ENGLISH ANTECEDENTS OF THE QUEEN ANNE IN AMERICA: A STUDY OF ANGLO-AMERICAN DOMESTIC ARCHITECTURE

Elizabeth Lawrence Canon

Advisor: Janet W. Foster
Readers: Jeffrey Karl Ochsner & Andrew Saint

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Master of Science in Historic Preservation, Columbia University Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation

May 2017
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First I would like to thank my thesis advisor Janet W. Foster, adjunct assistant professor, Columbia University, for her endless positivity and guidance throughout the process. We share an appreciation for late nineteenth century American architecture and I feel very grateful to have worked with an advisor who is an expert on the period of time explored in this work.

I would also like to thank my readers Jeffrey Karl Ochsner, professor, University of Washington, and Andrew Saint, author, for their time and assistance. Professor Ochsner thank you for your genuine interest in the topic and for contributing your expertise on nineteenth century American architecture, Henry Hobson Richardson and the Sherman house. Andrew thank you for providing an English perspective and for your true appreciation for the “Old English.” You are the expert on Richard Norman Shaw and your insight was invaluable in understanding Shaw’s works.

This work would not have come to fruition without the insight and interest of a number of individuals in the topic. Thank you Sarah Bradford Landau for donating many of the books used in this thesis and whose article “Richard Morris Hunt, the Continental Picturesque and the ‘Stick Style’” was part of the inspiration for writing this thesis, and as this work follows where your article concluded. Furthermore, I would like to thank Andrew Dolkart, professor, Columbia University, for your recommendations on books to read and places to see in England, which guided the initial ideas for the thesis.

There were many individuals who offered their time, assistance and expertise, thank you to:

Paul Bentel, adjunct professor, Columbia University
Chip Bohl, architect, Annapolis, Maryland
Françoise Bollack, adjunct professor, Columbia University
Michelle Mihalkovitz, National Park Service, Thomas Edison National Historical Park,
Christopher Neville, adjunct professor, Columbia University
Cathy Randall, Annapolis, Maryland

I would especially like to thank my friends and family for their love and support.
ABSTRACT
There is a significant English influence on the development of the American domestic architectural style known as “Queen Anne.” Beginning in the 1870’s American architects used both “Old English” and “Queen Anne Revival” elements as a way for Anglophiles to express their values in their houses. These clients and their houses enabled a few American architects to transform into practice what they absorbed from English architectural journals. This architectural expression is visually distinct from American Queen Anne buildings that develop after 1876 and thus constitutes an exploration of a previously undiscussed chapter of American Architecture.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION
Problem Statement
Scope
Methodology
Assumptions
Limitations

CHAPTER 1. ENGLISH ANTECEDENTS
Industrialization
Religious Revival
Nationalism and Nostalgia: English Architects
Old English Architecture
Richard Norman Shaw
Queen Anne Revival
Americanization of English Revival Styles

CHAPTER 2. TRANSATLANTICISM AND ECLECTICISM IN AMERICA
Early Proponents of English Revival Styles in America
Introduction of English Picturesque
The Establishment of English Taste: Charles Eastlake

CHAPTER 3. DEFINING ANGLO-AMERICAN ARCHITECTURE
Anglophile Client
Trained Architect
Anglo-American Architecture: Character Defining Features

CHAPTER 4. RESORT ARCHITECTURE: THE NEWPORT VILLAS
Watts Sherman House (Sherman House)
Charles H. Baldwin House

CHAPTER 5. URBAN ARCHITECTURE: THE DOUBLE COTTAGE
Randall Duplex

CHAPTER 6. SUBURBAN ARCHITECTURE: THE COUNTRY HOUSE
Glenmont

CHAPTER 7. THE END OF THE HIGH STYLE
J. Griffiths Masten House

CHAPTER 8. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

CHAPTER 9. BIBLIOGRAPHY
INTRODUCTION

“As a fact, whether fortunately so or not, what goes on in England in an art, as in many other matters, is to a certain extent quickly reflected here; and it is well from this point of view to follow closely the Queen Anne movement.”

“A Talk About ‘Queen Anne’” American Architect and Building News (April 28, 1877)
Problem Statement
There is a gap in the research in understanding how American interpretations of English and Shavian country house architecture was transmitted to the United States in the post-Civil War era.\(^1\) The chronology of those architectural movements and the terminology associated with those movements is not straightforward in American architectural history.

There is a moment (1874-1883) in American architecture when there was a distinct difference between an “Anglo-American” high-style architecture and the popularized American “Queen Anne” style, which has been unexplored in architectural literature. The high-style forms are visually distinct from American Queen Anne buildings that developed after the Centennial Exposition of 1876, and thus their identification constitutes an exploration of a previously undiscovered chapter of American architecture. Yet both building types are described as part of the Queen Anne architectural expression popular in the late nineteenth century in America. For example, the illustration in *Palliser’s American Architecture or Every Man a Complete Builder* (1888) is visually distinct from the illustration titled “House in Everett Pl” in *American Architect and Building News* (1883) (Figures 1 and 2).

Palliser is representative of the vernacular American Queen Anne style published for the masses in pattern books while the Everett House is emblematic of the high-style Anglo-American architecture, designed by trained architects for their Anglophile clients. The existing literature on American domestic architecture in the second half of the nineteenth century would incorrectly describe these two houses under the widespread term “Queen Anne.”

Scope
The scope of this thesis is limited to domestic architecture on the Atlantic coast, built between 1874 and 1883. The starting date 1874 corresponds to the earliest published illustrations of American buildings with a distinctively Shavian influence (Figure 3). The end date signifies the last publication of an American example of high-style Anglo-American domestic architecture (Figure 2).\(^2\) The majority of English examples discussed in this thesis were published works in English architectural journals available in America to a select audience of architects and Anglophiles.

---

\(^1\) In a dialogue with Andrew Saint he noted that the term “Shavian” was never used in the nineteenth century. Saint believes the term was invented to refer to the works and style of George Bernard Shaw, as opposed to Richard Norman Shaw.  
\(^2\) Interestingly enough, both the first illustration and the last illustration of houses with a distinct Anglo-American influence were designed by the same American architect, Alexander Forbes Oakey. Oakey is discussed in further detail in chapter 7.
Additionally, since the topic is dependent on published works of architecture, the discussion is largely dedicated to the exterior of the houses. The layout of the house in plan will not be examined in detail in this thesis because many of the illustrations in English architectural journals in the 1870’s did not publish the plans of the houses and instead published perspective drawings of the exterior.  

Figure 1. Palliser, Palliser & Co. Architects, *Palliser’s American Architecture or Every Man a Complete Builder* (New York: J.S. Ogilvie Publishing Company 1888) figure from 1896 edition, plate 37, 77.


---

3 For example, of the published works by Richard Norman Shaw discussed in the thesis, only one of the illustrations, Hopedene, provided a plan. Hopedene was the latest of the works by Shaw examined in the thesis.
Methodology

The first step in determining the topic for the thesis included examining the existing material on American domestic architecture in the middle to late nineteenth century. Initially the topic for the thesis stemmed from a passion for American Queen Anne domestic architecture; however, after reading the existing material on the subject there was a realization that there was a gap in the research. Thorough research on how the “Old English” and the “Queen Anne Revival” style were transported to America and evolved into the American Queen Anne style was largely non-existent. The next step was to develop a set of research questions which were not answered in the existing material.

The preliminary research questions which defined this project include:

- How did the country houses by English architects William Butterfield, Richard Norman Shaw, Philip Webb and others influence architects and Anglophile clients in America?
- What role did published work in English architectural journals such as *The Architect* and *Building News* play in influencing American architects and their clients?
- Which architects designing Anglo-American Queen Anne houses had access to English publications, studied abroad or traveled abroad?
- How did Anglo-American houses express the owner’s or architect’s taste or values at the time?

The material collected to address these questions consisted of reading primary and secondary sources, visiting sites in England and America, and having conversations with knowledgeable individuals. Research included reading primary source literature published by American and English architects during the nineteenth century. The majority of the research consisted of
reading American and English architectural journals and visual analysis of published illustrations by American and English architects.

The reason for focusing primarily on Richard Norman Shaw’s illustrations was because his country houses were frequently published in England and America. There are many examples of direct translations of Shavian design by American architects, which will be discussed throughout this paper. The Shavian country houses discussed in this paper all pre-date the Anglo-American domestic architecture examined in this paper.

In order to track the information, a timeline was created of the nineteenth century in America and England, which included information on architecture, literature and political and social events. Field-work included site visits to London, England Newport, Rhode Island, Annapolis, Maryland, and Llewellyn Park, New Jersey for visual analysis, archival research & documentation. To determine the case study houses, a list of the tangible and intangible characteristics associated with Anglo-American domestic architecture was developed, and from this list, the five houses discussed as case studies in the following chapters were chosen.

The five case study houses are presented in four chapters based on their typology. Each chapter is organized by a brief description of the architectural typology, the background of the client and the architect, the English influence on the design, and the public perception of the houses when they were built. The corresponding figures are incorporated into the text and the bibliography is located at the end of the thesis, organized by chapter.

The goal of the thesis was to describe the tangible and intangible elements of an original term or architectural style called “Anglo-American architecture.” Recent developments in research technology have made nineteenth century items including local archives, census information and newspaper articles more readily available. Moreover today there is more readily accessible biographical information, which is large component of defining the intangible heritage associated with Anglo-American domestic architecture.

**Assumptions**

The houses published in the *American Architect and Building News*, the *Architectural Sketch Book* and the *New York Sketch Book* were considered examples of good design or important design by the editors and readers of architectural publications.

Certain attributes including affiliation with the Anglican or Episcopal Church, collecting and reading English history books, traveling to England, and an interest in an English ancestry on the part of nineteenth century Americans signifies a meaningful cultural and social identification with England. These attributes contributed to design choices when building a home.
Limitations
The primary limitation for the thesis is the amount of travel necessary to find every Anglo-American house in America to compare to every country house in England. Furthermore, the distance between America and England was another limitation as I was only able to travel to England once during the initial research stage for the thesis.
CHAPTER 1. ENGLISH ANTECEDENTS

The eclectic and nostalgic English architecture in the second half of the nineteenth century was a reaction against the negative effects of industrialization. In the 1850’s in the wake of the Anglican religious revival, the English Gothic and Old English styles were promoted as a visual expression of the values of a pre-industrial world. These architectural styles also reinforced the growing interest in English nationalism. Similarly, the Queen Anne Revival provided an eclectic way to integrate classical architecture with traditional English vernacular elements. The English Gothic, the Old English and the Queen Anne Revival were based on philosophical reactions to industrialization. These nostalgic styles flourished in literature, furniture, and other artistic mediums of the period.⁴

Literacy rates increased as education became more widespread in England in the nineteenth century. Through the advances in paper-making, printing and bookbinding technologies and the ability to move items on steamships and railways, more people had access to books. Ironically, with greater access to printed material, which included information on the architecture of other cultures, combined with a newfound mobility to travel, the growing middle classes became increasingly interested the revitalization of an English identity.

Architects of the period embraced technology through their use innovative building products to recreate picturesque or vernacular elements. Unexpectedly, revival styles born out of a reaction to industrialization flourished because of the developments in technology and transportation. These revival styles created architecture with a distinctively English identity, and also advanced England’s status to the rest of the world.

Industrialization (1830-1860)

In the beginning of the nineteenth century, society was excited about the industrialization occurring in England; however, the negative effects of the new industries in London left the city crowded and polluted. As more working class families moved out of the country and into the city for employment, there was a realization of the loss of traditional English folk culture.

There were many positive impacts of industrialization in England, especially in civil engineering, which led to better infrastructure. The extensive railway system made second homes in the country more desirable as they were quickly accessible from major cities. The popularization of the railway sparked an interest in travel to the picturesque English countryside.⁵

---

The nostalgia for the traditional English way of life further developed in the second half of the nineteenth century. The upper middle classes moved to the suburbs or purchased second homes in the country to have access to light and air, which resulted in architects gaining the commissions for new country houses or extensively remodeling older buildings to meet the needs of the industrial era’s wealthy.

The increased availability of iron created the possibility for new building typologies, especially in the cities. The Great Exhibition in London in 1851 allowed English architects and engineers to show off their work inspired by the technological innovations. In addition to new material innovations, traditional building materials became less expensive in the nineteenth century. In the 1780’s a tax was placed on brick and tile; however, by 1850 these taxes were abolished along with a series of other taxes, which greatly impacted the design of English architecture. English architecture changed dramatically from heavy stone structures to light masonry structures with the decreased cost of brick and tile. The repeal of the tax on glass and windows also influenced the new building style.

**Religious Revival (1830-1860)**

The revitalization of the Church of England and the Evangelical movement were the result of the conception that industrialization separated society from religion, and that Roman Catholics would take over the Anglican church. In 1829 the Catholic Emancipation was introduced in England and allowed Roman Catholics to take seats in Parliament. Anglican Evangelicals felt threatened by the new Roman power in the Church of England, furthered during the so-called “papal aggression” of the 1850’s. There was a strong conflict in the Church of England between the “high church” or the Roman Catholics, and the Evangelicals.

The religious revival in England brought a surge of new building and “between 1830 and 1860 1,500 new churches were erected in England.” The majority of these churches were designed in the English Gothic Revival style, popularized by the influence of John Ruskin. Ruskin argued that the technological innovations created by the industrial revolution resulted in dishonest buildings that lacked morality and beauty. Ruskin’s father was an avid supporter of the Anglican church and he pleaded for the implementation Gothic Revival architecture for religious buildings. Ruskin also urged honesty in architecture, and provided examples in *The Seven...*

---

Lamps of Architecture, published in 1849 in London.\(^9\) To Ruskin, the application of ornament on a building that obscured or denied its materiality was an outrage:

“We may not be able to command good, or beautiful, or inventive architecture; but we can command an honest architecture: the meagreness of poverty may be pardoned, the sternness of utility respected; but what is there but scorn for the meanness of deception?”\(^10\)

John Ruskin, The Seven Lamps of Architecture (1849)

The popularity of The Seven Lamps of Architecture resulted in Ruskin writing The Stones of Venice published between 1851 and 1853.\(^11\) Ruskin was an outspoken ultra-Tory, raised in a conservative household, and he supported the Anglican Evangelical philosophies in The Stones of Venice. Ruskin’s ability to summarize the Gothic Revival movement in writing and to persuade the public through literature fostered the spread of the Gothic Revival. While Ruskinian Gothic architecture only lasted a couple decades in England, Ruskin’s philosophies influenced the revival styles of English and American architectural movement of the next few decades.\(^12\)

Nationalism and Nostalgia: English Architects (1850’s-1880’s)

With London at its peak as the financial capital of the world, there was a rise in new middle class composed of merchants, lawyers, and others who wanted to build in a style that reflected their money and their taste. England was at its prime, and artistic leaders had an impulse to create a national style that promoted English identity. In order to come up with a new style there had to be some way to judge whether or not an object was beautiful, which resulted in a group of architects, artists, writers, and others, called the “aesthetes,” who wrote on the idea of good “taste” and English identity.

One of the first architects to promote English nationalism, and reject the ‘muscular gothic’ emblematic of France and Italy, was William Butterfield. He was interested in an architectural expression that fused the Gothic teachings of Ruskin, and embodied the seventeenth and eighteenth domestic architecture of England. Butterfield’s ecclesiastical architecture in the 1850’s established the English Victorian Gothic style. Butterfield’s work in domestic architecture influenced both the Queen Anne Revival movement and the Arts and Crafts movement. English architectural elements characteristic of Butterfield’s work included red brick set against a green landscape, tile-hanging, and the abundance of small wooden sashes or casement windows. Other common elements included hipped roofs, numerous chimneys, and

---


hand-crafted ornament. Butterfield’s domestic work was original in conception yet derivative in detail, which resulted in a distinct style that promoted English identity.

Another member of the Aesthetic movement who was greatly inspired by Butterfield’s work was the architect Philip Webb. Webb frequently visited and sketched Butterfield’s built work. One of the most influential projects by Webb is Red House built for William Morris in 1859 (Figures 4 and 5). Similar to Butterfield, Webb designed the house in English red brick, except he went a step further and had each brick handmade. The image of the red brick house spread out against the green garden or lawn became symbolic of English architecture. Red House encapsulated the English architecture promoted by Butterfield, and foreshadowed the next movement in English architecture (towards the Arts and Crafts movement). In addition, Red House is symbolic of society’s longing for the country and their disapproval of industrialization, which continued for the next two decades. In 1855, several years before the completion of Red House, a group of artists began a friendship over a shared belief in the importance of taste and beauty. Members of the group that came to call themselves “Pre-Raphaelites” included Dante Gabriel Rossetti, William Morris, Edward Burne-Jones and Philip Webb.

The English architecture exemplified by Butterfield and Webb, combined with nostalgia for the pre-industrial past resulted in Old English style for country houses and Queen Anne Revival style for city dwellings and institutional buildings. At this time popular design books included suggestions for all of the elements encompassed in a house, such as *Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and Other Details* by Charles Eastlake, first published in 1868 in London and published subsequently in America. One of the handbooks to look back to English domestic architecture of the seventeenth and eighteenth century in the countryside was Robert Kerr’s *The English Gentleman’s House, Or, How to Plan English Residences* published in 1864.

The influence of the return to the “Queen Anne era” branched into two distinct styles: Old English and Queen Anne Revival, and later developed into the English Arts and Crafts movement. The Old English style became more prevalent in country houses and copied the domestic architecture in the seventeenth and eighteenth century during the reign of Queen Anne. In contrast, the Queen Anne Revival style had nothing to do with the architecture of Queen Anne’s era and instead emphasized playful modifications to classical architecture and picturesque detail.

---

Old English Architecture (1860’s-1870’s)

In 1870 the British Architectural Association published an essay in *Building News* titled “Notes on Some of the Timber Buildings in England During the Middle Ages.” The article emphasized the vernacular component of half-timber construction stating, “as a general rule, when our ancestors were about to build, they adapted to their use the materials which were readiest at

hand.” The article also commented on the declining number of timber buildings left in England, stating, “of timber buildings erected in the 14th century, we have many still left, and 20 years ago had many more. The tasteless, cruel, unnecessary and shameful destruction of such interesting and curious examples… cannot be alluded to without expressing feelings of contempt and indignation” (Figure 6). English architects began to value and care for these Old English buildings. One month later there was another article meant to be a continuation of the first. This article discussed the infill of half-timber framed dwellings in detail and vernacular materials such as sticks, lath, plaster and straw used to fill in the spaces between the structural wood members. The article also mentioned the different designs that could be accomplished with half-timbering, as well as the importance of a centralized hearth.

Two years later in The Architect, John Seddon published an article accompanied by an illustration which described a modest example of Old English domestic architecture. Seddon states, “even though these ordinary materials have, however, been handled in an artistic manner most judiciously, and the general effect is extremely happy” (Figure 7). An additional example of illustrations that suggested the nostalgia of Old English architecture was published in The Architect in 1876 (Figure 8).

---

Figure 6. “Notes on Some of the Timber Buildings in England During the Middle Ages,” Building News, (London: February 4, 1870) 95.

Figure 7. Seddon, John P. “Old English Domestic Architecture” The Architect (London: March 2, 1872) 107.
Richard Norman Shaw

One of the architects who pioneered Old English style manor house was Richard Norman Shaw. Shaw was born in Scotland in 1831, but when his father died, his mother moved the family from Scotland to England, where he was introduced to successful Scottish architect William Burn. Shaw had a five year apprenticeship under Burn, who designed English country houses the time. Through this apprenticeship, Shaw was introduced to William Eden Nesfield, another prominent architect who designed in Old English and Queen Anne Revival styles.

In 1854 Shaw won the Royal Academy Travelling Studentship, traveling to Italy, Germany, and France. In 1858 Shaw published a sketchbook titled *Architectural Sketches from the Continent*, from his travels where he noted his distaste for the architecture in Italy, but sketched many of vernacular cottages in Germany and France (Figure 9). By the 1860’s Shaw was skilled in designing asymmetrical picturesque estates that reflected Old English architecture. Shaw’s mastery of this style inspired the contemporary term “Shavian” to describe Old English architectural details applied to new, nineteenth century construction.

In 1863 architects Shaw and Nesfield opened up their own practice, and received numerous commissions across England. By 1870 the Royal Academy Exhibition displayed perspective

---

25 For further information on Richard Norman Shaw see Richard Norman Shaw by Andrew Saint.
drawings of Shaw’s large country estates such as Leyswood. Constructed in 1868 and published in 1871, Leyswood was the first Shaw country house to be published in British architectural journal *Building News* (Figure 10). Shaw’s houses used English vernacular materials such as tile-hanging, half-timbering, and tall brick chimneys. In addition to the exterior cladding, Shavian houses were most recognizable for chimneys and gables that playfully intersected, creating complex rooflines. Shaw’s creativity as an architect was his ability to tastefully combine English vernacular elements, typically half-timbering and tiled walls, with details from Tudor, Elizabethan and Jacobean styles.

Figure 9. Shaw, Richard Norman. *Architectural Sketches from the Continent.* London: Published by Day & Son, 1858.

Queen Anne Revival (1870’s-1880’s)

In addition to his success in Old English style country houses, Shaw was instrumental in the popularity of Queen Anne Revival architecture. The name “Queen Anne” streamed from the period of the reign of Queen Anne in Great Britain during the early eighteenth century. In 1873 Shaw’s Queen Anne Revival design for the New Zealand Chambers received admirable attention, and was published outside of England. Architects who followed Queen Anne Revival included John J. Stevenson. One of Stevenson’s notable works was his design for “The Red House” published in Building News in 1874 (Figure 11). Suburban communities like Bedford Park consisted entirely of Queen Anne Revival semi-detached dwellings.

In 1877 real estate promoter Jonathan Carr hired Shaw to design detached and semi-detached residences in Bedford Park. Shaw’s designs reflected a combination of Old English and Queen Anne motifs and contributed to the contemporary confusion between the two styles. At Bedford Park, Shaw and other architects used exterior cladding elements such as red brick, tile-hanging, and sunflower motifs as applied ornament on the houses (Figures 12, 13, 14).

The irony in the Queen Anne movement was the architect’s use of progressive technology that created the appearance of romanticized and picturesque homes. Queen Anne Revival was characterized by the contemporary saying Sweetness and Light, which related to the importance of pure air and natural lighting (as well as open-mindedness). The Queen Anne Revival had a long-standing influence on architecture in other countries, including America.


Figure 12. Bedford Park. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)
Americanization of the English Revival Styles

Although there were many stylistic differences between the American houses known as “Queen Anne” and their English predecessors, the main difference between the expression in the two countries is found in the materials used to texture a building’s exterior surface. The majority of domestic American Queen Anne examples are textured largely in wood because wood was widely available and inexpensive.\footnote{For a complete description of the American vernacular movement of the Queen Anne and late nineteenth century American architecture see \textit{The Queen Anne House} by Janet W. Foster. Janet W. Foster. \textit{The Queen Anne House: America's Victorian Vernacular}. New York: Abrams, 2006.} Another stylistic difference in the two styles was the
American adoption of colorful paint that differentiated exterior cladding. Typically English Queen Anne revival wood trim was painted white and stood out against the red brick.

English houses were nearly all constructed of brick, specifically in red brick with white trim, while a high proportion of American domestic architecture on the Atlantic coast was constructed of timber framing above a masonry substructure. Furthermore, as opposed to English houses, American houses rarely had jettied out upper stories; instead, a whimsical effect was achieved by the introduction of balconies and verandahs, which were more appropriate for weather conditions in America. Although Queen Anne architecture was largely described as an American vernacular style, it cannot be denied that the style had a strong connection to English antecedents, namely Queen Anne Revival and the Old English style of nineteenth century English domestic architecture.

---

CHAPTER 2: TRANSATLANTICISM AND ECLECTICISM IN AMERICA

Prior to the Civil War, American architects were already integrating English architectural styles into their domestic designs. Architects and their clients had access to English pattern books and periodicals, and they became aware of the fashionable architecture in England of the time. The direct translation of vernacular English architecture to American domestic architecture was a result of trained architects studying or traveling abroad, subscribing to English architectural journals, and manifesting these ideas in their designs.

Early Proponents of English Revival Styles in America

One of the first works that adapted Old English architecture to American dwellings was *Rural Architecture* by Marriott Field, published in New York in 1857. Field was an English architect who went on a professional sketching tour through Europe in the early 1840’s and later lived in America. Unlike his predecessors, Field was fully committed to integrating Old English and traditional English architecture into American country dwellings. Field relied entirely on designs already promoted by English architects, such as E.B. Lamb.

Field’s illustrations of “A Cottage in the Old English Style” and “A Farm-House in the Old English,” represent an attempted portrayal of English country architecture in an American setting (Figures 15 and 16). The illustration of “A Cottage in the Old English Style” is significant in that it’s an early image of English tile-hanging in a fish-scale pattern. The image also illustrated intricately carved English bargeboards. In the design for “A Farmhouse in the Old English Style” Field used the English vernacular expression of half-timbering as the decoration of the gables and upper stories on a home. The illustration also provided an example of grouped windows with small window panes.

Field was not able to make the Old English into a popular style in America at this time. Field’s book was not a bestseller; perhaps one reason was because it was not published by a major book publisher, such as Appleton or Scribner. Any momentum established by Field would have been interrupted by the Civil War, which began four years after the book’s publication. The successful introduction of English vernacular architecture occurred a decade later when other American architects and their clients studied and traveled abroad.

---


32 Marriott Field. *Rural architecture, or, Designs for villas, cottages, etc. : in the Italian, Gothic, Elizabethan, Old English, and Swiss styles, with descriptions and an essay on rural architecture and landscape gardening, including a critique on Ruskin's new theoretical principles of design*. New York, NY: Miller & Co, 1857.
Other English Revival styles, including the Gothic Revival popularized in America in part by architect Alexander Jackson Davis, had already infiltrated America. Davis was one of the proponents for assimilating English Renaissance Styles (Tudor, Elizabethan and Jacobean) into American architecture for Picturesque effect. Another influential artist of the period, and a colleague of Davis’, was Andrew Jackson Downing. Similar to Davis, Downing promoted the assimilation of English architecture into picturesque American cottages. Downing was instrumental in the promotion of the English Picturesque movement in America in the middle of the nineteenth century through his pattern books and essays in magazines.

Figure 15. Field, Marriott. *Rural architecture, or, Designs for villas, cottages....* New York, NY: Miller & Co, 1857. Design V. A Cottage in the Old English Style, 80

Figure 16. Field, Marriott. *Rural architecture, or, Designs for villas, cottages....* New York, NY: Miller & Co, 1857. Design X. A Farm-House in the Old English Style, 94
Introduction of the English Picturesque
In the middle of the nineteenth century, American architects established themselves and the profession. Prior to the founding of the first architecture school in America at Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 1865, Americans interested in architecture studied or traveled abroad. A few wealthy Americans attended the Ecoles des Beaux Arts in Paris, France, although the majority of people who called themselves architects in the period immediately after the Civil War continued to train in traditional apprenticeships (as draftsmen under the direction of more experienced architects).33

Richard Morris Hunt was one of the first architects to successfully popularize the English Picturesque into American resort architecture. From 1843 to 1855 Hunt studied architecture at the Ecoles des Beaux Arts and traveled extensively in Europe.34 While abroad, Hunt visited England, France, Germany and Switzerland. After Hunt returned from the Ecoles des Beaux Arts in 1855 he designed Picturesque style domestic architecture. In 1861 Hunt returned to Paris, and from there he visited England again. While on this trip, Hunt sketched English and French vernacular architecture, including the half-timbered buildings.35 While still in Europe, Hunt conceptualized the design of a summer “cottage” for an American couple, the Griswolds, he and his wife had met in France. The Griswold house differed from Hunt’s previous Picturesque style designs because there was a heavy reliance on Romanticized English, French and the continental Picturesque Swiss style.36

The Establishment of English Taste: Charles Eastlake
Once the country recovered after the Civil War, American architects had the opportunity to design grand houses for wealthy clients. In this period of recovery, American architects had to decide which architectural expression to follow. The Gothic Revival and Greek Revival were now very dated and the architects wanted to start where the Picturesque left off. Unlike Hunt who drew on many Continental sources to create a Picturesque style, the next high-style architecture would follow English taste. One of the movements to emerge during this time was the American interest in English architecture and literature.

36 For further information on Richard Morris Hunt and Picturesque architecture in America in the 1850’s-1860’s see Sarah Bradford Landau, “Richard Morris Hunt, the Continental Picturesque and the ‘Stick Style.’ Hunt’s success is due to the fact that he had first-hand exposure to English and Continental Picturesque architecture and because of his access to wealthy clients. Unlike the designs in Downing’s pattern books, Hunt’s designs were intended as individual architectural compositions and not as inspiration for carpenter-builders to emulate. Unfortunately, the momentum established during the Picturesque movement would be interrupted by the Civil War from 1861-1865.
In the late 1860’s and early 1870’s American architects and their clients engaged in English culture through means of literature and travel. One of the common books owned by American architects, including Henry Hobson Richardson, was Robert Kerr’s *The English Gentleman's House, Or, How to Plan English Residences*, published in 1864. The timing of the American appearance of British authors like Eastlake, Kerr, and others was important because they were available during the post war boom when Americans had regained their wealth. At this time architects and clients could afford to travel abroad. American architects and clients were searching for a style to counter the negative impacts of industrialization and the Old English manor house provided this style.

A popular piece of English literature that had a widespread impact on Americans at the time was architect Charles Eastlake's *Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and Other Details* (first published in 1868 in England and in 1872 in America).[37] Eastlake coined the concept of “taste,” which became an asset in American society. Eastlake encouraged both architects and their clients to study precedents to understand “good taste.” Through Eastlake, the commission of a trained architect became important to clients who wanted a home of taste.

> “And, in too many instances, where our architects have ignored the value of precedent and struck out in a new line for themselves, the result has been hopelessly clumsy or bizarre. It is only by a long and careful course of study, based on a naturally good and inventive taste, that these mistakes can be avoided on the part of the designer.”

Charles Eastlake, *Hints on Household Taste*, 18

In addition to studying architecture, Eastlake thought the trained architect should travel abroad and sketch important sites. After absorbing cultures abroad, it was the architect's responsibility to train the masses on the concept of taste by creating tasteful buildings. Eastlake also put some of the responsibility of tasteful design into the hands of the client.

> “Meanwhile, the public must do their part. If they will insist on the perpetuation of pretentious shams--if they will prefer a cheap and tawdry effect to legitimate and straightforward manufacture--no reform can possibly be expected. But if they encourage that sound and healthy taste which alone is found allied with conscientious labour, whether in workshop or the factory, then we may hope to see revived the ancient glory of those industrial arts which, while they derive a certain interest from tradition, should owe their highest perfection to civilised skill.”

Charles Eastlake, *Hints on Household Taste*, 264

---

Charles Eastlake successfully bridged the gap for Americans interested English taste, and his success is evident in the numerous editions of his book in America. Eastlake’s notion for craftsmanship and the importance of honest architecture echoed the Ruskin teachings of the time. In conclusion, attaining taste became an invaluable social asset in American society during the Victorian era.
CHAPTER 3: DEFINING ANGLO-AMERICAN DOMESTIC ARCHITECTURE

Anglo-American architecture is an architectural expression that relies on physical forms and intangible elements. In addition to exterior and interior architectural expressions, there is a component that relies on research of the background of the client and architect.

Anglophile Client
Attributes of the clients who commissioned an Anglo-American house typically included time spent in England, raised Episcopalian, and had a worldview that could be described simply as that of an “Anglophile.” An Anglophile is a person who greatly admires England and was an avid follower of English taste, literature and culture. This included Americans who were interested in the Evangelical movement and the Cambridge Camden Society within the Anglican or Episcopalian church. The client was usually well-traveled, and in some cases had an English education. In many cases the clients had scientific and religious interests. An Anglo-American was often religious and active in the Episcopal church. These clients often traced their ancestry to England and can claim descendancy from seventeenth century English settlers in New England. These clients were usually wealthy and believed they had good “taste,” and often commissioned architects to build them homes that reflected their English tastes.

Trained Architect
The trained architect was educated at an architecture school in America or abroad at the Ecoles des Beaux Arts. They traveled to England or apprenticed for English architects and they subscribed to contemporary English architectural journals such as Building News or The Architect. They owned English books including Robert Kerr’s The English Gentleman's House, Or, How to Plan English Residences and Richard Norman Shaw’s Architectural Sketches from the Continent. In some cases the architect was an anglophile or raised in an Anglophile household. For example, Stanford White’s father was an extreme Anglophile and he introduced White to English taste and culture at a young age.

Anglo-American Architecture: Character Defining Features
From close observation of English architectural periodicals and literature a list was created of character-defining features of Anglo-American domestic architecture.

---

Exterior

- Vertical massing
- Multiple materials
  - stone base, topped by stone or brick first story, and tile-hanging or wood shingles on second story
- Tile-hanging or wood shingles somewhere on the building
- Red-brick, often with red mortar, to create a monochromatic appearance
- Half-timbering (brick nogging or roughcast infill)
- No paint on trim
  - original trim and shingles left to weather or roughcast finishes
- Decorative panels – terra cotta on plaster
  - Floral or nature-inspired motif applied or carved into terracotta or stone (sunflower motif)
- Complex roof line (often intersected by gables and chimneys)
  - Gable roof
  - Hipped roof
  - Cross wing
  - Terracotta ridge tiles
  - Finials (cresting)
- Gables
  - Decorative and wide bargeboards (verge boards)
  - Finial (accentuating peak of gable)
  - Supported by wood jetties (brackets)
  - Bands of windows beneath projected gable
  - Gable end returns
- Numerous chimneys
  - Brick, tall
  - Intersect gable end
  - Non-traditional or random intersection with roof and gables
  - Not simply square-sectioned
  - Paneled chimneys or other decorative brick work on the length of the chimney
  - Terracotta chimney pots
  - Brick corbelling broadens profile of top of chimney
- Numerous windows
  - Dormer windows clad in tile-hanging or wood shingles
  - Small window panes (rectangular or diamond)
  - Grouped windows
  - Horizontally banded windows
  - Tall and slender windows
○ Gablet or eyebrow windows
● Sheltered entry or porte-cochere
● Service entrances to side or rear

Interior
● Entrance hall
  ○ Containing entry area, fireplace and staircase
● Expensive wood finishes
● Exposed wood beam ceilings
● Jacobean wood paneling
● Stained glass
● Care for the library
  ○ Bountiful collection of books, library of English literature, books about the Church of England, books on the history of England
CHAPTER 4. RESORT ARCHITECTURE: THE NEWPORT VILLAS

Anglo American architecture began in the post-Civil war period when wealthy clients commissioned architects to design their summer houses in resort towns. Resort towns offered an opportunity for architects to create eclectic architecture that could be bold yet tasteful. Architects began to try the new English Queen Anne in these resort towns first, as a place to experiment, for wealthy clients who knew England or avidly followed literature produced in England. These clients and architects had broad cultural connections to the upper class, were educated, had mid-late Victorian manners, and were members of the Anglican or Episcopalian church. Newport, Rhode Island is an example of a resort town where prominent members of society spent time hosting and socializing at their summer houses. Their summer villas were a reflection of their stature and conveyed their taste to society.

After the Civil War, Newport increased its position as a social center and by the early 1870’s Newport was considered the “social capital” for New Englanders (and other East Coast elites) to spend their summers. With the availability of wealthy clients with the financial means to build large summer cottages, well-known architects obtained commissions in Newport. Often these wealthy clients and their architects trained abroad and were exposed to European trends. For example, Richard Morris Hunt designed the John N.A. Griswold residence, on what would become prosperous Bellevue Avenue, in a Picturesque mode that would be described by twentieth century architectural historian Vincent Scully as the prototype of the Stick style. At the same time in England, emerging architects such as Richard Norman Shaw designed Old English manor houses, which became increasingly popular to reflect English vernacular tastes.

---


Watts Sherman House (Sherman House)\textsuperscript{42}

While the Watts Sherman house is undeniably one of the precursors to the Shingle Style in America, there is also a strong English influence on the original design (Figures 17 and 18).\textsuperscript{43} There is discussion whether architect Henry Hobson Richardson or his chief assistant Stanford White are responsible for the Shavian details on the interior and the exterior of the house. An additional explanation for the Shavian style is the role of the clients in the creation of the Anglo-American inspired design. Starting in the 1870’s American architects used both “Old English” and “Queen Anne Revival” elements as a way for Anglophiles to express their values through their homes.

Figure 17. Watts-Sherman House. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)

\textsuperscript{42} There are two titles for the house. Historically the house has been cited as the Watts Sherman house, but a contemporary title has been provided by in “The East Elevation of the Sherman House…” published in 1993 by Jeffrey Karl Ochsner and Thomas C. Hubka. In the footnote on page 90 the authors state that the house was initially owned by Annie Wetmore Sherman and that the house should be referred to as the Sherman House.

\textsuperscript{43} While the Watts Sherman house is undeniably one of the precursors to the Shingle Style style in America historians have missed an important part of the house, which is that it is one of a a group of houses designed with Shavian influence. In "H. H. Richardson: The Design of the William Watts Sherman House" by Jeffrey Karl Ochsner and Thomas C. Hubka the authors acknowledge the house influenced both the Shingle Style and English Queen Anne architecture; however, the article misses that there are other Shavian houses in America and the Watts Sherman is part of the period of Anglo-American architecture. There is a period of Anglo-American architecture with a strong allegiance to Richard Norman Shaw’s and other architects work published in English architectural journals. Furthermore in Mosette Broderick’s Triumvirate: McKim, Mead & White: Art, Architecture, Scandal, and Class in America’s Gilded Age she states that the Watts Sherman is the sole Shavian house in America; however, the case studies of other Anglo-American examples in the thesis prove otherwise.
The Clients
William Watts Sherman was born on August 4, 1842 in Albany, New York.\textsuperscript{44} Sherman’s family traced its ancestry to Dedham, England, and in 1633 his ancestor Philip Shearman moved to Roxbury, Massachusetts.\textsuperscript{45} In 1637 Philip Shearman moved to Rhode Island and purchased land from the local native Americans.\textsuperscript{46} William Sherman’s father moved to New York City in 1851 to become a partner in the investment banking firm Duncan, Sherman & Company.\textsuperscript{47}

As a child William was sent to Europe for his education, and he attended private schools in England and Scotland.\textsuperscript{48} Throughout his childhood, Sherman was exposed to English tastes, which would result in his reputation as an Anglophile. Sherman attended the University of Heidelberg and studied medicine before moving back to New York to work for his father’s banking firm.\textsuperscript{49} William was a well-known member of both New York and Newport society, which is how he met his wife, Annie Derby Rogers Wetmore.

Annie’s family lineage traced back to Thomas Whitmore, who came to New England in 1635.50 Annie’s father, William Shepard Wetmore, was born in Vermont in 1801. Wetmore spent the majority of his life abroad because he was involved in the opium trade in both China and England.51 Wetmore married his first wife Esther Phillips in London on October 24, 1837.52 Wetmore married a second time to Anstice Rogers of Salem, Massachusetts, with whom he had two children, George Peabody Wetmore and Annie Derby Rogers Wetmore.53 In 1852 Wetmore retired to Newport and moved to his residence, Chateau-sur-Mer. Wetmore was well-known in English society, and in 1857 he threw a party for George Peabody, Esq., a wealthy American banker who lived in London. At the party, “distinguished strangers from Europe, the British provinces and the different states of the Union were present.”54

Annie Derby Rogers Wetmore was born in 1848 in London, England.55 Annie was educated in Europe and spent her “childhood and adolescent years in England.”56 Like her future husband William, Annie was familiar with English taste and tradition. After her father’s death, she moved to Newport, Rhode Island to help her brother George run their family estate, Chateau-sur-Mer. William Watts Sherman and Annie were introduced through Annie’s brother George Peabody Wetmore, and married in Newport on July 5, 1871.57

In 1874, William Watts Sherman and Annie Wetmore commissioned architect H.H. Richardson to build them a summer cottage, on a piece of land adjacent to Annie’s family estate, Chateau-sur-Mer.58 The Sherman choice in Richardson as the architect was significant because Annie’s family already had a relationship with prominent architect Richard Morris Hunt. Although both Richard Morris Hunt and H.H. Richardson were educated at the Ecoles des Beaux Arts, Richardson had just returned from a trip to England and was more familiar with English

architectural trends. The Sherman’s were Anglophiles and chose an architect to reflect their English tastes.

**The Architects: Henry Hobson Richardson and Stanford White**

Before he studied at the *Ecoles des Beaux Arts*, Richardson traveled through England and had extensive exposure to the English country house design. Richardson owned two of the most popular books on English country houses: *The Gentleman's House; or, How to Plan English Residences*, published in 1864 Robert Kerr and *The Mansions of England in the Olden Time*, published by Joseph Nash in 1839. The medieval style interior plates in the Nash book were very similar to the interior sketches of the Watts Sherman house, published in *The New York Sketch Book* in 1875.

Richardson was also aware of Richard Norman Shaw’s designs and owned a copy of his book, *Architectural Sketches from the Continent*, published in 1872. Furthermore, Richardson subscribed to *Building News*, a weekly architectural journal published in London, which regularly included full plates of Richard Norman Shaw country houses. There are many details in the Watts Sherman house that are directly copied from Shaw’s published work in *Building News*, which will be discussed later in the paper. Richardson also owned at least twelve texts by John Ruskin including *Modern Painters*, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* and *The Stones of Venice*. Although Richardson was by no means an Anglophile, he clearly had an interest in English culture.

Stanford White’s background offers an additional explanation for the transmittal of the Old English details to the Watts Sherman house. During the construction of the Watts Sherman house, Stanford White was the Chief Assistant to H.H. Richardson. By 1874 Richardson had moved from New York City, the location of his office, to Brookline, Massachusetts, to oversee

---

59 For a complete description of Richardson’s architecture see Jeffrey Karl Ochsner’s, *H.H. Richardson complete architectural works.*
the construction of Trinity Church, his largest commission at the time. Once in Brookline, Richardson sent his design sketches to the New York office, and these designs were further developed by Stanford White. Since the primary Sherman residence was in New York City, the couple would likely have met with White in New York.

Another explanation for the Shavian influence is Stanford White’s exposure to traditional English arts and architecture as a child. White’s father, Richard Grant White, was a Shakespearean scholar and an avid Anglophile. Richard White was well connected in art and society in New York and London. Stanford White’s exposure to English art is evident in the sketching technique used in his perspective drawing of the Watts Sherman fireplace and inglenook. After White left Richardson’s office to begin his career with Mckim, Mead and White, the English sketching technique as well as the Shavian elements disappear from Richardson’s projects.

The first published illustration of the Watts Sherman house were plates by Stanford White in the New York Sketch Book in May 1875. The exterior sketch illustrates Shavian detail, and a whimsical design (Figure 19). The interior sketch conveys a “sense of light and air given by the drawing” (Figure 20). The stylized sketch technique originated from the Aesthetic Movement and Queen Anne Revival popular in England at the time. Another stylistic choice in the sketch is the wide angle of the drawing, which would be impossible to see within the house. The unrealistic angle of the perspective was meant to convey a romanticized perception of the house. The drawing illustrated the wood beam ceiling, wood panelling, fireplace and staircase, which were prevalent in the living halls in English Queen Anne Revival architecture. These two sketches were intended to convey the progressive tastes of the architects, but instead display elements copied directly from the published projects by Richard Norman Shaw.

---

English Influence on the Design

The Watts Sherman house was completed in 1876, and was one of the last projects by the New York architectural firm of Gambrill and Richardson. A variety of materials were used at each level. The final design was two and a half stories, consisting of a stone base on the first floor topped by shingles on the second, with half-timbering on the third floor. At the ground floor, the base is pink granite cut in different sizes with an orange sandstone trim. The thoughtful, irregular and rustic placement of the ashlar blocks is a prominent feature of Richardsonian Romanesque design, a style which developed throughout Richardson’s career. The varying size of stone blocks also reflects the romanticized English country house design of the house.


The composition of a stone base followed by shingles and half-timbering on the second and third floors was a defining feature of Shavian country houses, such as Leyswood (Figure 21). Leyswood was built in 1868, and was the first Shavian country house to be published in Building News in 1871. Richard Norman Shaw’s most well-known country houses (Leyswood, Preen Manor, Grim’s Dyke, and Hopedene) were all published in Building News between 1871 to 1874. These published drawings by Richard Norman Shaw enabled a few American architects to practice what they absorbed from English architectural journals. Based on Richardson’s subscription to Building News and travel in England it is not a coincidence that there was a strong Shavian influence on the design of the Watts Sherman house. Furthermore, many of the features in the Watts Sherman house were directly copied from these published country houses.


Massing
Today the Watts Sherman house appears very horizontal, but the original Richardson design was more English and vertical. The house was expanded several times, including one early addition by Stanford White (1881) and two later additions by Newport architect Dudley Newton (1890, 1904).70 The final expansion was the addition of the wing on the north side of the house. The verticality of the house only exists in early photographs and original drawings. The original vertical massing, the steep gables and complex rooflines was very English and reflected the strong Shavian influence on the design.

**Gables and Bargeboards**

The gables on the north, east and south facades framed by decorative bargeboards are copied from English antecedents. The gable above the entrance on the west facade is the only gable not framed by decorative bargeboards. Instead, the west facade of the house is characterized by a large sweeping gable, which has been attributed to a later design decision by Richardson (Figure 22).

Although the dramatic, asymmetrical front gable is not derived from a published Shaw design, there are other sources in English architectural journals to explain this form. In 1873, one year prior to construction, a design for a gate lodge was published in *Building News* (Figure 23). The most prominent feature of this gate lodge is a long, asymmetrical gable, capped with a finial and decorated with thin wooden bargeboards. In addition to the asymmetrical gable, there are other elements of The Gate House present in the Watts Sherman house including the finials, ridge tiles, and combination of tile-hanging and half-timbering. Another example of a large asymmetrical gable, which almost touches the ground similar to the Watts Sherman gable is the side elevation of an illustration published in *Building News* in 1872 (Figure 24).

In addition to its asymmetrical and horizontal emphasis the main gable on the Watts Sherman house also differed from the other gables on the house through its use of a thin bargeboard. A similar bargeboard exists in the Shaw’s country house Grim’s Dyke, also known as Harrow Weald, published in Building News in 1872 (Figure 25). The other gables on the Watts Sherman house are wider and feature ornamentation derived from English sources. An additional view of Grim’s Dyke reveals how the bargeboard and ornamentation on many gables of the Watts Sherman house are copied directly from Shavian designs (Figure 26). For example, this view Grim’s Dyke features the wide ornamental bargeboards framing half-timbering and rows of
windows inside a gable, present in the Watts Sherman house. The bargeboards on the north and east sides on the Watts Sherman are ornamented with circular carvings similar to the shape of a rosette (Figures 22 and 27). These circular carvings are derived from English sources (Figures 28 and 29). The overall composition of the gables and bargeboards was also derived from Shavian sources, and the complex roofline included numerous chimneys copied from English sources.

Figure 25. "House Recent Erected at Harrow Weald (Grim’s Dyke), Richard Norman Shaw, 1874." *Building News*, London, 1872.

Figure 26: "House Recent Erected at Harrow Weald (Grim’s Dyke), Richard Norman Shaw, 1874." *Building News*, London, 1872.

Chimneys

Shavian and English vernacular elements in the Watts Sherman house include the tall chimneys, steep gables, and wide bargeboards. The fluted red-brick chimneys are prominent Shavian elements copied in the Watts Sherman house. On the west elevation of the Watts Sherman a tall chimney intersects the roof overhang (Figure 30). On the main facade at Leyswood a chimney also intersected the roof overhang and touched the ground like the Watts Sherman house (Figure 31).

The chimney on the west elevation of the Watts Sherman house was ornamented with an inscribed panel, similar to a chimney on the main elevation at Leyswood. The chimney inscription is derived from other English sources, including a house published in The Architect in 1874 (Figure 32). The inscription on the chimney at Richard Norman Shaw’s Preen Manor is also similar to the chimney on the west elevation of Watts Sherman. The chimney at Preen Manor

was similar to the chimney on the north side of the Watts Sherman that playfully intersected the peak of the end gable (Figures 33 and 34).


Figure 32. “Residence at Hildenborough” The Architect, London, 1874.

Exterior Cladding

The fabric of exterior walls of the Watts Sherman is made of a variety of materials. The second and third floor are covered in unpainted cedar shingles, machine-cut in a variety of shapes. The choice to leave the shingles to weather could have been inspired from Ruskin’s views on honesty of material. Ruskin believed that materials should be left unpainted in their natural state. The wooden shingles are an American interpretation of the English terracotta tile-hanging, popularized by Shavian country houses, and also an homage to a traditional American building material from the pre-industrial houses of New England.

Additional ornamentation on the upper floors includes half-timbering inset in stucco derived from Old English and Shavian manor houses. Other uses of terracotta include the inscribed panel on the west elevation of the Watts Sherman house. Terracotta panels and rosettes are a common characteristic of Old English and Shavian country houses.\textsuperscript{72} For example, the decorative terracotta panel just below the peak of the gable on the West facade of the Watts Sherman house was copied from the smaller twin gable at Shaw’s Grim Dyke (Figures 35 and 36). The decorative terracotta panel on the Watts Sherman house no longer exists.

\textsuperscript{72} See figure 7 in chapter 1.
The windows at the Watts Sherman house were composed of grouped windows and horizontal banded windows. The small size of the window sash and panes suggested the nostalgic trend in English architecture to include elements that falsely appear to be constructed prior to industrialization. The bands of windows on the west facade of the house create an inglenook and are supported by wood jetties. Both the concept of the inglenook and the jetty to support overhangs is derived from English sources and are main components in the four Shavian country houses discussed in this chapter (Leyswood, Preen Manor, Grim’s Dyke, and Hopedene). The horizontally banded windows within the gable on the west facade of the Watts Sherman are
similar to the windows on the entrance gable at Grim’s Dyke. The windows within the polygonal bay on the east elevation of the Watts Sherman are configured similar to the Shavian country house Hopedene (Figures 37, 38, 39). The sketch of Hopedene was very significant as the first plan published of a Shavian country house (Figure 39). The prominent polygonal bay at Hopedene inspired the east elevation of the Watts Sherman house. The east elevation of the Watts Sherman has been severely altered, and this polygonal bay no longer exists.


**Interior**

In plan the house is sixty feet wide, by thirty six feet deep with a twelve foot L-shape extension at the southeast portion of the house (Figure 40). After entering under a porte-cochere, there is a living hall with a wide staircase, common in English country house design. The large living hall stretches all the way to the rear of the house, illustrating one of the early examples of the open floor plan. The first floor is decorated in a Jacobean English revival style, and features exposed wood beam ceilings and wood panelling on the walls. There is also a large hooded fireplace, inspired by the popularity of English medieval revival, with doorways on each side. On the second floor, there is a large amount of natural light due to the horizontally banded windows on the west facade. Each small glass pane was decorated with painted yellow and gold floral patterns. The intricate craftsmanship of the house was influenced by the Arts and Crafts movement in England. Similar to the first floor, the master bedroom is decorated in the Jacobean style with wood paneling.

One of the reasons the Watts Sherman is usually noted as the precursor to the shingle style as opposed to its English inception is because the house was expanded numerous times by three different architects. Many of the Shavian elements present in the Watts Sherman house are only evident in the original photographs and drawings. On each elevation of the Watts Sherman, there are many architectural elements borrowed from Shaw’s English manorial mode, which Shaw adapted from seventeenth century and eighteenth century English vernacular architecture. One of

---

the reasons the Watts Sherman house looks English, but slightly imprecise was because American architects had to improvise on the traditional English materials and construction methods. There were not terracotta tiles available in America so Richardson copied English tile-hanging using machine-cut wood shingles. Additional substitutions include the Americanized English bargeboards due to the lack of access to carpenters with knowledge of traditional English construction methods. The Watts Sherman house is an improvisation of a Shavian manor house, reflective of Richardson and White’s creative ability to fabricate English elements with American materials.

Public Interpretation

The ‘originality’ of the Watts Sherman house was frequently discussed in local Newport newspapers and in American architectural journals. One of the first mentions of the house occurred in the *Newport Mercury* in January 1875, which stated the house would start construction in the Spring.76 By October of the same year the house was mentioned again as “one of the finest and most expensive houses” under construction in Newport.77 The favorable article states, “it is of ample dimensions and the architectural appearance is fine. It is to be finished inside in an elegant manner, and will be when completed a model house.”78 Instead of describing the physical appearance of the house, the articles focused on the wealth of materials and expense of the construction of the house.

76 *Newport Mercury*, J. Franklin, January 9, 1875.
77 *Newport Mercury*, J. Franklin, October 16, 1875.
78 *Newport Mercury*, J. Franklin, October 16, 1875.
After the house’s completion, the *Newport Journal*, attempted to describe the style of the architecture. The article stated:

“The most expensive house building is for Mrs. W. Watts Sherman, wife of a partner in the banking firm of Duncan, Sherman & Co., of New York. It is situated on the cliffs in the rear of the residence of Nathan Matthews of Boston… Its style is neither Roman nor Grecian, and so far the contractors have been unable to find a name for it. Everything in it and about the mansion is antique. Taking away the handsome material used in its finish, however, it reminds me of one of the houses built a century ago… the [chimney] reminds one of ‘ye ancient time’… The window-panes are really old-fashioned, the smallest being 3 ¼ x 4 ½ inches… no paint or oil has been used, outside, and even the window sills are to be left just as they were when the carpenters finished them. It is the wish of the owner that it may look as if it had been built for years.”

Although the author was unable to identify the style of the house, the words used to describe the house as “built a century ago,” “ye ancient time,” and “old-fashioned” are exactly how the architect and client would have wanted the public to comprehend from the house. The clients wanted their house that reflected their knowledge of English tastes and their financial ability to employ an architect familiar with fashionable styles abroad. The first American exposure to English manor houses occurred at the Centennial Exposition of May 1876. Since the Watts Sherman house was completed prior to the Exposition, the general public was not exposed to Shavian manor houses, which explains the descriptive yet confused article in the *Newport Journal*.

**Conclusion**

The irony exposed in the Watts Sherman house is that what seemed innovative to critics at the time of the house’s completion, was actually copied from English sources. The *Newport Journal* called the house “very novel,” and was the first acknowledgement of the inventive Old English and Queen Anne revival style within the American context. However, the architecture of the Watts Sherman house was only innovative within America. Richardson and White’s accomplishment in the Watts Sherman house was their ability to popularize architecture in England and their capability to fabricate Shavian details in local American materials. Richard Norman Shaw’s ability to adapt traditional architectural fabric into a conventional and fashionable house, resulted in the revival of the English manor house in England, which later influenced American domestic architecture.

---

79 *Newport Journal*, April 29, 1876.
80 *Newport Journal*, April 29, 1876.
81 *Newport Journal*, April 29, 1876.
Charles H. Baldwin House

Also along Newport’s prominent Bellevue Avenue, and several blocks north of the Watts Sherman residence is the Charles H. Baldwin House, designed by the firm Potter & Robertson in 1877 (Figure 41). The Baldwin House also features many architectural features derived from the English country house, and bears many similarities to the Shavian influence on the Watts Sherman house. The Baldwin House was an even more playful interpretation of the Americanization of the English Queen Anne Revival.

The whimsical composition of the Baldwin House is a reflection of the high-style of Anglo-American architecture with American Queen Anne influence. Potter and Robertson were commissioned to design the Baldwin House in 1877, the same year that *The American Architect and Building News* published an article titled “A Talk About Queen Anne.” The article stated Queen Anne,

> “can only truly be thought of as the period of odds and ends, beauty in any form, cosiness, comfort, picturesqueness,—in short, the ‘brick-a-brac’ style. Perhaps Thackeray had as much to do with it as Morris or Shaw or the furniture men. But no one can shut their eyes to it in London.”

“A Talk About ‘Queen Anne’” (April 28, 1877)

---

The Clients
Similar to the Shermans, the Baldwins were engaged in Newport society and interested in English taste and culture. Commodore Baldwin was known as “the wealthiest officer in the United States Navy” and this was his summer villa.  

The Baldwin family in America was from Buckinghamshire and Oxfordshire, England. Commodore Baldwin’s ancestry traced to some of the first English settlers to in New England. Baldwin was born in New York City on September 3, 1822 and joined the Navy in 1839. In 1845 Baldwin graduated from the Naval School in Philadelphia and served the in the United States Navy around the world. Baldwin’s duties included travel to Mexico, the West Indies, South America, Africa, Spain and Portugal, among other places.

In 1864 Baldwin returned to New York and later resumed duty in California until 1873. In 1876 Baldwin was promoted to Commodore and spent the early 1880’s commanding an American ship stationed in Europe and attended the coronation of Tsar Alexander III in Moscow. Throughout his impressive career in the Navy, Baldwin was exposed to international trends and European culture. Baldwin traveled back and forth between Europe and his Newport cottage, became his primary residence. Baldwin was engaged in Newport society and his impressive travels often appeared in the local Newport newspaper, the *Newport Mercury*. 

Baldwin’s first wife died in 1872 and in 1875 he married Mary Reade. With his first wife he had two children, Charles H. and Florence. Charles H. was born in 1860 and was a graduate of Harvard University. Florence married the wealthy Edward Parker Deacon of Boston in 1883 and lived in Paris. Florence met her husband at a Newport party and they both enjoyed “wide social popularity.” Florence, the mother of Princess Radziwill, lived in Europe for the remainder of her life and she died in Rome in 1918. Both Charles H. and Florence’s accomplishments are representative of the Baldwin family’s stature.

Prior to the completion of their home in 1878, Commodore and Mrs. Baldwin went to Europe in March to attend the Paris Exposition. When the couple returned in June of the same year they

---

83 "Former Mrs. E.P. Deacon is Dead." *Boston Herald*, 1918.
87 *Newport Mercury*, May 29, 1886.
90 "Former Mrs. E.P. Deacon is Dead." *Boston Herald*, 1918.
91 "Former Mrs. E.P. Deacon is Dead." *Boston Herald*, 1918.
92 "Newport- Extensive Improvements Going on in the fashionable Seaside Resort." Newspaper not listed. Clipping of Newspaper article found in the Charles Handy Russell Scrapbook Volume III, p. 139, article published March 26, 1878.
moved into their recently completed summer villa, which was stated to have cost them close to $50,000. Their travels to and from Europe throughout the completion of their home and prior to the commission reflected their interest in European tastes and trends, which immensely impacted the design of their Newport villa.

The Architects
The architects commissioned to design the Baldwin summer villa were William Appleton Potter and Robert Henderson Robertson of the firm Potter & Robertson based in New York City. The first Potter ancestor that arrived in New England was Robert Potter in 1634, who came from Coventry, England. William Appleton Potter was born in 1842 in Schenectady, New York. Potter’s family was very involved in the Church and his father was Reverend Alonzo Potter. In 1845 his family moved to Philadelphia where he attended the Episcopal Academy. Potter graduated from Union College in 1864 and traveled in 1865 to Europe for almost two years, studying in France. After his return from Europe, Potter apprenticed at his brother, architect, Edward Tuckerman Potter’s office, and practiced on his own by 1869. Potter’s major architectural accomplishments include the Chancellor Green Library at Princeton University in 1873 and his appointment as supervising architect of the United States Treasury in 1875.

Potter’s early tendency to English Queen Anne Revival and Picturesque architecture was evident in a sketch of a country house for John Crosby Brown in Orange Mountain, New Jersey, published in the New York Sketchbook of Architecture in 1874 (Figure 42). In the sketch, the English elements included the carved barge boards, tall chimneys that intersected steep gables, and iron crested finials. An American feature was the curved verandah on the side of the house. Potter was heavily involved in the decorative arts and architecture profession and lectured for the Fellowship of American Institute of Architects from 1876-1884. After retirement in 1900, Potter moved to Rome where he died in 1909.
In 1874 Potter hired Robert Henderson Robertson as his junior partner and they established the firm Potter & Robertson, and practiced through 1880.103 R.H. Robertson was born in Philadelphia in 1849 and built a number of religious and institutional buildings in New York City.104 Like Potter, Robertson exhibited an English influence in his domestic designs. Robertson’s English impulse was evident in his sketch for a cottage at Seabright, New Jersey, published in *American Architect and Building News* in 1876 (Figure 43).105 The exterior featured strong English antecedents and was described as “[being] of wood construction, the inside framing being left exposed finished in oil and shellac… the chimney-breasts are carried up of pressed and white brick with bands of colored tile… the sea being within a hundred yards of the piazza in front.”106 At this time, Robertson followed the idea to leave the materials in their natural color, instead of painting the wood members.

In addition, the same issue of *American Architect and Building News* included a sketch of the interior of another Robertson cottage in Seabright, which illustrated English Arts and Crafts movement and Charles Eastlake influence (Figure 44).107 Like Potter, Robertson had experience with designing resort villas for prominent clients, and based on their previous work the firm’s commission for the Baldwin House was logical.

One year prior to the published sketch of the Baldwin House, in May 1877, Potter & Robertson’s elevation, perspective, and plans for a house in Long Branch, New Jersey were published in the *American Architect & Building News* (Figure 45).108 Evident in elevation in the Long Branch house there was Shavian influence copied directly from English sources and the Watts Sherman house, which included the gable with bargeboards and half-timbering. Another element, copied directly from Shaw’s published work was the small gable tucked into the corner of the larger gable. This design also featured the open plan and entry hall, prominent in Queen Anne revival designs of the period.

The description of the house stated “it is finished in the interior with light woods, and the furniture, designed by the architects, will be in harmony with the general finish of the various rooms,” reflecting the firm’s interest in the Arts and Crafts Movement concept of a total work of art. The furniture also resembled an Eastlake influence.109 Together Potter and Robertson

designed Gothic Revival and Queen Anne buildings in America. Their commission for the Baldwin House owes a strong debt to published images of the Watts Sherman house and English sources. The Baldwin house also exhibited the influence of the English Queen Anne and Richard Norman Shaw on American architecture of the post-Civil War period.

Figure 42. “Design for a Country House. William A. Potter” New York Sketchbook of Architecture, 1874.

Figure 43. “Cottage at Seabright, New Jersey. R.H. Robertson” American Architect and Building News, 1876.
Figure 44. “Interior of Dining Room, Seaside Cottage, Seabright, New Jersey. R.H. Robertson” *American Architect and Building News*, 1876.

Figure 45. “West Elevation of House for Bryce Gray. Potter & Robertson” *American Architect and Building News*, 1877.
English Influence on the Design
On October 19, 1877, Charles H. Baldwin purchased a tract of land in Newport, Rhode Island and commissioned the firm Potter and Robertson, who had previous experience in designing resort villas in an eclectic Queen Anne Revival style. The builder or contractor for the Baldwin house was P.E. Read of Hartford, Connecticut. In March 1878 the first perspective sketch and plans were published of the C.H. Baldwin House (Figure 46). The perspective illustrated the strong influence of the Watts Sherman house on the Baldwin House.

Massing
The volume of the house is primarily a large rectangle, eighty feet by sixty feet in plan and two and half stories high. The dramatic entrance to the house is created by the horizontal porte-cochere attached to the vertical gable, both clad in decorative wood framing. The entrance of the house depicts the playful and picturesque style associated with American architects who experimented with architectural modes of the English Queen Anne revival. On the exterior there is red brick on the first floor topped with painted clapboard and weathered shingles on the upper floors. The complex roof is broken up by smaller gables and brick chimneys.


---

10 Newport Journal, December 1877.
**Gables**

The west gable on the entry to the house is similar to Watts Sherman, but is more directly copied from English sources. The third story framed by the gable is similar to an illustration published in *Building News* in 1874 (Figures 46 and 47). Similarities include the shingle cladding (tile-hanging in the English source), grouped windows below a small horizontal overhang, and a finial at the peak of the gable. Additionally, the steep gable on the south elevation of the Baldwin house is intersected by a chimney, which copied the chimney composition in Richard Norman Shaw’s Leyswood, Preen Manor and Grim’s Dyke (Figure 46).

**Figure 47. “Orrest Bank” Building News, London, 1874.**

**Exterior Cladding**

Unlike the Watts Sherman house, the first floor of the Baldwin house is red brick. Similar to English antecedents and the Watts Sherman house, the upper floors are clad in half-timbering & shingles. In contrast to the Watts Sherman house, the half-timbering at the Baldwin house is set with brick-nogging instead of stucco (Figure 48). The brick-nogging was copied from an English trend in the mid 1870’s (Figures 49, 50). The woodwork that mimics half-timbering varies between slanted and vertical segments of wood cladding. The Baldwin house combined both slanted and vertical wood work to add embellishment to the exterior of the house, similar to a house published in *The Architect* in 1876 (Figure 51). The number of textures created by the wood clapboard, brick-nogging, half-timbering, and terracotta panel was eclectic yet appropriate for a summer villa on Bellevue Avenue.
Figure 48. Charles H. Baldwin House. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)

Turned Columns
Unlike the Watts Sherman house the Baldwin house incorporated turned columns and whimsical wood carvings throughout the exterior. The carved woodwork in the spindles (turned columns) on the Baldwin house reflected the Arts and Crafts movement. On the second floor of the west elevation the small balcony is framed by turned columns, similar to the balcony published in *The Architect* in 1875 (Figures 52 and 53). These turned columns are similar to the spindle work in elevations published in *The Architect* in 1876 (Figure 54). The small gable on the top of the balcony is tucked inside the larger main gable, which is a common characteristic in Shavian design. While some historians have argued the ground floor porch with an overhanging roof is representative of the American verandah there are English precedents published throughout 1870’s (Figure 55).
Figure 52. Charles H. Baldwin House. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)

Figure 53. “House proposed to be built… on the Estate of Spencer Wells Esq.”
*The Architect*, London, 1875
Figure 54. “Residence. Wootton. Isle of Wight” *The Architect*, London, 1876.

Figure 55. “Woodheath” *The Architect*, London, 1876.
Windows

The small window sash and panes are indicative of the Potter & Roberton’s exposure to the English domestic designs and published Shavian country houses. In addition to Shaw, English architects such as William Butterfield used small windows to reflect a nostalgia for the pre-industrial past. The small windows also align the home with the ideas that transformed into the Arts and Crafts movement in England. These small windows reflect the Old English taste in the house. The variety of shapes and sizes of the windows, most noticeable on the rear facade of the house, reflects the whimsical and eclectic character of the Baldwin house (Figure 56).

Interior

The interior features an open plan with a large central living hall, which originally rose to the full height of the house’s two and half stories. The double height entry hall, containing the staircase is a feature present in English manor houses, and was most likely inspired by Kerr’s book on the English Gentleman’s House or Eastlake’s book Hints on Household Taste, discussed in the previous chapters of the thesis. The public rooms on the ground floor seen by guests were meant to show off the client’s taste and wealth. These public rooms are clad in wood paneling and exhibit Queen Anne motifs.\(^\text{112}\)

Public Interpretation
Immediately following the completion of their house the Newport Daily News of 1878 stated the Baldwin’s “threw open their new villa… for the purpose of entertaining” English and American officers.  Guests included the English and American ministers, captains, and prominent members of English society on holiday in Newport. In addition to their hospitality, the Baldwins hosted this party to show off their new home and their English tastes and values represented in the design.

The Baldwin house was immediately praised by Newport society and in 1878 a newspaper article described the house as “a very tasty appearing villa.” The full article stated:

"A very tasty appearing villa, after plans by Messrs. Potter and Robertson, of New York, will be completed early in June for Commodore C.H. Baldwin, United States Navy, of New York. It is located on Bellevue Avenue, a little south of the Ocean House, and adjoins the summer residence of the late Henry DeRahm, of New York. The site was purchased last summer from the heirs of Mr. DeRahm. The house is built of brick and wood. It is 95 feet long by 56 feet wide, but owing to its being cut up it does not look as large. All the ridges in the roofs are surmounted by a combing of an antique pattern, with turned finials of wood, surmounted with iron vanes of a very neat design. The outside of the house is part shingled, clapboarded, sheathed and carved, not two of its moulding being alike, and when it is taken into consideration that there are 150 patterns, an idea can be had of the work necessary to carry out the plans. [Facade in front is also covered pressed brick.] Above the large window are smaller ones in diamond pattern, thus showing the ancient as well as modern style. A porte-cochere extends over the front entrance some thirty feet, and it is of a very ancient style…"

The positive excerpt continues to describe the interior decorative features at length. Clearly the Baldwins built a house prominent enough for Newport society that reflected their polished tastes and international travels.

113 “Courtesies to Our Visitors.” Newport Daily News (Newport), September 4, 1878.
114 “Courtesies to Our Visitors.” Newport Daily News (Newport), September 4, 1878.
115 “Newport- Extensive Improvements Going on in the fashionable Seaside Resort.” Newspaper not listed. Clipping of Newspaper article found in the Charles Handy Russell Scrapbook Volume III, p. 139, article published March 26, 1878.
116 “Newport- Extensive Improvements Going on in the fashionable Seaside Resort.” Newspaper not listed. Clipping of Newspaper article found in the Charles Handy Russell Scrapbook Volume III, p. 139, article published March 26, 1878.
Conclusion
In conclusion, the Baldwin House demonstrates the influence of the Watts Sherman house and the architect and clients English taste. The Baldwins had ties to England, the Episcopal church and prominence in society, therefore, they were influenced by English country house antecedents and Shavian manor houses of the early 1870’s. The house has a clear connection Charles Eastlake interior design and the Shavian Country house in America. In comparison to the Watts Sherman house, the Baldwin house has a stronger translation of the English Arts and Crafts movement exemplified in the extensive wood craftsmanship on the exterior and interior of the house. The amount of craftsmanship contributed to the Baldwin house is manifested in expensive villas built during the post-Civil war period of American architecture.
CHAPTER 5. URBAN ARCHITECTURE: THE DOUBLE COTTAGE

Randall Duplex

The Randall Duplex was built by Alexander Randall for his son John Wirt Randall and his wife. The double cottage is located on a prominent roundabout in Annapolis, Maryland, adjacent to the State House, and in front of the original Randall family homestead. The Randall family had exposure to Old English and Queen Anne Revival architecture, which is evident in the architectural details in the Randall Duplex. Two years prior to the construction of the home, an article titled “A Talk About ‘Queen Anne’” was published in the *American Architect and Building News* and described fashionable houses in England that “glow with red brick and red tile.” The imagery described in this article is illustrated on the exterior of the Randall Duplex (Figure 57).

The choice in a double cottage have been influenced by the popularity of semi-detached dwellings in England (Figures 58, 59, 60). Since Alexander Randall focused on a beautiful yet affordable home, the double cottage allowed him to duplicate the materials needed to create two identical dwellings. Furthermore, a double-cottage was suitable for a mixed-use or urban environment like the roundabout street where the Randall Duplex is located on State House circle.

---

117 The research for this chapter on the Randall family would not have been possible without the communication with Cathy Randall, a relative of Alexander Randall. Cathy Randall graciously provided answers to my inquiry about her family and reached out to others who were knowledgeable about Alexander Randall. In addition, local Annapolis architect Chip Bohl provided images used in this chapter.


Figure 57. Photo by Chip Bohl from Bohl, Chip. *Randall House: The First Modern House in Annapolis.* In *Annapolis Architecture Guide.*

Figure 58. “Labourers Cottages” *The Building News,* London, 1874.
Figure 59. “Two Country Houses” The Architect, London, 1875.

Figure 60. “Cottages” The Architect, London, 1875.
The Clients
Alexander Randall was born in Annapolis in 1803. Alexander’s father, John Randall, Senior, was the youngest son of Thomas Randall who went to Westmoreland County, Virginia from England in the early 1700’s. John Randall Senior was interested in architecture and he was under the guidance of architect and builder William Buckland from Fredericksburg, Virginia. Buckland came to Annapolis in 1770 and built a number of prominent buildings including the Hammond-Harwood house. Buckland was a significant British architect who designed buildings in colonial Maryland and Virginia throughout the eighteenth century. John Randall Senior, “founder of a distinguished line of sons of Maryland” also moved to Annapolis and married Deborah Knapp of Annapolis and they had eleven children. Alexander Randall was one of their sons.

Alexander Randall attended St. John’s college in Annapolis and attained a Bachelor and Master of the Arts. While practicing law in Annapolis for over fifty years, Alexander Randall held numerous esteemed political positions, which included serving as a member of the United States Congress, the Attorney General of Maryland in 1864 and the President of the Farmer’s National Bank of Annapolis in 1877. In addition to his political positions, Alexander Randall was a devout member of the Anglican or Protestant Episcopal Church church and he was active in St. Anne’s Church of Annapolis. When Alexander was not at work or at the Church, he dedicated his time as a board member of St. John’s College and to his family.

Alexander’s first wife Catherine Wirt was the daughter of Attorney General of the United States, William Wirt. His second wife Elizabeth Philpot Blanchard was the daughter of Reverend John G. Blanchard. Alexander Randall had five children with Catherine and seven children with Elizabeth. Alexander Randall fulfilled many positions in Annapolis and in his family. Alexander was described “as a lawyer, as a citizen and as a Christian--and left a large family of carefully educated and trained children who represent his influence for good.”

Alexander Randall’s son, John Wirt Randall, was the original owner of the Randall double cottage. John was born in Annapolis in 1845 and attended St. John’s College, Burlington College and Yale University. John studied law in his father’s office and was admitted to the Bar in 1868. Like his father, John was involved in politics and served as the Councilor of the City, in the House of Delegates and in the Senate of Maryland. The Anglican faith was very important to the Randall family and in 1874 John became a Vestryman and the treasurer of St. Anne’s Protestant Episcopal Church in Annapolis.

John Randall was interested in history and lectured for the Annapolis community. John was described as “fond of historical studies and has contributed a number of papers and addresses on such subjects.” John was a devout Christian and many of his lectures promoted the Anglican church. His lecture titles include “Divorce, and the Marriage of Divorced Person,” and “Christian Manliness.” “Lovers of the Beautiful and How They May Show Their Faith by Their Works,” presented at the Philokalian Society at St. John’s College, was related to the teachings of John Ruskin. In addition to lectures related to the church, he also presented a lecture on Astronomy.

John Randall married to Hannah Parker Parrott in 1879, and they had four children. John and Hannah Randall lived in the Randall Duplex until 1881 when his father Alexander Randall died. After Alexander Randall died, John Randall moved into the Randall family homestead, the Bordley-Randall House, located behind the Randall Duplex. The Bordley-Randall House has been described as “one of the most beautiful and interesting of the old historic houses in Annapolis, with ample grounds about it, facing upon the State House Circle.”

The Bordley-Randall house was built in circa 1717, with additions and alterations in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

---

133 Joshua Dorsey Warfield, . The Founders of Anne Arundel and Howard Counties, Maryland: A Genealogical and Biographical Review from Wills, Deeds and Church Records. Baltimore, MD: Kohn & Pollock, 11905, p.120.
134 Russell Wright. 21 State Circle. Annapolis, MD: Maryland Historical Trust, 1983.
son of an esteemed English immigrant, Thomas Bordley.\textsuperscript{135} Stephen Bordley studied Law in London and upon his return built the Bordley-Randall House. The house is significant as it was the first five-part plan house in Annapolis. Later the house was acquired by the Randall family and they continued to make additions to the home and add more dwellings to the property. Architecture had been in the family since Patriarch John Randall Senior studied with Buckland in Annapolis.

Alexander Randall acquired the homestead in 1847 and wrote detailed entries in his diary about the maintenance and additions to the house. Alexander made notes of the painters, slaters, carpenters, gardeners and bricklayers, but there is no mention of the architect. Alexander was very involved in the work on the house and stated in one occasion in 1856 during the remodeling of the kitchen that he “will do the rest of the work [himself] with John Hughes (the family gardener).”\textsuperscript{136} In 1859 there was an addition to the house, of which Alexander described the construction in detail. He noted the foundation, the joists, and other structural components on the work.\textsuperscript{137} Clearly Alexander had a deep knowledge of building and construction, and in 1859 he stated “I have begun my addition to the house, which has now progressed to the finishing of the brick work and of laying the rafters and sheathing for the slate and the beginning of the laying of the floor for the lookout.”\textsuperscript{138} Alexander’s construction help included “Mr Clayton and his boys” who were laid the foundation, which Alexander stated he prepared for them the week before.\textsuperscript{139}

Close to the completion of this addition, Alexander went on a trip to Baltimore with his wife Elizabeth to “see the carpets and furniture of her choice” and also stated “we also engaged other articles conditionally for our new addition to the house.”\textsuperscript{140} Throughout the construction process, Alexander seemed to have been involved. Alexander was assisted by of John Hughes (the gardener), Mr. Clayton (possibly the contractor), and a variety of skilled craftsmen and laborers.

The Architects
Although there is no documentation on the architect or builder of the Randall Duplex, excerpts from Alexander Randall’s diary indicate that Alexander Randall, and his son John, could have been responsible for the construction. In February 1879 at the age of 34 John proposed to Hannah Parrott of New York.\textsuperscript{141} Once John decided to bring his new bride to Annapolis, his father, Alexander, began planning the construction of a double cottage for the new couple on the family’s property. In his diary he wrote:

\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
“John and I have been talking about building a double cottage on my lot either next to College Green or on the State House Circle, one for him which he expects to want this summer on his marriage--and the other for rent… we have some plans for consideration entertaining the cost at $5,000 for the two.”¹⁴²

John received the lot on State Circle, prominently located in the center of the town and adjacent to the State House. On April 12, 1879 construction started on the site. Alexander wrote “[that they] cut down the willows and part of the Old Calapper Tree for preparation of lot John... proposes to build on.”¹⁴³ Later in June, Alexander wrote “this day we began to prepare for John’s Building in [the] front Lot on the Circle by throwing this Lot out of our enclosure putting up fencing and cutting down trees.”¹⁴⁴ Certainly Alexander and John were heavily involved in the initial construction of the site.

In August Alexander stated the houses “were ready for lumber of the roof” and next month he wrote “slaters began yesterday--chimnies finished except the library chimney.”¹⁴⁵ Although little is known about the design of the interior of the home, Alexander does refer trip he made with John to Baltimore to buy furniture and purchase fireplace mantels. One of the entries described that Alexander preferred a marble mantel, while John preferred wood. Alexander states “John has all his mantle of wood which is the fashion… I prefer marble in spite of the fashion.”¹⁴⁶ By February 1880 John and Hannah moved into their double cottage and rented the other half of the house. The Sanborn Map of 1885 illustrated the brick double cottage with wood porches (Figure 61).¹⁴⁷

Another explanation for the architect could be Alexander’s son, Thomas Henry Randall, who was born in Annapolis in 1863. T. Henry Randall was an architect and attended Massachusetts Institute of Technology.¹⁴⁸ T. Henry Randall died young (in his forties), but he had an impressive career as an architect in a short amount of time. Randall first studied in H.H. Richardson's office in Brookline, Massachusetts. After he took a course at the Ecoles des Beaux-Arts and traveled in Europe, T. Henry Randall worked for McKim, Mead and White.¹⁴⁹ In 1891 he opened his own firm in New York. He was a member of the Architectural League of New York, the American Institute of Architects and his designs were published in architectural journals.

Throughout the three generations of the family, beginning with John Randall senior’s apprenticeship with William Buckland, Alexander’s involvement with the construction of both houses, and Henry’s architecture background, the family had a strong interest in architecture and design.

**Figure 61. "Annapolis Maryland June 1885." Sanborn Map Company. New York, NY: Sanborn Map Company, 1885.**

**English Influence on the Design**

The Randall Duplex is an example of the popularity of the English vernacular architecture in America after the Centennial Exhibition of 1876 in Philadelphia. British architect Thomas Harris designed two buildings to represent English architecture at the Exhibition. The two buildings designed by Harris were the “British Commissioner’s Building” and the “Staff Quarters.” These buildings showcased English vernacular elements including half-timbering, gables adorned in bargeboards, and decorative brick chimneys (Figures 62 and 63).

In addition to the widespread publication of the English buildings at the Centennial Exhibition, Alexander Randall visited the Exhibition numerous times. Alexander Randall visited the Centennial Exhibition two years prior to the construction of the Randall Duplex. Alexander’s eldest daughters both lived in Philadelphia during the Exhibition and when he went to visit them he attended the Exhibition. The first time Alexander visited the Exhibition was in June 1876, and he later revisited in the fall.¹⁵⁰ As an Anglophile, Alexander would have made sure to see the English architecture at the Exhibition.

The Randall children were also well traveled and one year prior to the construction of the Randall Duplex the children, including John Randall, went on an extensive tour through New York State and Canada.¹⁵¹ After Alexander died in 1881, Elizabeth Randall went on her first

“pleasure trip” to England and France with her son Wyatt (who went to read a paper at the British Science Association at Oxford). On this trip, Elizabeth attended the lectures of T.H. Huxley, illustrating her interest in English culture.

Figure 62. Washington, Jerome Bonaparte. *Footprints of the Ages*. Chicago, IL: Goodspeed's Publishing House, 1876, 1066.

---

Massing

The Randall Duplex facade is composed of two identical gables (one for each unit), which extend from the first story to the third story (Figure 64). The identical twin gables could be derived from the twin gables at Shaw’s Preen Manor or Hopedene (Figures 65 and 66). Although there was a small gap between the gables at Hopedene the composition of the grouped windows on each of the three stories, topped with half-timbering and a bargeboard is similar to the Randall Duplex. Another example of identical double gables was published in *The Architect* in 1874 (Figure 67). Alexander may have had access to English periodicals because he was very proud of his library, and he had a vast collection of English literature and English law books in his library at home.¹⁵³

¹⁵³ Information received from communication Cathy Randall and professor in Annapolis.
Figure 64. G. Gibson Photo Art, February 22, 2017. From Alexander Randall Facebook Page.

Terracotta Ridge Tiles and Tile-Hanging

The materials that clad the Randall Duplex are distinctively English. The peak of each gable is crowned with unglazed terracotta ridge tiles in their natural color to match the terracotta tiles (Figure 68). The addition of terracotta ridge tiles on the roof was a common feature of domestic architecture in England in the period (Figure 69). Instead of wood shingles, an American version of English tile-hanging, which was used at the majority of the Anglo-American houses discussed in this thesis, the Randall Duplex is clad in traditional English manner with fish-scale terracotta tiles (Figure 70). The fish-scale style of shingles were popular in English domestic architecture in the 1870’s and may have inspired the machine-cut novelty shingles in America (Figure 71). The terracotta tiles exist on the upper floors of the house in the Shavian manner.
To match the burnt orange color of the tiles, the first floor is composed of red brick. Additionally, the wood trim throughout the house is painted a dark red (Figure 72). In each gable there is English half-timbering, but in an American form because the wood is painted red to match the exterior wood trim. The half-timbering in the Randall house consists of simple vertical boards in the double gables and on the side elevations of the house. The vertical boards, as opposed to the more intricately set boards, are derived from English trends in the later 1870’s (Figure 73).

Figure 71. House at Bedford Park, London. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016).

Figure 72. Photo by Chip Bohl from Bohl, Chip. Randall House: The First Modern House in Annapolis. In Annapolis Architecture Guide.
Windows

The gable is framed with vertical triplet windows on each story. The window sash and panes alternate between a single pane on one half and multiple square panes on the other half. The half-timbering and multi-pane windows were meant to evoke a nostalgia for the past. The window composition of the two gables in the Randall Duplex was derived from the English Commissioner’s Building at the Centennial Exhibition and other published English sources. Adapted from the Commissioner’s Building, the first floor of the Randall Duplex contains three identical triplet vertical windows (Figures 74 and 75). Unlike the oriel windows in the Commissioner's Building, the windows on the second floor of the Randall Duplex are the same and are repeated with smaller window panes in the upper sash. There are small windows on the third story of the Duplex, which do not exist in the Commissioner's Building, but both gables feature half-timbering, wide bargeboards, finials and ridge tiles. The window composition and massing of the twin gables is also very similar to a design published in Building News in 1878 (Figure 76).

There are highly decorative stepped windows framed with wood trim on display on the side elevations of the Randall Duplex (Figure 77). The concept for the stepped windows was copied from English sources (Figures 78 and 79). The top of the stepped windows ends in English half-timbering, painted bargeboards and a terracotta finial, which resulted in a variety of materials to be used this portion of the exterior wall.
Figure 74. *Maryland Inventory of Historic Properties Annapolis Survey Continuation Sheet*. Inventory No. AA-694. 86 State Circle. National Register of Historic Places Inventory Nomination Form. *Annapolis Historic District*. United States Department of the Interior.

Figure 76. “A Summer Cottage” Building News, London, 1878.


Figure 78. “View in Courtyard of a Riverside Hotel, Building News, London 1878.”
Public Interpretation
Alexander Randall’s involvement in the construction of the double cottage was important because the house was not only a reflection of his family, but also a representation of their taste. Once the double cottage was complete Alexander stated “[the houses] are certainly well spoken of by the men of taste and [by the] architects in town.” In this entry, Alexander had the opportunity to discuss the architect, but instead discussed his pride in its outcome. This diary entry furthers the explanation that the Randall family built the Randall Duplex. Furthermore, Alexander stated that John “has I believe obtained the best and prettiest house in this town and [it is] finished more beautifully and at [less] cost than any in it.”

Conclusion
The design for the Randall house illustrates the architect's (or the family’s) knowledge of the Commissioner’s Building and Queen Anne revival architecture published in English sources. Although the architect is unknown, there is clear indication for the family’s English taste, which is deliberately reflected in the materials chosen to clad the house. The terracotta fish-scale tiles are a direct copy of Shavian domestic architecture and illustrate that the family may have had access to materials imported from England, highlighting their Anglophile inclinations.

The fact that the architect is may have been Alexander Randall himself may be indirectly supported by the fact that this is the only house discussed in this thesis that was not published in the American architectural press. Although the Randall Duplex is a less-known example in American architectural studies, precisely because it was unpublished, it may, in fact, be the most significant direct translation of Old English and Queen Anne Revival work in America.

CHAPTER 6. SUBURBAN ARCHITECTURE: THE COUNTRY HOUSE

Glenmont

Glenmont was built in 1880-1881 by architect Henry Hudson Holly in Llewellyn Park, a residential park in New Jersey (Figure 80). The name “Glenmont” was derived from suggestions made by the architect in his first book, *Country Seats*. Holly states that every detached country house should be named, regardless of its size and that “the name should, of course, be suggestive of some fact connected with the house, its owner, or its location.” In addition to Holly’s suggestion of 128 names of estates in England, which included similar names like “Glen Villa,” “Glenfield,” and “Glen Cottage,” the name Glenmont likely correlated with the site. As the Historic Structure Report for Glenmont stated, the name Glenmont derived from “mont” meaning “mount,” as the house was located on a rise in the land, and the name “Glen,” may have been inspired by the adjacent sites, “Glynn Ellyn” ravine or “Glen Avenue” in the park.

Llewellyn Park was one of the first planned suburban communities in America. The park was desirable for its picturesque landscape and private grounds. Llewellyn Park was developed by Llewellyn S. Haskell, beginning in 1857 as 350 acres of land divided into large lots, separated by winding roads and incorporated common parkland. The property owners had access to the 50-acre park within the development, but they had to follow a series of rules and regulations. The landowners paid an annual fee for the upkeep of the common spaces including the Picturesque landscape and winding roads. The park was managed by a committee that was elected by the landowners and this committee enforced strict rules and regulations that would ensure an agreeable residential community.

The attributes of Llewellyn Park were very similar to an English community described by the architect Henry Hudson Holly. In *Modern Dwellings*, published in 1879 one year prior to the Pedder’s purchase of the lot, Holly wrote:

“There is a method adopted in England, however, by which fine scenery and agreeable company may not be incompatible. It is by a number of families clubbing together, and procuring an attractive spot, filled with shady nooks and pleasant streams, which, by

mutual agreements and some slight restrictions, can be laid out in a picturesque manner for building.\footnote{Holly's description of the ideal location for a detached country house in Modern Dwellings is almost an exact description of Llewellyn Park. Holly promoted the romantic landscape ideas that are epitomize Llewellyn Park and these ideas continued to resonate throughout the nineteenth century.}

Holly’s description of the ideal location for a detached country house in Modern Dwellings is almost an exact description of Llewellyn Park. Holly promoted the romantic landscape ideas that are epitomize Llewellyn Park and these ideas continued to resonate throughout the nineteenth century.

The Clients

Henry Charles Pedder was born in 1840 in the West Indies on Saint Kitts Island.\footnote{In 1866 Pedder married Louisa Jane Mallalieu Lake in Barbados. Henry’s father and mother were both born in England. After he moved to New York, Pedder and his wife Louisa lived in Brooklyn. The Pedder’s moved to Llewellyn Park, New Jersey when there house was complete. Although Henry and Louisa did not have any children, several of Louisa’s family members and at least four servants resided at their home in Llewellyn Park. Pedder’s grand home in Llewellyn Park is a reflection of his reputation that “he lived in the best of style and spent money without stint.”}

Figure 80. “Residence of Mr. Henry C. Pedder” American Architect and Building News, August 27, 1881.


\footnote{“Mr. Pedder’s Luxurious Habits.” The New York Times (New York ), July 19, 1884, 8.}
Pedder commuted to work in New York City from his home in New Jersey. In New York City, Pedder worked as a clerk at the firm Arnold, Constable & Company. Pedder was also a published author. Pedder’s writings include an essay Religion and Progress, which was published in 1876 in New York. In Religion and Progress Pedder “[aimed] to demonstrate the indestructibility of the religious sentiment, and also to urge the cultivation of that higher philosophy, which sees in the hopes and aspirations of the human spirit, no less than in the attainments of reason, the greatness of man’s nature and destiny.” Pedder often wrote about religion and he was also involved in Grace Episcopal Church, serving as a vestryman in the church.

Pedder had a well-received reputation in society and an article stated “with his lavish expenditure of money, his quiet way, and marked literary tastes, he at once entered the best society and was generally liked.” Pedder worked at the firm Arnold Constable & Company, but was terminated after he was accused of embezzlement. With this fraudulent income, Pedder funded his “palatial country residence” in Llewellyn Park. In 1884, just one year after the completion of his home in Llewellyn Park, Pedder was accused of stealing money from Arnold Constable and company. The scandal ruined Pedder’s reputation and several articles in the New York Times discussed the lavish home and lifestyle he built with his forged income.

In 1884 Pedder returned from a Europe, and he was forced to turn over Glenmont as part of his restitution to Arnold, Constable & Co. After Henry’s conviction, the Pedders fled to England as his reputation was ruined in America. England was a logical choice for the family as Pedder had many ties to the country. His family and former business partner lived in England at the time of his convocation. In addition, Pedder often traveled between England and the United States. In 1891 the Pedders are listed in London and part of St. George’s Parish. The Pedders stayed in London until Henry’s death in 1910.

The Architect
Henry Hudson Holly was born in Stamford, Connecticut, on October 8, 1834. Holly was born into a fifth generation Stamford, Connecticut family, and his ancestors were some of the

166 “Pedder’s Religion and Progress." The Brooklyn Daily Eagle (Brooklyn), November 26, 1875, 1.
173 Charles Moses Holly. Record of the Holly Family in America. Stamford, CT, 1861. Holly states he is from NYC but Charles Moses Holly research shows he is from Stamford.
founders of the city.\textsuperscript{174} The Holly family is from England and the first generation to move to America was John Holly, born in England in 1618 and died in Stamford, Connecticut in 1681.\textsuperscript{175} Henry Hudson’s father, William Holly, moved their family to New York City and they lived on Fifth Avenue. William Holly was involved in the church and served as an Alderman in the 1840’s.\textsuperscript{176}

In 1854 Holly started his architectural career as an apprentice for English architect Gervase Wheeler in New York City.\textsuperscript{177} Wheeler recently moved to America from England and was known for the publication of his first book \textit{Rural Homes: or, Sketches of houses suited to American Country Life} in 1851. In 1849 Wheeler was published in A.J. Downing’s journal, \textit{The Horticulturist and Journal of Rural Art and Rural Taste}. Wheeler contributed an essay titled “Design and Description of an English Cottage.” The essay discussed the prevalence of wood architecture in New England, and featured a Gothic Revival design with a board and batten exterior.\textsuperscript{178} After working with Wheeler for two years, Holly traveled to England to complete his architectural studies.\textsuperscript{179} Wheeler likely influenced Holly to travel to England to study architecture. When Holly returned from England he opened his own practice in New York City.\textsuperscript{180}

In addition to practicing as an architect, Holly was an author. He published his first treatise on domestic design, \textit{Country Seats} in 1863.\textsuperscript{181} \textit{Country Seats} presented Holly’s allegiance to the trained architecture profession in America and to the vernacular architecture of his homeland, England. The book opened with a history of architecture, which was heavily reliant on the history of English architecture. The text of the book was to convince readers to create an English country house in America. The designs in \textit{Country Seats}, foreshadowed the development of the Americanization of the English country house, as they contained examples of large estates with Old English half-timbering set in a picturesque landscape. After the Civil War, Holly published

\begin{footnotes}
\item[175] Charles Moses Holly. \textit{Record of the Holly Family in America}. Stamford, CT, 1861.
\item[177] “A Group of American Architects.” \textit{American Architect and Building News} XV, no. 424, February 16, 1884, p. 76.
\end{footnotes}
Church Architecture in 1871. Holly’s publication of Church Architecture introduced the ecclesiastical style of architecture to church leaders.\textsuperscript{182}

Holly’s most successful publication, which also had the largest influence on the design of Glenmont, initially developed through a series of articles published in the 1876 in Harper’s New Monthly Magazine. The first article in the series titled “Modern Dwellings, Their Construction, Decoration and Furniture” introduced the English Queen Anne Revival to America. The first article was positively received by American critics. On May 13, 1876 American Architect and Building News a critic described it “as the best article of the kind, that we have seen lately” and the illustrations displayed “the freedom and sureness of the practiced professional hand.”\textsuperscript{183}

The statement about the professional hand is important because it represented Holly’s role in the establishment of the architecture profession in America. Holly was inducted into the American Institute of Architects in 1857 (at a young age). Holly was a respected member of the profession and is discussed throughout the first two decades of American Architect and Building News. Prior to his commission for Glenmont, Holly’s connection to contemporary English architecture was verified in American Architect and Building News. The esteemed architectural journal stated, “through the management of Mr. H.H. Holly, practising member, an interesting series of photographs illustrating recent work in England has been added” to the American Institute of Architects New York chapter’s collection.\textsuperscript{184}

Unfortunately Holly’s reputation for originality within the profession faded when American Architect and Building News received a letter which stated that Holly had copied his ideas from Charles Eastlake. The complaint also revealed that many of Holly’s illustrations were copied from Cox and Sons catalogues.\textsuperscript{185} Holly acknowledged his mistake, which he claimed was unintentional and later turned these articles published in Harper’s New Monthly Magazine into another successful book, Modern Dwellings in Town and Country: Adapted to American Wants and Climate: With a Treatise on Furniture and Decoration in 1878.\textsuperscript{186}

Again in his third book, Holly relied on English architectural trends and claimed English Queen Anne Revival was the most appropriate style of architecture for domestic dwellings. The publication of Modern Dwellings was successful and allowed Holly to gain commissions across


\textsuperscript{183} American Architect and Building News, Volume I, May 13, 1876, 154


America. An additional way Holly gained commissions was through his published work in the Anglican newspaper *The Churchman*.\(^{187}\) Holly’s reliance on English taste is most likely what awarded him the commission of a large country estate for the anglophile Henry C. Pedder in 1880. Consequently, Pedder’s English ties and involvement in the literary world likely influenced his decision to choose Henry Hudson Holly as his architect.

**English Influence on the Design**

In the design of Glenmont there were numerous elements directly copied from published English Queen Anne Revival. Although Holly would say the designs were based on his illustrations in *Modern Dwellings*, those illustrations were derived from other English architects. Many of Holly’s philosophies and illustrations were based on the ideas established by English writers such as Charles Eastlake. Holly’s admiration for leading English domestic architects, such as Stevenson and Shaw, is illustrated in the use of copied Queen Anne elements at Glenmont.

In November 1877 *Building News* published a lengthy article that described the Queen Anne architectural mode at Bedford Park (outside of London, England). The article also claimed the style’s suitability for domestic architecture. The next year Holly published a book with an opening chapter, which echoed the idea that Queen Anne was the best style for domestic architecture. Following the article in 1877, *Building News* published a series of working drawings by Richard Norman Shaw for the designs of the dwellings at Bedford Park (Figures 81, 82, 83, 84). Shaw’s drawings illustrated the adaption of Queen Anne Revival architectural elements in domestic architecture.

The dwellings at Bedford Park are uniquely picturesque their influence is evident in Holly’s free-classic elements used at Glenmont. Holly copied many of his Queen Anne elements from the Shaw illustrations of Bedford Park published in *Building News* (three years prior to the construction of Glenmont). These drawings of Bedford Park and other published drawings by English architects of the period had an immense impact on the design of Glenmont. These English sources were also adapted in the illustrations in Holly’s *Modern Dwellings*, discussed in this chapter.


Roof
The composition of Glenmont is English in its verticality (Figure 85). The steep, straight roofline is characteristic of the English Queen Anne. Like the dwellings at Bedford Park, the steep and straight roofline is topped with terracotta ridge tiles and punctuated by gables and dormer windows (Figures 82, 83).

Windows
The oriel window above the porte-cochere at Glenmont is similar to the Shavian inglenooks that characterize Bedford Park (Figure 85). Although the dwellings at Bedford Park are more modest than Glenmont. At Glenmont, the house consists of numerous gables and windows that extrude from the main volume on the primary facade. The composition of windows of the center gable at Glenmont are derived from English Queen Anne examples (Figure 86). The free-classic detail of the half arch over the center gable window and oriel window existed in English examples, including a house published in Building News in 1878 (Figure 87). Furthermore, the splayed lintels and patterned brickwork is copied from the English Queen Anne houses at Bedford Park.
Figure 85. Glenmont. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)

Figure 86. “Residence of Mr. Henry C. Pedder” American Architect and Building News, August 27, 1881.
Exterior Cladding

The exterior of the house is three stories, and follows the Richard Norman Shaw composition of a stone base topped with brick and shingles, set against a large landscape. The basement floor is made of grey stone blocks and is partially visible above ground. The first floor is red brick in running bond, inspired by Queen Anne Revival fashions in England.

The second story at Glenmont is covered in wood cladding and suggests a simpler form of English half-timbering, present in English sources of the period (Figure 88). The second floor at Glenmont is an Americanization of half-timbering as the nogging is composed of clapboard instead of stucco (or brick). The third floor is a combination of half-timbering and wood shingles. The steep roof is made of grey slate and is intersected by gables, dormer windows, and chimneys of varying sizes. The gable end returns are derived from English sources of the period (Figures 89, 90, 91). In both English and American sources, gable end returns are a practical architectural detail to finish the gable roof and provide a way to emphasize the gable. In English sources, such as the dwellings at Bedford Park, the gable ends are typically painted white to contrast the brown tile-hanging (Figure 90).
Figure 88. “House Recently Erected at Seven Oaks” *Building News*, London, 1878.

Figure 89. Glenmont. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016).
Figure 90. House at Bedford Park, London. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016).

Figure 91. “View of Stables” The Architect, London, 1876.
Chimneys
Originally there were six chimneys on the house and their designs were based on Holly’s descriptions in *Modern Dwellings*. The brick chimneys are highly decorative and their brickwork was designed to mimic pilasters. At the top of each chimney are terracotta chimney pots. On the rear of the house one original chimney is adorned with a terracotta frieze and was derived from English sources (Figures 92, 93, 94). This chimney as well as the others at Glenmont are very English in the treatment of the courses of the brickwork.

Next to this chimney, another portion of the rear elevation of the house was inspired by an illustration published in *The Architect* in 1872. This illustration was accompanied by an essay titled “Old English Domestic Architecture” (Figures 95, 96). The illustration is significant because it illustrates the early inclination of the English Queen Anne, which used free classical shapes. This illustration also contributed to the confusion in the American interpretations of the Queen Anne as it is described as “Old English,” while in America this would style would be called Queen Anne. American interpretations of Old English integrated half-timbering into the houses, which explains why the term “Queen Anne” in America is a fusion of two English revival styles: Old English and Queen Anne Revival.

Figure 92. Glenmont. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016).

Figure 94. House at Bedford Park, London. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016).
Figure 95. Glenmont. Photo by Elizabeth Canon (2016)

Figure 96. “Old English Domestic Architecture” The Architect, London, 1872.
In *Modern Dwellings*, Holly’s chapter on the Queen Anne and discussed English architects such as Shaw and others. Holly was likely aware of J.J. Stevenson’s use of the pediment shape at the Red House (Figure 97). The pediment shape is copied from several elements in Stevenson’s work. Holly describes Stevenson as “one of the most celebrated architects in England” when describing the architecture of both Stevenson and Shaw in *Modern Dwellings*.188


**Color**

The exterior paint of the brick and clapboard on the house changed numerous times.189 Initially the exterior clapboard was coated, or finished, with a varnish. In the late 1880s-1890’s the exterior was recorded as beige, brown, and olive tones (Figure 98). In the early 1900’s the exterior was painted grey and white and depicted the concept of red brick set against a green landscape. This depiction of Glenmont looks most similar to English Queen Anne Revival architecture due to the red brick, white trim, a balustrade and free classical elements set against an idealized or picturesque garden. In 1915 the house was painted salmon and is still a shade of the same color today.

Interior
The entrance is designated by a porte-cochere and opens into a grand entrance hall. The entrance hall is derived from the English principles of an entry hall with a staircase and a fireplace. To the right of the entrance hall was Henry Pedder’s luxurious library. Holly discussed the importance of the library and described it as a place to gather the family. The first bookshelf in the library is composed of books on English history and the Church of England, and those books still exist today in the house. Henry Pedder’s choice to have the English literature displayed on the first shelf in the library meant he wanted his visitor to see his allegiance to England when they arrived. The first floor also consists of a drawing room, conservatory, den, dining room, and service rooms.

Public Interpretation
The first published sketch and description of Glenmont was in the American Architect and Building News in 1881. The excerpt discussed the variety of materials used in the construction of the house including: bluestone, tile, moulded brick, buff brick, terracotta and numerous types of wood. The description stated where each of the material was imported from around the country. Furthermore the article discussed the types of wood used on the interior in detail. The textures created by different materials is characteristic of Queen Anne architecture. Glenmont was well-received by the public and an article in the The New York Times stated, “the house is

considered one of the finest in the park, and its interior finish is surpassed by none in the State.”

Conclusion
The Queen Anne design for Glenmont is based entirely on Holly’s writings and drawings in Modern Dwellings, which were derived from English sources. Holly adapted English vernacular architecture and traditional English customs to an American landscape, exemplified in Glenmont. The popularity of Holly’s book combined with his description of an ideal community and English taste explain how the Pedder’s chose Holly as their architect. Both Holly and the Pedder’s are examples of Anglophiles who used architecture to manifest their English taste.

CHAPTER 7. THE END OF THE HIGH STYLE

After the publicity of the British buildings at the Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia, English Revival styles became popular in American domestic architecture. After American architects mastered these revival styles, they were eventually implemented, or copied, by builders. The Queen Anne style became even more Americanized through interpretations and dissemination of the style in pattern books. The high-style of the Old English and Queen Anne Revival became less exciting to trained architects as the style became copied in publications for the broad public. Eventually the English Revival style and Queen Anne merged into an American interpretation of these styles, called the “Queen Anne.”

The J. Griffiths Masten House

The J. Griffiths Masten House was the last published illustration of high-style of Anglo-American architecture in *The American Architect and Building News* in 1883 (Figure 99). The 1883 sketch illustrated many architectural elements of Anglo-American design, which included a brick first story topped by shingles on the upper story and ridge tiles on the roof.

The Architect and The Client

The architect of the house, Alexander Forbes Oakey, traveled to England in May 1871, and studied architecture under Richard Norman Shaw. In 1874, Oakey’s design for a house in Dedham, Massachusetts, was the first house to be published in an American periodical with architectural elements that are copied directly from Richard Norman Shaw. The perspective sketch titled “A Country House at Dedham” illustrated Oakey’s direct connection to Shavian country house and English picturesque architecture (Figure 100). Oakey’s knowledge of the English picturesque can be attributed to his experience when he worked in the office of Richard Morris Hunt. Oakey’s 1874 design in Dedham is significant because it predated Richardson’s design for the Watts Sherman house, which was published in the architectural journal in 1875.

Like Oakey, the client Joseph Griffiths Masten was an Anglophile and his father was a founding member of St. John’s Episcopal Church in Buffalo, New York. Masten was born circa 1848 and was an architecture student in Buffalo in 1880, which was likely where he met Oakey, who lived

---


193 Although Oakey’s obituary in *The Architect and Engineer of California* in 1916 stated he worked in the offices of Richard Norman Shaw, Andrew Saint, an expert on Shaw, is not aware if Oakey ever studied with Shaw. Saint states there have been various claims that American architects were in Shaw’s office for a time, but he has not found any justification of Oakey’s claims.


in Buffalo at the time.\textsuperscript{196} Oakey was an Anglophile who was involved with the establishment of architecture as a profession in America. He wrote articles that appeared in \textit{American Architect and Building News} that were presented at the American Institute of Architects conventions. In “Architect and Client” published in the first issue of the \textit{American Architect and Building News}, Oakey described the complex relationship between the architect’s capabilities and the client’s tastes.

Oakey glorified the English and scolded American practice “where [the architect’s] clients are too parsimonious to adopt the English custom of a responsible clerk of the works.”\textsuperscript{197} Oakey continued to rely on English customs when discussing ways for a client to avoid disappointment in the outcome of their house; he pleaded, “as most Englishmen do, [the client should] select an architect [on] whose taste, ability, and character you can rely.”\textsuperscript{198} Oakey was a trained architect who once designed for high-style clients, but later published home guidebooks for the masses such as \textit{Building a Home} (1881). Oakey’s designs and writings represent how high-style English revival architecture disseminated into an architectural expression copied by builders for the broad public.

\textbf{English Influence}

The large gable above the entrance was reminiscent of Shavian examples and was supported by wooden jetties in the English manner. The third floor inside the gable was decorated in English half-timbering and was topped with a finial. The top of the chimney awkwardly intersected the peak of the gable and the bottom of the chimney bulges out, similar to English antecedents (Figure 101). In plan, the published sketch also reflected an English influence with the ground floor largely dedicated to an entrance hall. The entrance hall created a large space that connected the front door to the stairway. The Masten house is still stands in Newport, Rhode Island; however, the house has been significantly altered and is nearly unrecognizable from its published drawing. Originally there was a strong English influence on the house. In 1969 the Rhode Island State Survey, the data sheet describes the house as “altered beyond recognition” (Figure 102).\textsuperscript{199}

\textbf{Conclusion}

In conclusion, high-style Anglo-American architecture dissolved after 1883. No other buildings with all of the Anglo-American characteristics identified were published in \textit{American Architect and Building News} after 1883. There may be a few later examples that were not published at all, or were not published in the periodicals reviewed.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{196} United States Federal Census 1880.
\item \textsuperscript{199} David Chase (Surveyor). \textit{Historic Building Data Sheet}, Rhode Island Statewide Survey Phase 1 (1969).
\end{itemize}
The high-style digressed into three styles: the American Queen Anne, the Shingle Style, and later other English Revival styles. The American Queen Anne deviated from its English antecedents as it became a vernacular style popularized in pattern books and published for the masses. The broad term “Queen Anne” incorrectly categorizes the early high-style houses as they are not vernacular examples of American architecture. Instead these high-style examples of Anglo-American architecture, discussed as case studies in the thesis, tried to imitate the fashions in England in American materials, substituting English craftsmanship with American methods of construction.

Figure 99. “House in Everett Pl.” American Architect and Building News, April 21, 1883, p. 315.

Figure 101. “Orrest Bank” Building News, London, 1874.

Figure 102. Photo No. FF-6. Historic Building Data Sheet, Rhode Island Statewide Survey Phase 1 (1969). Photo possibly taken by David Chase the surveyor for the data sheet.
CHAPTER 8. CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS

These five case study houses explored in depth in the thesis constitute a trend clustered along the Atlantic coast. With the progression of architecture as a trained profession, and the developments in technology to travel abroad or have access to literature published abroad, some American architects and their clients developed a taste for the English architecture, literature, and culture. In the last quarter of the nineteenth century there are direct translations of the published English country houses present in American domestic architecture.

Although I have identified a type, I think there are more Anglo-American houses in America. For further investigation I would like to explore the houses around the Boston and Philadelphia suburbs as those cities have historically had strong ties to England. Part of the complication in this process is that the original houses do not survive or have been severely altered; therefore, it’s difficult to find Anglo-American houses if they were not initially published in an architectural journal or described elsewhere. Furthermore houses in statewide surveys could be mislabeled under broad categories such as “Queen Anne” or “Tudor Revival.” There could be more of these houses intact that have been misidentified due to the established architectural categories that do not include Anglo-American architecture.

In conclusion, there needs to be more research. The idea that there is an Anglo-American architecture has so far proven true. Awareness of the Anglo-American architecture type is the first step toward discovery of further examples that combine the architectural qualities enumerated here and Anglophile identity of home builders and their architects that seems to underpin their design choices.
CHAPTER 9. BIBLIOGRAPHY

CHAPTER 1. BIBLIOGRAPHY


**CHAPTER 2. BIBLIOGRAPHY**


Field, Marriott. *Rural architecture, or, Designs for villas, cottages, etc. : in the Italian, Gothic, Elizabethan, Old English, and Swiss styles, with descriptions and an essay on rural architecture and landscape gardening, including a critique on Ruskin's new theoretical principles of design*. New York, NY: Miller & Co, 1857.


**CHAPTER 4. BIBLIOGRAPHY (WATTS SHERMAN HOUSE)**

“Building News: A weekly illustrated record of the progress of architecture, sculpture, painting, engineering, metropolitan improvements, sanitary reform” (London: Published by the proprietors of the “Building News” 1860-1875).


*Newport Mercury*, J. Franklin, January 9, 1875.

*Newport Mercury*, J. Franklin, October 16, 1875.

*Newport Journal*, April 29, 1876.


**CHAPTER 4. BIBLIOGRAPHY (CHARLES H. BALDWIN HOUSE)**


"Courtesies to Our Visitors." *Newport Daily News* (Newport), September 4, 1878.


"Former Mrs. E.P. Deacon is Dead." *Boston Herald*, 1918.


"Newport- Extensive Improvements Going on in the fashionable Seaside Resort." Newspaper not listed. Clipping of Newspaper article found in the Charles Handy Russell Scrapbook Volume III, p. 139, article published March 26, 1878.

*Newport Mercury* (Newport), May 29, 1886.

*Newport Journal*, December 1877.


CHAPTER 5. BIBLIOGRAPHY


"Letter from Annapolis." The Sun, 23 November 1881.


Maryland Inventory of Historic Properties Annapolis Survey Continuation Sheet. Inventory No. AA-694. 86 State Circle.


**CHAPTER 6. BIBLIOGRAPHY**


**CHAPTER 7. BIBLIOGRAPHY**


United States Federal Census 1880.