanation I have been given has mentioned both the possible risks and benefits to participating in the study.

I am aware the data will be used in a study that may be published, but my personal information will be kept confidential. If I have any questions about this study, I am free to contact the researcher for this study [Anjali Singhvi, as4771@columbia.edu]. I have been offered a copy of this consent form that I may keep for my own reference.

☐ I do not want to have this interview recorded.
☐ I am willing to have this interview recorded:

Signed: ____________________________________________

Date: ______________________________________________

Contact Information:
If you have any questions about taking part in this research study, you should contact the researcher Anjali Singhvi at as4771@columbia.edu, 9178031840, 4/95, Jawahar Nagar, Jaipur-302004, India.

If you have any questions or concerns about your rights as a research subject, you should contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) for Human Participants by phone at (212) 851-7040 or by email at askirb@columbia.edu.
Appendix: C
Consent Form

ग्रामीण- शहरी प्रवास सहमति फार्म के माध्यम से सामाजिक गतिशीलता
8 दिसंबर 2015

नमस्ते, मैं कोलंबिया विश्वविद्यालय में आर्किटेक्चर, प्लानिंग और संस्करण के ग्रुपएट स्कूल में शहरी नियोजन विभाग के साथ एक शोधकर्ता हूँ | मैं भारत में राजस्थान के राज्य में मांगनियार और लांगा जनजातियों के ग्रामीण-शहरी प्रवास के बारे में साक्षात्कार आयोजित करने और उनकी सामाजिक गतिशीलता और ग्रामीण-शहरी पलायन के बीच संबंध को बेहतर समझने के लिए यह अध्ययन कर रही हूँ।

इस साक्षात्कार के दौरान, आपसे सामाजिक गतिशीलता और ग्रामीण-शहरी प्रवास की प्रक्रिया के बारे में अपने विचारों के बारे में कुछ सवालों के जवाब देने के लिए कहा जाएगा। माइक्रोशेन्ट के लिए उन्हें कारणों के इन सवालों में दस से पंद्रह मिनट लगें। कृपया इस विषय पर विस्तार या संबंधित विचारों के बारे में बात करने के लिए आप स्वतंत्र महसूस करें।

यदि आप किसी भी सवाल का जवाब नहीं देना चाहते, या आप आराम से जवाब नहीं दे पा रहे हैं, तो आप ऐसा कहा हें तो हम साक्षात्कार को रोक देंगे या अगला सवाल करने का अधिकार हासिल करें।

आपकी अनुमति के साथ, नोट्स और संभवतः डिजिटल रिकॉर्डिंग के माध्यम से साक्षात्कार, रिकॉर्ड होगा, लेकिन साक्षात्कार गुप्त नहीं रखा जाएगा। आपके नाम या आपकी गोपनीयता की रक्षा करने के लिए आपकी पहचान की जानकारी रिकॉर्ड नहीं होगी। अनुच्छेद मानता है कि इस शोध में भाग लेने का जोखिम पूर्वनिमानित प्रकार से नागण्य से अधिक नहीं है।

प्रतिबयागी का करार:

मैं जानता हूँ कि इस साक्षात्कार में मेरी भागीदारी स्वच्छिंद्र है। मैं इस शोध के आधार और उद्देश्य को समझता हूँ। यदि किसी कारण से, किसी भी समय में साक्षात्कार को रोकना चाहता हूँ तो मैं अपने स्वप्न दिल्ल से इसे रोकना कर सकता हूँ। मैं अनुमित करता हूँ कि मैं 18 वर्ष की उम्र से अधिक हुं और स्वतंत्र रूप से के अध्ययन में भाग लेने के लिए अपनी सहमति देता हूँ। मैं इस शोधकर्ता के साथ अध्ययन पर चर्चा की है और संगीतज्ञक जवाब प्राप्त हुआ है। मुझे दिए गए स्वप्निकरण में, अध्ययन में भाग लेने के संबंधित जोखिम और लाभ दोन्हों का उल्लेख किया गया है।

मैं जानता हूँ कि यह तथ्य एक अध्ययन शोध में इस्तेमाल किए जाएँगे जो कि प्रकाशित किया जा सकता है,
लेकिन मेरी व्यक्तिगत जानकारी को गोपनीय रखा जाएगा। मेरे इस अध्ययन के बारे में कोई भी सवाल हो, तो मैं इस के लिए शोधकर्ता को संपर्क करने के लिए स्वतंत्र हूँ (अंजलि सिंघवी as4771@columbia.edu)। मुझे अपने संदर्भ के लिए इस सहमति पत्र की एक प्रति दी गई है।

☐ मैं इस साक्षात्कार को रिकॉर्ड नहीं करवाना चाहता।
☐ मैं इस साक्षात्कार को रिकॉर्ड कराना चाहता तैयार हूँ:

हस्ताक्षर:________________________________________________________________________

तारीख:_________________________________________________________________________
ANJALI SINGHVI

A Thesis Presented to the Faculty of Architecture and Planning
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science in Urban Planning
March 2015
Guided by: Dr. Joyce Klein Rosenthal
Reader: Kaja Kuhl